DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 459 493 CS 510 710

TITLE	Proceedings of the Annual Meeting of the Association for Education in Journalism and Mass Communication (84th, Washington, DC, August 5-8, 2001). Commission on the Status of Women.
INSTITUTION	Association for Education in Journalism and Mass Communication.
PUB DATE	2001-08-00
NOTE	234p.; For other sections of the 2001 proceedings, see CS 510 704-724.
PUB TYPE	Collected Works - Proceedings (021)
EDRS PRICE	MF01/PC10 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS	*Athletics; Audience Analysis; *Battered Women; Content Analysis; *Family Violence; *Females; Feminism; Higher Education; *Journalism Education; Mass Media Use; Newspapers; Olympic Games; Pilot Projects; Politics; Rape; Sex Differences; Student Attitudes; Television Research; Victims of Crime
IDENTIFIERS	Higher Education Act Title IX; *Media Coverage; New York Times; Television News

ABSTRACT

The Commission on the Status of Women section of the proceedings contains the following 8 selected papers: "Perverse Public Panoptican: Content Analysis of Male and Female Patient Images in Reproductive Health News Reports" (Marie Dick); "The Olympic Ideal: A Content Analysis of the Coverage of Olympic Women's Sports in San Francisco Bay Area Newspapers" (Greg Mellen and Patricia Coleman); "Naming Rape Victims and Survivors: A U.S. Newsroom Policy Study, 2000" (Kim E. Karloff); "Portrayals of Wife Abuse in the 'New York Times,' 1915 & 1925" (Ginger L. Park); "A Descriptive Analysis of NBC's Coverage of the 2000 Summer Olympics" (C. A. Tuggle, Suzanne Huffman, and Dana Scott Rosengard); "Title IX Babies, Sports Media and Attitudes toward Women in Sports and Society" (Paula Whatley Matabane and Bishetta D. Merritt); "Home Court Disadvantage?: Examining the Coverage of Female Athletes on Leading Sports Websites--A Pilot Study" (Tara M. Kachgal); and "Resuscitating Feminist Audience Studies: Revisiting the Politics of Representation and Resistance" (Radhika E. Parameswaran). (RS)

Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made
from the original document.

ED 459 493

Proceedings of the Annual Meeting of the Association for Education in Journalism and Mass Communication (84th, Washington, DC, August 5-8, 2001) Commission on the Status of Women

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
Office of Educational Research and Improvement
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

- This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it.
- Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality.

- Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official OERI position or policy.

PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE AND DISSEMINATE THIS MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

J. McGill

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

1

CS 510 710

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

Status of Women

Perverse Public Panoptican: Content Analysis of Male and Female Patient Images in Reproductive Health News Reports.

Submitted by Marie Dick

413 N. 7th St.
Marshall, MN. 56258
(507) 532-2627

maried@southwest.msus.edu

Introduction

In the last few years reality television has exploded onto prime time allowing viewers a showing of others' lives in ways not previously witnessed, giving Shakespeare's line *all the world's a stage* a new level of truth. Part of this stage is the medical theatre. In The Birth of the Clinic (1975), Foucault documents how the body is increasingly scrutinized under the medical science gaze. Today, from documentaries covering birth, to death in emergency rooms, events once confined to medical facilities are open to a public gaze. The importance of the body, its positioning, and portrayal in society have increased in philosophical theorizing and in modern social movements. Moreover, the medical patient's body, as addressed in Foucault's writing (Foucault, 1975), is increasingly considered in terms of its social significance. Arguably, the social impact may increase as scrutiny moves from the medical theatre to a public forum. The power of mass mediated images to control, persuade, and define is well-documented. According to Gamman and Marshment (1989), "it is here, from popular culture – soaps, sitcoms, the tabloid press, women's magazines, mass-produced fiction, pop music, etc., - that most people in our society get their entertainment and their information. It is here that women (and men) are offered the culture's dominant definitions of themselves" (p. 2). Likewise, John Berger (1983) notes, "Every image embodies a way of seeing" (pp. 9-10), and the way the body as patient is seen influences how patients are treated by others, and how the patient internalizes their experience as a patient (Lupton, 1994; Clanan & Williams, 1992). Therefore, the portrayal of the patient's body in the mass media holds social import. The social impact of the body as patient is not limited to a homogeneous consideration, however. In the introduction to The Body, editor Donn Welton acknowledges that, "conspicuously missing from the analysis of the body thus far, are the questions of language and gender" (Welton, 1999, p. 6). In discussion and debate on body politics, sex and sexuality are key variables. Although degree of natural difference between the sexes is debated, male and female reproductive systems and their sexual functioning are physiologically different. Definitions, understanding, and social valuation of these systemic differences, however, have functioned as mechanisms of control, domination, social position, political maneuverings, violation, pleasure, disparities in medical treatment, and sexual predeterminism to name a few. Critics have argued the female body has not only suffered under scientific definition and scrutiny, but the female body has historically held a greater degree and different kind of visibility than the male body. However, social scientific research describing images of the male and female body as patient is not as well-documented. Therefore, the purpose of this study is to describe representations of men and women as patients in reproductive health news reports. More specifically, the purpose of this study is to determine if and, subsequently,

how health segment representations of men and women may differ in terms of patient visibility, body position, and bodily invasion.

Literature Review

Body Visibility:

Like beauty, power, arguably, is in the eyes of the beholder. In media studies, excessive body visibility has been the plight of women, and the power to gaze on women the right of men (Berger, 1983). According to Gamman and Marshment (1989), "in most popular representations it seems that men look and women are looked at. In film, on television, and in popular narratives men are shown to be in control of the gaze, women are controlled by it" (pg. 1). Research addressing the male gaze and female objectification, as identified in art, literature, and entertainment, is not new (Suleiman, 1986). What is a lesser known parallel is the interest science has had gazing on and into the female body. Consideration of the historic medical dissection of male and female bodies, and the social impact thereof, suggests the importance of related theorizing attendant to the transference of the medical gaze to the public gaze. Like the erotic male gaze, the medical glance has had a historic bent on digging deep within the female and uncovering her mysteries. Although the health care industry has a long history of male dominance, ironically the specialty for women, gynecology, "shows a record of discrimination against women practitioners," and obstetrics, which has traditionally been a female domain before the rise of medical professionalization, "has been particularly virulent in barring females" (Dreifus, 1978, p. xix). Daly (1990) notes that J. Marion Sims in founding the Woman's Hospital in New York, "provided him with a theatre, in which he performed his [gynecologic] operations...before an audience of men" (p. 225). Citing Showalter (1990), Lupton asserts the use of penetrating surgery into women's bodies allowed the male medical profession to "know" the female completely by opening her up and exposing her mysteries (Lupton, 1994). By contrast, Lupton asserts, "men's bodies seemed not to hold such mystery. . . the dissection and examination of the innards of the woman was a substitute for self-knowledge, symbolizing the gaining of control over a threatening femininity" (Lupton, 1994, pp. 134-135).

The traditional medical audience has moved into a more mass mediated theatre. In The Clinical Eye: Medical Discourses in the 'Woman's Film' of the 1940s, Doane discusses Hollywood's interest in cinematic medical examinations of women. Doane describes a film genre interested in female problems, and which situates the woman as a medical discourse object intent on providing viewers the right of examination. According to Doane the doctor's

look in the cinema penetrates the body similar to what Foucault describes as the medical glance. The audience, then, is the spectator and "the spectator's eye becomes that of a doctor and the spectator is given, by proxy, a medical or therapeutic role... the spectator knows more than the female character, is always an accomplice of the diagnosis" (p. 167). By investigating the degree of body exposure and examination in televised reproductive health reports, this study intends to describe if there are similarities between the medical and social tradition of excessive female body exposure compared to the male body in the mass media, and the historic interest in examining the female body and televised reproductive health reports.

Degree of Visibility and Lack of Privacy and Body Boundaries:

Moving from the created female patient in cinema, recent concern exists over the degree of general personal visibility in reality television. Anderson (1995) suggests, "The social acceptance of surveillance practices and the overuse of undercover strategies threaten and undermine the right of privacy to which Americans are constitutionally entitled" (pg. 199). Reviewing media studies literature, it is not difficult to find discussions surrounding differences in interest, visibility, and censorship surrounding male and female bodies. The female body is of seeming greater interest and less worthy of privacy and personal dignity than the male body. In art, for example, invasion of privacy seems to haunt the female more than the male form. Drawing on the dignity of privacy in suffering, and appropriation of the sick female, Dijkstra (1986) highlights Hermann Moest's "The Fate of Beauty" and Paul-Albert Besnard's "The Dead Woman" and "The Dying Woman" as representative of an artistic genre in which female suffering is appropriated for aesthetic pleasure. "Under the guise of documentary concern, Besnard," argues Dijkstra, robs the woman depicted in his series "of even the dignity of privacy on her death bed" (pg. 54). Parcel to privacy is the western tradition of concealing genitalia aptly colloquialized as "private parts." Certainly, discussions of visibility of male and female parts for their sexual and/or aesthetic pleasure in entertainment is highly-developed. However at issue here is the overall sense of individuals' right to privacy in real and intimate situations. According to Foucault, in the eighteenth century, medical science began to demand that patients reveal the secrets of their bodies through physical examination and by giving their medical histories (Lupton, 1994). Under this system, the patient is "expected to give up his or her jurisdiction of the body over to the doctor (p. 94), and diverse sources evidence that patients feel detached and distanced from their bodies by "being forced to expose one's naked body and genital organs to the eyes of others on demand," furthermore, "in many accounts the feelings of helplessness, of losing

control, of victimization are evident" (p. 24). In the early days of allopathic medicine, women were reluctant to submit to gynecological scrutiny or obstetrical (as opposed to midwife-assisted) deliveries at the hands of may physicians (Ehrenreich & English, 1978; Corea, 1985). However, the public relations arm of medicine (Ehrenreich & English, 1978), the use of slave women as research subjects allowing for rabid publishing of gynecologic surgery and research (Ehrenreich & English, 1978; Dreifus, 1977; and Daly, 1990), husbands requiring their wives or daughters to routinely see gynecologists for a number of ailments (Ehrenreich & English, 1978), through the promotion of the socially-desirable female invalidism in the early 1900s (Apple, 1990; Ehrenreich & English, 1978; Cypher, 1994; and Marieskind, 1977), and routine gynecologic examinations for hospital admittance (Corea, 1985), and as an acculturating requirement for contraceptive prescriptions and devices, the reluctance gave way to routinization (Daly, 1990). Today, the private, and sometimes intimate, medical examinations historically sequestered in the medical facility are opened to the public. The question, then, is if there are gender differences in degree of exposure, and inclusion of patient images undergoing private, intimate, and, at times, emotionally difficult medical examinations. The overarching issue is right to privacy, individuals' right to personal dignity, and what are considered acceptable forays into the private lives of others as portrayed on television. One could argue that video footage in televised journalism should be objective, assist in informing the public, and afford equality in terms of degree and style of representation. Both men and women submit to intimate, and arguably humiliating, medical examinations particularly involving reproductive health. Although social scientific studies addressing the degree of comfort in certain medical examinations, such as the pelvic examination, exist, it is generally acceptable that prostate examinations and pap smears do not rank high on the patient comfort scale. Generally speaking, patients submit to the examinations in the interest of monitoring or improving health. Why, how and to what effects the body and private lives are increasingly portrayed on television are larger issues than the bounds of this study can afford. What is addressed in this study is whether these private, and often embarrassing medical examinations, are equally and similarly portrayed for men and women in reproductive health news reports in the interest of assessing equal to varying levels of privacy invasion and acceptable body boundary differences between men and women.

Finally, an extreme act of boundary violation is the penetration of the body by another outside of sexual consent. Daly (1990) argues that the most basic boundary violation is rape. This is not to suggest, although it has been theorized by some in considerations of gynecologic practices, that medical examination is rape. At issue is the level at which body invasion or medical probing is depicted in health reports video footage, and if there are gender

differences in the degree and ways body invasion is depicted. Lupton (1994) reports that medical writing on the dissection of women's bodies was glorified with adventurer metaphors, and the horrors justified in the name of furthering anatomical knowledge. Citing Showalter (1990), Lupton asserts the use of penetrating surgery into women's bodies allowed the male medical profession to 'know' the female completely by opening her up and exposing her mysteries (Lupton, 1994). "By contrast, the inside of men's bodies seemed not to hold such mystery...the dissection and examination of the innards of the woman was a substitute for self-knowledge, symbolizing the gaining of control over a threatening femininity" (Lupton, 1994, pp. 134-135). From unnecessary hysterectomies to high numbers of cesarean section delivers in the United States (Payer, 1988) in the last forty years, western medicine has appeared quite intent on opening up, and entering women's bodies, in far greater degrees than the male body. In a sense, body probing allows the medical practitioner what Foucault calls "invisible invisibility" (Doane, pg. 154). Scientific observation is necessary for diagnosis. But, the degree to which the body is opened up to expose what is normally invisible, even to the patient, has been discussed in terms of the power of some to view the hidden, degree of body boundaries variant across certain groups, and, in the case of the mass media, what is acceptable to portray in terms of these body invasions. Rape, for example, has been depicted in graphic detail, and sometimes for visual pleasure as evidenced in early B-rated movies and snuff pornography, in the mass media. Comparatively few male rapes are depicted in the mass media, and those that are, such as in the movie Deliverance, become jokes. In other words, it is acceptable to watch, and in some cases enjoy watching, a woman's body boundaries violated in ways that are ignored or humorous when transferred to a male body. In the case of early medical science overt interest in dissecting the female, the unclothing of the dancers in burlesques or metaphorically portrayed in Salome's Dance of the Seven Veils, social critics have theorized about the interest in "unveiling" the feminine mystique which, in turn, opens the woman to the masculine gaze rendering the her helpless, and allowing possession and mastery (Lupton, 1994).

Public Surveillance and Social Control:

Excessive depiction of the body may not only function as a testament to the power of the beholder, but a mechanism of social control through both public scrutiny and self-policing enforced through constant visibility. Medical surveillance of the body, and the targeting of specific groups for intense scrutiny, has functioned as a social control mechanism. Bartky (1988) argues a "state of conscious and permanent visibility . . . assures the automatic

functioning of power" (pg. 194). In the late nineteenth century, a burgeoning public health movement rationalized medical surveillance of bodies in the interest of social health (Lupton, 1994). Epidemiology and the medico-social survey were important instruments in disciplining groups. The shift of illness moved from the individual body to the social body (Lupton, 1994), with medical scientists focusing their scrutiny on targeted groups, such as homosexuals, believed to aberrations and/or threats to social health. According to Lupton (1994), "the dialectic of pubic health is that of the freedom of individuals to behave as they wish pitted against the rights of society to control individuals' bodies in the name of health" (p. 32). This policing is particularly suspect in its interest on sexuality. For example, Marshall and Weeks note the ways the power elite created medical surveillance systems to view, photograph, categorize, and identify the homosexual as a means of social control (Lupton, 1994). Likewise, the traditional medical gaze has been predominantly male, and particularly interested in scrutinizing female sexuality. This stands in sharp contrast to lack of medical attention of the reproductive organs, hormonal changes, and testosterone rushes of men. While medical men were obsessively concerned with the disorderliness and deterioration of women, they turned a blind eye to their own (Marieskind, 1978). "After eliminating women from medicine, men were free to define female health and disease" (Corea, 1977, p. 94). The medical men were able to classify and define women in a multitude of harmful ways. As noted by Gerda Lerner (1993), "Men's power to define...has had a profound effect on women's struggle for their own emancipation" (p. 10). Convinced of female deviance and evil, physicians threw themselves into dissecting the "female problem." Female reproductive functioning of menstruation, pregnancy, childbirth, and menopause are defined as illnesses (Corea, 1977), and responsible for society's ills as well (Barker-Benfield, 1977). Following Darwin's Theory of Evolution, medical scientists suggested that men evolved from lower, less-complex forms of life and that everyone was placed in society based on their evolutionary stage. Within this framework, they placed women in the lowest stage with blacks, children and the senile white (Ehrenreich & English, 1978, p. 116; Corea, 1977). Women would not, however, evolve above this status because biology destined them to remain in a static evolutionary state. "Thus they put women *beneath* them, supine, on examination tables, delivery tables...clearly, women should be in upright positions, in order to be *agents*, helping themselves" (Daly, 1990, p. 237).

The social control moves from the power to observe and classify, to a self-policing force born out of constant visibility. Similar to the policing force of the watchtower warden in the traditional prison panoptican, the watchful medical eye exercises control over the body, health, and sexuality of individuals through self-policing. As described by Foucault in Discipline and Punish, public torture and capital punishment as a means of social discipline

and social control were replaced by a prison system which relied on criminals' self-policing through the knowledge of an ever-present watchful eye. The watchtower of the prison panoptican allows for behavior control through the created sense of perpetual observation. This same disciplinary system is evidenced in other forms of social control as exercised on the body. According to Steele (1996), "Michel Foucault argued that, in eighteenth-century Europe, soldiers, whose bodies had been rigorously disciplined and transformed, became docile, conforming to the social order. The 1980s cult of the body forms a striking parallel. Though apparently liberating and life-extending, the preoccupation with the body by social institutions can be seen as an extension of social control onto the body itself" (pp. 65-66). The very notion that one's body is watched, examined, and scrutinized incites a need to police oneself (Sarup, 1993; Poster, 1993; and Rouse, 1994). The prison panoptican theory is transferable to the medical theatre in that if an individual or group witnesses the image of their body as constantly visible and examined by the public, they are more likely to obsess about that body leading to self-policing behaviors. In order for self-policing to exist, the surveyed must have a constant sense that they are open to constant medical scrutiny (Lupton, 1994). The mass media plays a role in fostering this self-surveillance in an era in which the body is subjected to an unprecedented discipline through body surveillance (Bartky, 1988). It is arguable, though, that self-policing incites greater health. Screening for cancer, for example, save lives. However, degree of self-policing and surrounding beliefs and feelings may decrease health overall. For example, Daly (1990) addresses they way incessant scrutiny of the female body incites preoccupation with self. Others have likewise argued the outcome of this incessant and disparate scrutiny has led to adolescent girls' physical insecurities, and women's desire to obtain bodily perfection at unhealthy and unrealistic degrees. Or, more recently, excessive publicity over breast cancer has spawned disturbingly high numbers of physicians advocating, and patients electing preventive mastectomies (Ehrenreich, 1999).

The Diseased:

Similarly, defining individuals or groups as inherently weak or more prone to disease than others increases their preoccupation with disease and subsequent acceptance of a medically–dependent role in their health. This bodily preoccupation is identifiable in traditional medical definition and scrutiny of the female patient. The medically-sanctioned definition of women as inherently sick, naturally, affected physicians' treatment of female patients, societal views and treatment of women, and ultimately trickled down to affect women's behavior. From the "cult of invalidism," in which countless women were convinced inactivity and milk-only diets were the only cure for any

number of minor ailments, ultimately leading the woman into a sick, weakened and passive state, to the drugged, shaved, and strapped down position of delivering mothers in the 1950s and 1960s, the definition of women as sick, required inactive acceptance of this state. In most cases, the cure was literally worse than the illness, creating greater sickness or physical difficulties among women than they would have had without medical intervention. As outlined by Barker-Benfield (1977), the medical establishment effectively seduced women into their pocket books using this tactic. The more doctors treated, published their ideas, dismembered women, and consigned them to lives of invalidism, the more dependent on the men in this specialty they became (Barker-Benfield, 1977). Furthermore, the more doctors defined women as sick, the more they were able to observe and categorize women, and the more often they were called on to cure women (Barker-Benfield, 1977). Daly (1990) asserts that this incessant definition of women as diseased causes preoccupation and anxiety spurned by frequent check-ups and a sense of medical dependency. The mass media, which allows for greater information dispersion, helps to demystify certain specialties, such as medicine. At the same time, studies indicate that certain types of information create an unrealistic paranoia and sense of danger in the audience. "In being aware of the public gaze, the individual unconsciously him- or herself exerts disciplinary power, both over others and over the self through self-regulation" (Lupton, 1994, p. 32). This is not to suggest that individuals should not seek preventive measures, screen for cancer, utilize technology for fertility control, etc. The difference is the degree to which the individual engages in active, self-determined, and informed decision-making regarding her/his body and its care. In order for an individual to live independently, she/he must be allowed personal control of their essence of self – the body. Medical dependency and accompanying public visibility of that dependency may create a paranoid state leading to robotic acquiescence to medical control devoid of empowered decision-making. Therefore, investigating the way and degree to which men and women are depicted as patients may illumine control mechanisms functioning on the social, medical profession, and individual (through self-policing) levels.

The Passive Patient

To control relies on coercion or the passive acquiesce of the controlled. The functionalist theory to medicine, applied by sociologist Talcott Parsons, delineated the traditional 'sick role' of the patient as one of passivity, compliance, and gratefulness compared to the powerful, paternal, and beneficent role of the physician (Lupton, 1984) was the standard mode of medical operation in the 1950s and 1960s. Even nurses, originally trained

to stand when a physician walked into a room, were passive players in the drama highlighting physicians in leading and omniscient roles. Art imitated life with a number of radio and television programs documenting the power play of the physician-patient relationship (Turow, 1989). In recent years, a more consumerist model of patient interaction with physicians and the healthcare system as a whole has been widely touted. We often are what we see. The question, then, is if mass mediated representations of patients mirror the new trend in healthcare – the consumerist model – or if it still plays back the older, functionalist scripts. Moreover, as medical history, and the mass media in general, has typically delegated more passive roles to women than men, the research is guided by an interest in identifying if televised patient images in reproductive health news reports evidence gender equality in depicting the empowered, as opposed to passive, patient.

To watch is to act, to be watched is to be acted upon. The active role of the surveyor is traditionally reserved for men, while the passive role of the surveyed relegated to women. "One might simplify this by saying: *men act* and *women appear*. Men look at women. Women watch themselves being looked at. This determines not only most relations between men and women but also the relation of women to themselves. The surveyor of woman in herself is male: the surveyed female. Thus she turns herself into an object – and most particularly an object of vision: sight" (Berger, pg. 47). Along the inherent difference in activity between the surveyed and the surveyor, critiques of the female object of the male gaze portrays the woman in passive positions. As in art and entertainment, in the scientific tradition passivity of the examined is more deeply engrained in the medical psyche in terms of female versus male passivity. Throughout its history, women have been passive victims of medicine (Barker-Benfield, 1977). This medical bias has been transferred into the public view as well. In her historical analysis of cancer promotion, Leslie Reagan (1997) notes that cancer screening messages for men and women are vastly different. Women have been told that cancer is their *special problem*, and that it is their womanly duty to get screening with little or no information about the procedures, risks or treatments. Mass mediated health promotion starting in the mid-1950s demanded woman's compliance with screening -- no questions asked, whereas male cancer screening promotions were filled with information, and frequently portrayed men in information-seeking interactions with physicians. Men were described as actively involved in cancer screening, whereas women were commanded to mechanically submit to screening (Reagan, 1997). Although obstetrics/gynecology is a relatively new medical specialty, it holds a taken-for-granted import to women from their late teens through menopause. It is an unquestioned mode of *operation*, literally, in a woman's life. The sanction that women obtain pelvic exams yearly

from adolescence on, are required to have a pelvic exam to obtain a yearly prescription of birth control pills, and often have a gynecologist as a primary physician are conditioned aspects of a woman's life (Reagan, 1997). The standard procedure of giving a woman a pelvic exam before any hospital admission and entry into universities has now dissolved, pap smears and pelvic exams are routinely required for oral contraceptive prescriptions (Interview, Planned Parenthood, 1995), even though the existence of cancer would not change birth control pill prescription. Mary Daly argues that women have historically been sanctioned to lives of "robotitude" -- mechanical motion discouraged from adopting "maintenance levels" of cognition or behavior (p. 53). Turner (1984) notes that "discourse determinism" denies subjectivity and embodiment. He emphasizes the importance of human agency and consciousness to the ability to take ownership of the body (Turner, 1984). The degree of active versus passive stance may affect the ways physicians, society, and individuals view the role a patient plays in the medical theatre, and, possibly, in society.

Body Positioning:

In early social critiques of gender discrimination, body positioning of women in art, entertainment, and advertising, is often cited. Women, it is argued, are often show sitting beneath men, and in passive stances, such as lounging or at rest, rather active stances, such as playing sports. Dijkstra (1986), for example, considers the history of female and male images in visual art, documenting the traditionally passive stances of female images from the arched backs of women in turn-of-the century paintings, to the floating images of the female nude. She, her companions, and all the other endlessly repeated images of prostrate women who were seemingly unable to stand up straight. Because woman was incapable independent action – a creature of the earth who lolled about, doomed to wait helplessly yet ever more eagerly for man as her body tensed further with every minute of unfulfillment-it was only natural to take her by force, since by her very behavior she seemed forever to be pleading to be taken by force" (pp. 99-100). The empowerment many critics, then, have called for involves breaking the physically passive positioning of women as a move to repositioning her socially.

Methodology

The researcher searched the Vanderbilt University Television News Archives, the most comprehensive database in the United States, for television reproductive health news segments. Reproductive health was chosen

because it pertains to sexuality, and requires patients submit to examinations of genitalia and a degree of personal invasiveness of procedures. The search set included stories involving the prostate, testicles, scrotum, penis, vagina, endometrius, uterus, ovaries, breasts, cervix, and stories involving their related diseases, such as cancer, vaginitus, pelvic inflammatory disease, yeast, bacterial and bladder infections, and erectile dysfunction. Words commonly associated with these organs or diseases, such as mammography, rectal exam, and pap smear, were also searched. Other search words included Viagra, male and female birth control methods (including tubal ligation and vasectomy), sexually transmitted diseases (including the newly-researched HPV), impotence, infertility, menstruation, premenstrual syndrome, and abortion. The search also included words pertaining to the reproductive medical specialties of obstetrics, gynecology, urology, andrology, and proctology. Finally, words related to sex were searched, as was the planned parenthood organization. Once the sample was defined, the primary researcher developed a coding scheme to demarcate areas of research interest (see discussion below). The primary researcher and a trained assistant conducted a pilot study of a reduced sample (seventy-five segments) to test the workability of the coding scheme, as well as determine if the sample fit within the parameters of the study. Following this study, the researcher concluded that segments thirty seconds or shorter should not be included in the sample set as these typically had only reporters' head shots, and no patient or related visuals. Similarly, due to the nature of certain stories, few or no visuals were present, and/or the story content did not center on a disease or patient treatment, and were excluded from the sample. These included stories centering on the Dalcon Shield lawsuit, birth rates, FDA approval of drugs, court cases involving abortion, U.S. Supreme Court decisions about abortion, the effects of birth control pills and smoking, smoking and impotence/infertility, population growth, personal/celebrity birth announcements, legislation, frozen embryos, healthcare reform, statistical reports, abortion marches, abortion demonstrations, abortion clinic bombings/violence, abortion protests, and the Viagra/birth control pill and medical insurance coverage debate, and were removed from the sample set. Finally, due to time and budget constraints, the sample was contained to segments airing between January, 1990 and March, 2000. The decision to include all segments from the past ten years rather than randomizing all archived years (1968-2000) was due to the increase in visual representations and clarity over time. Once the sample was more clearly defined, and the coding sheet refined, the primary researcher and trained assistant divided the sample, including segments in the pilot study fitting within the sample parameters, for independent coding. The primary researcher and trained assistant tested 70 segments which contained patient images of the 292 total news segments with patient images for intercoder reliability. Using a

Holsti's (1969) reliability the intercoder reliability calculated at .84. The primary researcher, a trained assistant, and an additional data entry assistant input the data.

Mapping:

For each segment, the network, coder, date, and running time were noted. The coders mapped each segment by listing the scene changes within each news segment. Mapping involved listing the major scene changes within a news segment. Scene changes were operationalized as any change of location (announcer in a news room, patient in a waiting room, physician talking with a patient, etc.) or any change of actors within a location. For example, if a segment depicted a physician examining a series of patients, the portion of activity surrounding each additional patient was demarcated as a new scene. In these instances, although the location may have remained the same, the patients depicted in a segment changed. Likewise, in some stories where the footage remained in one location, and the individuals filmed remained the same but the activity drastically changed, each change in activity was designated a change in scene. A change in scene, for example, could be a film cut from a physician and patient talking in an exam room to the same physician and patient in the same exam room during an examination or medical procedure.

Multiple Scene:

Following from the definition of scene changes as described in mapping, if a segment contained more than one scene it was coded as a multiple sequence, and the total number of scenes was indicated. Each patient-containing scene was coded as an individual segment on a separate coding form. So, a multiple sequence segment might have one non-patient scene and three patient scenes for which each patient scene was coded on separate forms.

Patient:

Each segment was coded for the existence of a patient. Patients were designated as any individual receiving an examination/procedure, or shown in a medical facility room. Patients walking into a medical facility or shown in a waiting room were not counted as patients. In other words, only subjects depicted in conference with a healthcare worker in an examination/procedure room or waiting (sitting, standing, lying) in an examination or procedure room, as well as those patients (sitting, standing, lying) receiving an examination or procedure were coded as patients.

Patient Gender:

Patients were coded as male or female. If the patient was not recognizably male or female (due to obscurity of film or limited body exposure -- such as a close-up of a forearm), patient sex was designated as unknown unless story content was sex-specific, such as prostate cancer, cervical cancer, etc.

Patient Clothing:

Patient clothing was coded for each patient. The categories were operationalized as follows:

- Gown: A medical gown with or without street clothes underneath. Women receiving gynecologic examinations in which they were wearing gowns but had a sheet or drape over their legs were coded in another category.
- Street Clothes: Fully clothed in street (non-medical) attire, or wearing partial streetclothing, such as patient with pants but no shirt were coded in the street clothes category. Women receiving gynecologic examinations in which they were wearing medical gowns or street attire but had a sheet or drape over their legs were coded in another category.
- Drape: Women receiving or waiting for a gynecologic examination wearing street clothes or a medical gown on the upper body, with lower body covered by a sheet, paper or cloth drape were coded as Drape.
- Partial Street Clothes: Patients wearing street clothes on either half of the body only, such as wearing clothing from the torso down, but unclothed on the upper torso were coded as Partial Street Clothes. Patients wearing medical gowns, which typically fall around the mid-thigh or knee, were counted as "gown" -- a previously-operationalized category.

Unclothed Sensitive Body Part:

Unclothed Sensitive Body Part coding category referred to shown body parts typically clothed in western society and/or objects of sexuality. If one of the designated body parts were shown without covering the specific

body part was coded as an unclothed sensitive body part. These included the lower abdomen (below the belly button), female breast(s), buttocks or the pelvic region.

Patient Body Position:

Indicating the patient's primary position during a scene or segment was the Patient Body Position coding category. In cases where the patient moved in and out of position during a scene or segment, the predominant, or longest held physical patient position, was coded as the Patient Body Position. For example, if a patient was shown sitting and then moved into a lying down position, the stance which occupied the greatest amount of time was coded only. The body position categories included: Sitting, standing, and lying down which are easily identifiable and need no further operational definition. In addition to these three options, patients were found in the lithotomy position, which is lying on one's back with knees bent and feet are in stirrups or flat on an examination table/bed or table/bed extension. Two final positions, bending-over-front and bending–over-back, were operationalized as follows: Bending-over-front indicated the patient was bending at the waist with the camera angle from their front; Bending-over-back indicated patient was portrayed from the rear while bending at the waist.

Procedure:

The Procedure category indicated the procedure or examination portrayed in a scene. This is a visual activity category, not a story content category. In other words, if a story's content was colposcopy, but a patient and physician were shown talking in an examination room, the code was none, not colposcopy as indicated by the content. The procedure categories were: Mammography, colposcopy, colonscopy, rectal examination, which includes any rectal probe other than a colonscopy - - digital or with a machine, digital breast examination, digital testicular examination, insertion of norplant, blood - - either giving blood or having pressure taken, or gynecological examination, which indicated any gynecologic examination other than colposcopy, such as digital, speculum insertion, pap smear, etc., body X-ray, excluding mammography, and a category for procedures which are unknown or unidentifiable.

Bodily Probe/Invasion:

If a patient's body was shown invaded by a hand or instrument, the region of the invasion was coded as follows: Arm, buttocks, vagina or rectum. Due to the number of Norplant insertions/removals shown, and to differentiate them from an IV or blood draw, Norplant insertions and removals were coding separately as Norplant.

Results

Patient Image and Sex:

Three hundred forty-five total scenes are included in the sample. Of the 345, fifty-three (15.4%) did not have patient images and were not coded beyond the network, time and content categories. Of the 292 (84.6%) which did have patient images, only 46 (15.8%) had one scene in the segment. The majority of the segments had multiple scenes, with the number of scenes per segments recorded as follows:

Scenes per segment:	Number of scenes:	Percentage of total:
2	55	15.9%
3	48	13.9%
4	32	9.3%
5	40	11.6%
6	24	7%
7	21	6.1%
8	8	2.3%
9	18	5.2%

The majority of reproductive health segments analyzed contained patient images, and many of them had multiple scenes within segment. Therefore, images of patients are prevalent in stories of reproductive healthcare. This leads to the overarching research question regarding differences between male and female patient images. To answer that question, the frequency of total exposure of patients reveals that of the total number of patient images, 69 (23.6%) were male, and 223 (76.4%) were female. Therefore, female patients have a greater degree of visibility than male patients overall in television news stories involving reproductive health. However, the greater visibility, it could be argued, is due to a greater number of stories specific to women's reproductive health. However, of the content

categories, stories on prostate cancer are run the most with a total of 24.9% of story content categories in the sample. Breast cancer stories ran 22.6%, Norplant and Depo-provera stories ran 13.6%, Infertility stories, which affect both sexes, ran 9%, Abortion stories ran 7.8%, Ovarian cancer stories ran 7.5% as did miscellaneous stories not fitting coding categories. Finally, stories on Cervical cancer ran 3.8%.

Patient Image, Sex and Clothing:

Of the segments in which patients were portrayed wearing street clothes, male and female patients were portrayed roughly the same with male patients shown wearing street clothes in 50.7% of the total segments showing patients in street clothes, and female patients shown wearing street clothes 49.3%. However, differences were identified in the various clothing categories, and the numbers of patients in the sample shown in various stages of medical dress or undress are greater for female patients than male patients.

	Male	**Female**
Gown	22.1%	77.6%
Without Clothing (Neck – to – waist)	0%	100%
Gown with Drape	4.7%	95.3%
Unknown	11.8%	88.2%

Percentages are percentages of the sample

Due to the nature of the sample, the unknown categories are explainable by the number of stories involving Norplant insertion/injection which often showed an arm without indication of patient clothing. Likewise, the nature of the sample included stories on breast cancer accounting for the number of women shown unclothed from the waist up.

To understand which identifiable clothing category depicted most often for each sex, percentages were figured for each clothing category within the male sample and female samples respectively. Of the 208 female patient images coded, female patients were portrayed in a medical gown or gynecologic drape most often. Of the 67 male patient images coded, male patients were shown in street clothing most often.

	Female	Male
Street Clothing	16%	52%
Gown or Drape	72%	48%
No Clothing (Neck – to – Waist)	13%	0%

Sex and Unclothed Sensitive Body Part:

When considering the Unclothed Sensitive Body Part category, male patients' pelvic region was shown twice compared to female patients' pelvic region shown three times. Male patients' pelvic regions were shown 40% of the time compared to female patients' shown 60% of the unclothed sensitive body part category. Only one patient, a female, was shown with the gluteous maximus exposed. Two male patients (22.2%) compared to seven female patients (77.8%) were shown with stomachs exposed. The female breast was shown eight times overall.

Patient Position:

Two of the patient position content categories, Patient Bending Over shot from the Front and Patient Bending Over shot for the Back, were not found. The remaining categories and the number of patients portrayed in each (not percentage) are identified below.

Female:

Sitting	Standing	Lying Down	Lithotomy	Unknown	Other
36	72	51	55	10	1

Male:

Sitting	Standing	Lying Down	Lithotomy	Unknown	Other
29	0	32	4	4	0

In the female sample, the most frequent body position was standing which is largely accounted for by the predominance of mammography images in breast cancer stories. The second most frequent position for the female

sample was the lithotomy position, followed by lying down position. The three most frequent positions in the female sample were denotative of examination or procedure. The sitting category typically involved patient consultation, giving blood or norplant insertion/removal. In the male sample, the most frequent position was lying down, which was denotative of physical examination, followed by sitting, which typically involved patient consultation or giving blood and was not denotative of examination or procedure. Four cases of male images in the lithotomy position were recorded, and involved prostate examination/surgery.

Network:

The question can be raised, is choice of these images arbitrary? Could these stories be run without or with different types of patient images? One way to answer this is to consider if there are different ways the major networks, which tend to have fairly equal market share over the last ten years, use patient images. With the exception of CNN, the major networks ran stories about reproductive health in a fairly even degree. When Network is crosstabulated with Content, it appears that there are some differences in choice of stories by the different networks.

Percentage of reproductive health stories in sample by network:

ABC	NBC	CBS	CNN
34.5%	33%	28.7%	3.8%

Content Area:

On prostate cancer, the leading story content area, the networks were quite uniform in the percentage of the total number of reproductive stories devoted to prostate cancer. CNN, which made up only 3.8% of the sample, ran an expectedly smaller percentage of Prostate Cancer stories.

Percentage share of reproductive health sample total devoted to prostate cancer (by network):

ABC	NBC	CBS	CNN
32.6%	31.4%	30.2%	5.8%

Percentages of total reproductive health stories aired in sample devoted to prostate cancer (by network):

CNN	ABC	NBC	CBS
38.5%	23.5%	23.7%	30.2%

The low number of Prostate Cancer stories by CNN is of greater interest when considering that of the total number of CNN segments in the sample, a relatively high percentage were on Prostate Cancer. The other networks, however, were fairly uniform in this tabulation. Interestingly, CNN was the only network which did not run stories on Cervical Cancer, Birth Control or Norplant/Depo-provera.

On cervical cancer stories the stations differed widely in their choice to run cervical cancer stories within the sample of reproductive stories. Given these widely disparate figures related to the focus of the individual networks on cervical cancer, it is therefore interesting to take note of the percentages of the total stories aired in the sample devoted to cervical cancer.

Percentage share of reproductive health sample total devoted to cervical cancer (by network):

NBC	ABC	CBS	CNN
69.2%	23.1%	7.7%	0%

Percentages of total reproductive health stories aired in sample devoted to cervical cancer (by network):

NBC	ABC	CBS	CNN
7.9%	2.5%	1%	0%

On stories pertaining to birth control, CNN's 0% of their and the sample totals stands in stark contrast to the relatively high percentages delivered by the other networks. On Norplant/Depo Provera Stories, CBS and NBC were held identical percentage shares of the sample total, and varied by only 2.2% of their story totals. However, ABC ran Norplant/Depo-provera stories at a significantly higher rate.

Percentages of total reproductive health stories aired in sample devoted to birth control (by network):

NBC	ABC	CBS	CNN
2.6%	3.4%	4%	0%

Percentage share of reproductive health sample total devoted to Norplant/Depo Provera (by network):

NBC	ABC	CBS	CNN
29.8%	40.4%	29.8%	0%

On breast cancer stories the ABC and NBC networks were fairly uniform in their coverage with relatively close percentages of their totals dedicated to breast cancer stories.

Percentage share of reproductive health sample total devoted to breast cancer (by network):

NBC	ABC	CBS	CNN
37.2%	30.8%	29.5%	2.6%

All of the networks included in the sample ran stories on reproductive health to one degree or another. These figures serve to demonstrate that although news stories and general social import don't change, network choice of which reproductive health stories to run do vary.

Lithotomy position:

In the body position area, the lithotomy position and bending over are the most sexually explicit, emotionally-problematic and likely to involve active physical examination of the possible categories. Because the bending over categories (front and back) were not represented, only the lithotomy position is cross-tabulated with network. Most of the networks were fairly similar, however CNN showed patients in the lithotomy position more often than the others. This high rate of display exceeds the percentage of stories showing patients in all other positions by more than half.

Percentages of total reproductive health stories aired in sample showing the lithotomy position (by network):

NBC	ABC	CBS	CNN
15.3%	21.4%	20.7%	55.6%

Bodily invasions:

Bodily invasions were fairly equally spread across networks. The major exception to this is CNN, which did not have arm injection portrayals.

Percentage share of all arm injection portrayals (by network):

NBC	ABC	CBS	CNN
27.6%	48.3%	24.1%	0%

Percentages of total bodily invasion portrayals devoted to arm injection (by network):

NBC	ABC	CBS	CNN
8.2%	13.6%	12.2%	0%

Relatedly, ABC showed Norplant insertion/removal much more commonly than did NBC or CBS. As with arm injections, CNN did not have Norplant insertion/removal portrayals.

Percentage share of all arm Norplant insertion/removals (by network):

NBC	ABC	CBS	CNN
19%	61.9%	19%	0%

Percentages of total bodily invasion portrayals devoted to Norplant insertion/removal (by network):

NBC	ABC	CBS	CNN
4.1%	12.6%	4.9%	0%

In terms of rectal examinations, NBC and ABC differed very little. CBS came in slightly lower. In a departure from the bodily invasion statistics so far, CNN had a higher percentage of bodily invasion portrayals as rectal than any other network.

Percentage share of all rectal examination portrayals (by network):

NBC	ABC	CBS	CNN
40%	33.3%	20%	6.7%

Percentages of total bodily invasion portrayals devoted to rectal examination (by network):

NBC	ABC	CBS	CNN
6.1%	4.9%	3.7%	11.1%

Vaginal invasions were the most common bodily invasions for all networks. CNN, most notably, had a rather high percentage of all bodily invasion portrayals as vaginal invasions.

Percentage share of all vaginal invasion portrayals (by network):

NBC	ABC	CBS	CNN
31.1%	37.8%	22.2%	8.9%

Percentages of total bodily invasion portrayals devoted to vaginal examination (by network):

NBC	ABC	CBS	CNN
14.3%	16.5%	12.2%	44.4%

Although the networks did not vary much in each bodily invasion category, they all showed vaginal examinations more than any other bodily invasion category, including the benign arm injection and Norplant. CNN,

which did not show either of the arm injection and Norplant categories, did show a fairly high number of vaginal examinations. Moreover, CNN showed as many vaginal examinations (44.4%) as they showed segments in which bodily invasions of any kind were not shown (44.4%).

Analysis

The data suggests that in televised reproductive health reports women were shown as patients more than men, by evidence of their clothing, and because women were shown undergoing clinical examination or procedures more often than men in the reproductive health sample. Moreover, the televised portrayals of women in the clinical setting denote illness, even while women are predominantly healthy or aspiring to long-term health through these examinations. For example, although story content might involve cancer screenings and birth control, which are typically sought by healthy women interested in maintaining reproductive health, the visual impact is still one of the diseased female undergoing medical treatment. Breast cancer screening, for example, was depicted as a medical procedure with the predominant visual of a woman receiving a mammogram. Conversely, no medical screening, rectal or testicular examinations, were presented regarding men's preventative health. The few visuals involving male prostate problems involved the treatment of a diseased patient. In other words, stories including male patients receiving medical procedures were limited to stories dealing with the disease prostate cancer and its treatment. No visual depictions of medical procedures or examinations accompanied stories about testicular cancer, its screening or treatment. This difference is clearly observed in a CBS, October 9, 1992 report on prostate cancer. Although the story focused only on prostate cancer, a brief acknowledgement of a possible genetic link between prostate cancer patients and their mothers' incidence of breast cancer showed a visual of a woman receiving a breast examination. No male patients were shown.

Another distinction the data supports involves passivity. In the sample, women were shown receiving medical examinations more than men. Moreover, in stories relating to male reproductive health issues compared to female health issues, men were depicted in consultation, an active role, more often than women, and were shown under examination far less. The data on body positioning further supports that women in the sample are portrayed passively compared to men in the sample. Men were depicted sitting, most often in consultation with a healthcare provider, which is a fairly neutral body position. Women, were depicted standing more often than other body positions. Standing is an active stance. However, in most recorded cases of standing, women were depicted receiving

mammograms, which by virtue of the machine and requirement to stand still, passivity is subtlety implied. More telling is the number of times women were shown lying down or in the lithotomy position. The lithotomy position does not afford actual or visual representation of mobility, and poses problems for many women due to its submissive, sexually suggestive, and vulnerable position, causing advocates to request semi-sitting positions during pelvic examinations which afford a greater sense of mobility and less vulnerability.

Along with overall visibility, representation as patients, and body positioning, women depicted in the sample were more often shown receiving bodily invasive procedures than men in the sample. Women were frequently shown with legs spread and their reproductive systems exposed to clinicians, a number of gynecologic procedures were shot with patients' spread legs open to the camera, with genitalia most often covered by the physician conducting the examination or procedure. An example of this tendency occurred on an NBC, September 23, 1996 story on in-vitro fertilization. An up-close camera angle positioned between the patient's legs showed a physician inserting a thin tube into a woman's vagina. Another image on the same segment showed a physician conducting an ultrasound with one hand, and with the other points to the monitor and explains to the camera, "so, what you see here is the ovary." Although not coded, the researchers noted that diagrams of the female anatomy, and graphics depicting the internal procedures, such as IUD placement, frequently accompanied stories on ABC, December 17, 1996; CBS, September 23, 1999; ABC, January 17, 1999; CNN, October 9, 1998; and ABC, April 1, 1991 to name a few. No similar examinations or the degree of visible body invasion were shown in the male sample. Although digital vaginal examinations were depicted in the sample, no related rectal examinations were included in the male sample. Granted, prostate exams do not occur as frequently as gynecologic exams, surgeries, etc. They also do not carry the same degree of invasiveness or physical positioning as a pelvic exam. Yet, of the reproductive health segments, prostate cancer stories led in coverage, but visual portrayals of male patients receiving examinations or procedures was lacking in comparison to portrayals of female patients in related stories.

Although not specifically coded, the researchers noted that close-up shots of the physical areas penetrated, medical instruments, and the patients' faces during examinations were the mode of operation in the female sample, whereas these images were virtually nonexistent in visual footage of the male sample. In the majority of segments involving male reproductive health, the patients' faces were not in view or were obscured through low lighting or distant camera angles while the patient is undergoing a medical procedure. This is contrasted to the fully-lighted examination rooms and close-up shots in the female sample. Similarly, most camera shots show, and even focus on,

the table of medical instruments in the female sample only. In one segment aired on NBC, April 15, 1991, a physician is shown removing an IUD. The camera shows the woman's face in a painful grimace, and cuts to the physician's bloodied and gloved hand holding the bloody device over the patient's draped legs. Finally, in a number of coding areas, differences across network emerged suggesting that portrayal of patient images are not arbitrary, or uniform in necessity.

The study of difference between portrayals of male and female patients is descriptive, and some would argue a mere bean counting of mass mediated representations of physical reality. However, it is reality that men, as well as women, are patients. It is also reality that, at times, in medical care male patients as well as female patients must absolve control of their bodies, endure painful and/or humiliating examinations, and render themselves passive to another's scrutinizing medical gaze. Yet, the disparity in frequency of these representations, and the degree and manner of portraying this reality is different between the sexes as supported by the data. An appropriate question following a read of the numbers might be, "so what?" Answers suggesting that women go to the doctor more often than men and thus are afforded greater media attention, the media is consumer-driven so someone, logically women, want to see these reports, or that the media needs to have interesting visuals and people doing something are the most interesting to viewers, could be rendered. Relatedly, ask a news cast producer and they are likely to identify the time constraints, tape availability, financial restrictions and marketing dimensions leading to footage choice. These explanations seem logical for footage choice when considering a specific news segment, and suggest the recorded patient image disparity is nothing more than coincidence born out of what seem to be normal, physical constraints as dictated by journalistic business practices. What these arguments don't explain, however, is the disparity of images based on sex when these news segments are viewed as a whole. Following from Foucault's suggestion that power is not a metaphysical force existing prior to action (Rouse, 1994), when it occurs it may be as unrecognizable or expected of the actors encouraging its existence or those on whom it has its greatest effect. This framework encourages looking at the workings of power and acceptance of practices deemed normal, unproblematic, necessary and "truthful" when, in fact, they are arbitrary in their use, as identified in difference of portrayals across networks, and accepted as the necessary or "right" operational mode out of their routine acceptance. A quick way to assess the operational mode is to apply practice in female patient representations to male patient representations. For example, one can speculate about audience reaction if male patients in prostate cancer stories were shown receiving rectal examinations, with the same close camera angles and frequency women are shown receiving pelvic examinations. In

essence, the idea is not to look at who is causing domination, but to ask how and why these constructions exist, and to offer a suggestion of potential effects (Sarup, 1993; Gutting, 1994; Fraser, 1981).

Conclusion

The reported content analysis provides a description of patient images in reproductive health reports. That description centers on identifiable differences in patient representation, body exposure, and body invasion between male and female patients. How and why these differences occur, and to what effect, are open for interpretation. Based on considerations of power and domination theories of the body, largely informed by Michele Foucault, socio-scientific sex and sexual definitions and designations, along with historical medical discourse, I suggest these images function as a public panoptican placing women's bodies in positions that transfer detriments of the medical gaze to a public gaze, and disciplines the female body through self-policing. Through the camera eye, women's private lives are made public discourse, and their body boundaries violated in ways men's bodies are not. Finally, these images produce and maintain socio-scientific social positioning of women, and define them as passive and reproductively sick patients. As noted, the content analysis affords description alone, and the analysis is rendered through the researcher's lens. Moreover, what the content analysis does not afford is direct cause-effect analysis. Future research building on this study might target the social significance of these images by addressing how these discursive formations affect individual, societal, and governing mechanisms of truth, knowledge, relationships, and action surrounding the sexes respectively.

Bibliography

Anderson, R. (1995). Consumer Culture & TV Programming. Boulder: Westview Press.

Apple, R. D. (Ed.). (1990). Women, health, and medicine in America. New York: Garland Publishing, Inc.

Bach, A. (1996, February). Birth control: Men draw closer to having a version of 'the pill.' The Arizona Republic, p. 8.

Barker-Benfield, G. J. (1977). Sexual surgery in late-nineteenth-century America. In C. Dreifus (Ed.), Seizing our Bodies (pp. 13-41). New York: Vintage Books.

Bartky, S. L. (1988). Foucault, feminity and the modernization of patriarchal power. In I. Diamond and L. Quimby (Eds.). Feminism and Foucault (pp. 61-86). Boston: Northeastern University Press.

Berger, J. (1983). Ways of Seeing. London: British Broadcasting Corporation, and Middlesex: Penguin Books Limited.

Billings, J.A & Stoeckle, J.D. (1977). Pelvic examination instruction and the doctor-patient relationship. Journal of Medical Education, 52, 834-839.

Calnan, M., & Williams, S. (1992). Images of scientific medicine. Sociology of Health & Illness, 14, 233-254.

Corea, G. (1977). The Hidden Malepractice: How American Medicine Treats Women as Patients and Professionals. New York: Harper Colophon Books.

Cypher, J. M. (1994). A discursive construction of woman: Be-ing with, through and beyond gynecological experience. Unpublished master's thesis, Purdue University, West Lafayette, Indiana

Daly, M. (1990). Gynecology The Metaethics of Radical Feminism. Boston: Beacon Press Books.

Debrovner, C. & Shubin-Stein, R. (1975). Psychological aspects of vaginal examinations. Medical Aspects of Human Sexuality, 9, 163-164.

Doane, M. A. "The Clinical Eye: Medical Discourses in the 'Woman's Film' of the 1940s" in S. R. Suleiman, (Ed.). (1986). The Female Body in Western Culture Contemporary Perspectives (pp. 152-174). Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Domar, A.D. (Winter ,1985-86). Pyschological aspects of the pelvic exam: Individual needs and physician involvement. Women & Health, 10, 75-90.

Douglas, M. (1980). Purity and Danger: An Analysis of Concepts of Pollution and Taboo. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul.

Dreifus, C. (1977). Introduction. In C. Dreifus (Ed.), Seizing our Bodies (pp. xvii-xxxi). New York: Vintage Books.

Ehrenreich, B. (April 1999). Breasts to spare. The Progressive, pg. 11.

Ehrenreich, B., & English, D. (1977). Complaints and disorders: The sexual politics of sickness. In C. Dreifus (Ed.), Seizing our Bodies (pp. 43-56). New York: Vintage Books.

Ehrenreich, B., & English, D. (1978). For Her Own Good 150 Years of the Expert's Advice to Women. New York: Doubleday.

Ellis, B. A. (1990). Woman as Fetish in Advertising: A Content Analysis of Print Fragrance Advertisements 1986-1989. Thesis. U. of Texas Austin.

Emerson, J. (1970). Behavior in private places: Sustaining definitions of reality in gynecological examinations. In H. P. Dreitzel (Ed.), Recent Sociology (pp. 74-97). New York: Collier.

Foucault, M. (1975). The Birth of the Clinic: An Archaeology of Medical Perception. New York: Vintage Books.

Foucault, M. (1995). Discipline & Punish The Birth of the Prison. New York: Vintage Books.

Frye, C. A., & Weisberg, R. B. (1994). Increasing the incidence of routine pelvic examinations: Behavioral medicine's contribution. Women & Health, 21, 33-49.

Gamman, L. and Marshment, M. (Eds.). (1989). The Female Gaze Women as Viewers of Popular Culture. Seattle: The Real Comet Press.

Holsti, O. R. (1969). Content Analysis for the Social Sciences and Humanities. Reading: Addison-Wesley.

Jeffcoate, S. L., & Sandler, M. (eds.). (1982). Progress towards a male contraceptive. New York: John Wiley & Sons.

Larned, D. (1977). The epidemic in unnecessary hysterectomy. In C. Dreifus (Ed.), Seizing our Bodies (pp. 195-208). New York: Vintage Books.

Lerner, G. (1993). The Creation of Feminist Consciousness From the Middle Ages to Eighteen-Seventy. New York: Oxford University Press.

Lupton, D. (1990). Medicine as Culture Illness, Disease and the Body in Western Societies. Thousand Oaks: SAGE Publications.

Marieskind, H. (1977). The women's health movement: Past roots. In C. Dreifus (Ed.), Seizing our Bodies (pp. 3-12). New York: Vintage Books.

Northrup, C. (1998). Women's Bodies, Women's Wisdom Creating Physical and Emotional Health and Healing. New York: Bantam Books.

Osofsky, H.J. (1967). Women's reactions to pelvic examination. Obstetrics & Gynecology, 30, 146-151.

Payer, L. (1988). Medicine & Culture. New York: Henry Holt and Company.

Petravage, Reynolds, Gardner, & Reading (1979). Attitudes of women toward the gynecologic examination. The Journal of Family Practice, 9, 1039-1045.

Poster, M. (1989). Critical theory and poststructuralism. Ithaca: Cornell University Press.

Reagan, L. J. (1977). Engendering the dread disease women, men, and cancer. American Journal of Public Health, 87, 1779-1788.

Rich, A.C. (1986). Of Woman Born. New York: W.W. Norton & Company.

Rouse, J. (1994). Power/knowledge. In G. Gutting (Ed.). The Cambridge companion to Foucault (pp. 92-115). New York: Cambridge University Press.

Sarup, M. (1993). An Introductory Guide to Post-structuralism and Postmodernism. (2nd Ed.). Athens: The University of Georgia Press.

Scully, D. (1980). Men Who Control Women's Health: The Miseducation of Obstetrician-Gynecologists. Boston: Houghton Mifflin.

Suleiman, S. R. (Ed.). (1986). The Female Body in Western Culture Contemporary Perspectives. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Steele, V. (1996). Fetish Fashion, Sex and Power. New York: Oxford University Press.

Turner, B. S. (1992). Regulating Bodies: Essays in Medical Sociology. London: Routledge.

Turow, J. (1989). Playing doctor: Television, Storytelling and Medical Power. New York: Oxford University Press.

Weiss, K. (1977). What medical students learn about women. In C. Dreifus (Ed.), Seizing our Bodies (pp. 212-222). New York: Vintage Books.

Weiss, L., & Meadow, R. (1979). Women's attitudes toward gynecologic practices. Obstetrics & Gynecology, 54, 110-114

Welton, D. (Ed.) (1999). The Body Classic and Contemporary Readings. Malden: Blackwell Publishing, Inc.

States of Women

The Olympic Ideal

A content analysis of the coverage of Olympic women's sports in San Francisco Bay Area newspapers

By Greg Mellen and
Patricia Coleman
Masters Students
University of Missouri-School of Journalism

215 Lindell Dr.
(573) 817-2390
mellenr@missouri.edu or
pat@ire.org

Abstract

This study extends previous research on coverage of women's Olympic sports in selected newspapers. A content analysis was conducted on sports sections from large, medium and small newspapers from the San Francisco Bay Area. 513 stories and nearly 18,000 inches of text, photos and graphics were coded. The study supports Kinnick's findings of equitable and proportional coverage, but finds a bias in favor of "gender appropriate" sports.

Several studies show that women continue to suffer from inequitable coverage on a daily basis in newspapers in the United States. Research shows that despite huge increases by women participating in sports, women's sports events are underreported in newspapers. Content analyses have showed slow growth in the coverage of women-only sports in the past decade from 3.5 percent in 1991 (Duncan, et. al, 1991) to as high as 12.8 percent in 1998 (Mellen, 2000).

Although gains in overall coverage of women's sports have been slow and hard-fought, studies of women's coverage in the Olympic Games tell a more heartening tale. This study adds to literature that suggests that women are approaching and on occasion exceeding proportional coverage in the Olympic Games in four San Francisco Bay Area newspapers. However, it also suggests a disturbing continuing trend by newspapers to concentrate on so-called gender appropriate images of women in sport. It also poses the question whether Olympic coverage can be used to promote added coverage of women's sports throughout the year rather than only when high profile women's events are staged.

Although women have spent two decades struggling to find widespread acceptance and equitable coverage in daily newspapers (Bryant 1981, Woolard, 1983, Theberge & Cronk, 1986, Theberge 1991, Duncan et. al., Silverstein 1996, Wann et. al., 1998, Mellen), other studies show that coverage of women's sports in the Olympics is on an upswing (Eastman & Billings, 1999, Kinnick, 1996)

The last 30 years have seen unparalleled growth in women's athletics. The passage of Title IX, an extension of the civil rights legislation and part of the Education Amendments Act of 1972, opened the doors for women's participation in sports in the United States. In the 28 years of Title IX, there has been a nine-fold increase in high school sports participation from 29,015 to 2,652,796 (National Federation of High School Associations, 1999). Intercollegiate sports have seen similar growth from 31,000 in 1971 to more than 135,000 (National Collegiate Athletics Association, 1999).

However, growth in newspaper coverage has been ponderous at best. The Olympics, however, are popular among readers and provide newspapers with a ready-made opportunity to display equitable coverage.

Recent studies show that Olympic coverage is gaining popularity. Readership polls by the Augusta Chronicle indicated readers want more Olympic coverage. A full 69 percent were either very interested or somewhat interested in Olympic coverage (Neuwirth, 1998).

As a result, coverage of the Nagano Olympics in 1998 provided a platform to provide stories of women's successes.

Literature on Olympic coverage has differed in its interpretation on the increases in women's coverage in recent years. At least one study suggests no significant gains in parity for women (Eastman and Billings). Another noted gender bias in major newspaper coverage was less prevalent than found by other scholars and that differences in representation and respect between the sexes was minimal (Kinnick).

Eastman and Billings analyzed network television coverage of the 1994, 1996 and 1998 Olympiads, focusing on mentions of women and men athletes and women's and men's sports and found no appreciable change.

Eastman and Billings suggested that although references to men's and women's sports nearly mirrored participation rates among the athletes (65 percent men, 35 percent women), 50/50 coverage should be expected during prime time television hours for three reasons: those shows generally don't contain preliminaries, where most male athletes are eliminated in their sports; only medal events are likely to attract American viewers; networks have expressed a desire to attract women viewers.

After analyzing 150 hours of programming, Eastman and Billings found that air time devoted to men's events approximated participation levels, or 3-2. However, in the 1996 Olympics, dubbed the year of the woman, the minutes of prime time coverage were virtually identical. Additionally, medal events showed similar equivalence. Eastman and Billings noted that there was no gain in airtime for women in Winter Olympics between Lillehammer and Nagano.

The content analysis done by Kinnick is more helpful for the purposes of this study in that it looks at newspaper coverages. Kinnick compared personality profiles written about athletes in the Atlanta Olympics in the *New York Times, Washington Post, Los Angeles Times, USA Today* and *Atlanta Constitution.* Among other things, that analysis looked at the percentage of feature articles devoted to male and female athletes, the sports that received the most coverage for male and female athletes, whether "gender appropriate" sports received more coverage, and placement of stories in the paper (front page, inside and above or below the fold).

Among Kinnick's findings:

Of 170 profiles, 93 were of men, 77 of women, or 45 percent for the women. This proportionally favored women who made up 34.4 percent of the overall participants, and 42 percent of the United States team.

In addition, 88 percent of the female athletes profiled were represented by photographs compared to 73 percent of men. *USA Today* had the largest disparity favoring stories about male athletes, 62 percent to 38 percent.

Slightly more photos of women appeared on section fronts than men, 9.1 percent vs. 7.5 percent. Articles about women were visually dominant on pages 49.4 percent of the time compared to 39.8 percent.

One of Kinnick's explanations for the relative absence of bias was that journalistic practices have caught up with social attitudes and acceptance of women in sports.

However, Kinnick also correctly notes that the public's interest in women's sports peaks during the Olympic Games or during special events such as the Women's World Cup. Kinnick suggests a study with levels of representation before and after the Games.

One troubling aspect of Kinnick's study, confirmed by this study, is the fascination of the media with "gender appropriate" sports. It is suggested that when the media concentrate on such sports they perpetuate the image of sports as a man's world and bolster images of female passivity and frailty (Theberge & Cronk).

However, though the popularity of figure skating and gymnastics seem to suggest that even among women, sports that are closely linked with "feminine" attributes are the most popular. And in our society, popularity means advertising,

which mean endorsements, which means media coverage and ultimately success. That seems to be where our society is now, and that is what will be reflected in coverage.

> For women, ... sports reflect rather than form social attitudes. Allied to this is the conservatism of the media, devoted to satisfying existing audiences rather than trying to develop new ones. Women will get full equality in sports activity when they achieve it on other levels. (Koppett, p. 212)

Bringing readers beyond this mindset is a daunting task to say the least, and sports editors may have a point when they suggest that sports readers, like sports editors and writers, are comfortable with sports as they know them and are resistant to change.

METHOD:

To test whether women were receiving equitable coverage, and to look more closely at newspapers' coverage of "gender appropriate" women's sports, a content analysis was conducted. All Olympic stories in the sports sections of the *Marin Independent Journal,* the *Santa Rosa Press-Democrat,* the *San Francisco Chronicle,* and the Sunday sections of the *San Francisco Examiner* were tabulated, measured and coded. Stories were coded "men's" "women's" "both" and "neutral."

Men's and women's stories are self-explanatory. Stories coded "both" were generally round-ups, but also included pairs figure skating and ice-dancing. Neutral stories were about issues, site and weather news, and various postcards and culture-based stories.

For this study, 513 stories and 18,000 inches of overall newshole were coded. In addition to coding by gender, the study measured column inches of text

and overall inches, including headlines, photos and graphics. This study also looked a page 1 placement of stories and broke down coverage into individual sports to test percentages of "gender appropriate" sports.

The Winter Olympics ran from two weeks in February 1998 in Nagano, Japan. All four Bay Area papers provided extensive Olympic coverage. That their coverage does not vary significantly statistically is not surprising. All four papers relied heavily on wire services to provide coverage of the Winter Games. The *Marin Independent-Journal* and *San Francisco Chronicle* each sent one staff writer to Nagano. The *Santa Rosa Press-Democrat* and *San Francisco Examiner* both covered the event entirely through the use of wire.

All four papers had occasional Olympics stories and daily teases on their news front pages, as well as occasional Olympics-related stories in feature, travel, business and even food sections. These were not coded for this study.

ANALYZING THE DATA:

The findings of this study add to the work of Kinnick. The Kinnick study compared the number of personality feature stories written about men and women at the Atlanta Olympic Games and found that of 170 stories in five newspapers, 77 or 45 percent were about women. This study included men's and women's event stories as well as personality profiles and broke them down by sport rather than type of story. However, in relation to participation rates, women's coverage rates were fairly equitable.

Of 249 stories that were designated either men's or women's stories, 97 or 39 percent were women's stories. This is comparable to the 35 percent overall and 42 percent U.S. team participation rate by women in the Olympics. Women's stories also

compared favorably with men's events in column inches per story and overall presentation with a few notable exceptions.

However, despite these impressive gains, women's stories were still the fewest of all four categories and shortest in terms of overall column inches. In terms of total newshole, women's stories finished in third among the four categories, slightly ahead of neutral stories, but well behind men's and both-gender stories.

Strong arguments could be made that women's coverage could and maybe should have been much higher, particularly in United States newspapers.

U.S. women were by far the most successful athletes from this country. Women captured four of the United States' six gold medals and nine of 13 overall medals. In the Nagano Olympics, the U.S. women's hockey team won the gold medal in that event's first-ever staging. U.S. women also had some of the more interesting dramas, as in the battle for the figure skating gold medal in which Tara Lipinski skated a nearly flawless final routine to pull past teammate Michelle Kwan to win the gold medal. Also there was alpine skier Picabo Street who came back from a career threatening knee injury to win a gold medal in the women's super giant slalom. She also just missed out on a bronze medal in the women's downhill. In addition, Chris Wilty was the only member of the U.S. team to win a medal in speedskating, taking the silver medal in the women's 1,000 meters and bronze in the 1,500. Also Shannon Dunn captured a bronze medal in snowboarding in the women's half-pipe.

U.S. men, by contrast, won only two gold medals, however, one of those gold medallists was Jonny Moseley, a Bay Area resident from Tiburon, Calif.

It is also notable that stories in both-gender categories and neutral categories jumped significantly. Because of the large volume of events being contested in the compressed time frame of the Olympic Games, most papers ran extensive round-up stories about qualifying events and non-medal competitions. There were also numerous neutral stories ranging from "postcards" from Nagano in the *San Francisco Chronicle* to questions from readers to writer Holly Woolard in the *Marin Independent-Journal*, to general stories about the atmosphere and culture of Nagano, to weather conditions, to stories by Dave Barry about oddities such as eating blowfish.

Table 1. Olympic Story Count Comparison

Newspaper	Total Stories	Men's Stories	Men's Percent	Women's Stories	Women's Percent
Independent Journal	157	46	29.3%	33	21.0%
Press Democrat	174	51	29.3%	37	21.3%
San Francisco Chronicle	149	46	30.9%	21	14.1%
San Francisco Examiner	33	9	27.3%	6	18.2%
Total	513	152	29.6%	97	18.9%

The percentages of men's-only stories in the four papers were generally consistent and range from 27.3 percent in the *San Francisco Examiner* to 30.9 percent in the *San Francisco Chronicle*. Men's stories in the *Marin Independent Journal* and *Santa Rosa Press-Democrat* were both 29.3 percent. Overall in the four papers, men's stories accounted for 29.6 percent of all stories.

Women's stories accounted for 18.9 percent of stories overall, and 20.4 percent of total newshole, indicating similar if not quite as prominent play given for women's events.

The percentages of women's stories range from 21.3 percent in the *Santa Rosa Press-Democrat* to 14.1 percent in the *San Francisco Chronicle*. The *San Francisco Chronicle*, women's stories (21) were half those of both-gender stories (42) and considerably less than gender-neutral stories (40). Overall, women's stories accounted for 18.9 percent of all articles in the four papers.

Overall, men's stories outnumber women's stories 61 percent to 39 percent. The numbers remain fairly consistent in column inches (60 percent for men) and total inches (61 percent for men). These numbers were closely reflected in the individual papers except for the *San Francisco Chronicle*, which had a more than 2-1 ratio of men's to women's stories.

Table 2. Olympic Column Inches Comparison

Newspaper	Total Column Inches	Men's Inches	Men's Percent	Women's Inches	Women's Percent
Independent Journal	2,156.0	652.0	30.2%	477.5	22.1%
Press Democrat	3,442.0	910.0	26.4%	701.0	20.4%
San Francisco Chronicle	2,444.5	784.0	32.1%	373.5	15.3%
San Francisco Examiner	586.0	155.5	26.5%	86.0	14.7%
Total	8,628.5	2,501.5	29.0%	1,638.0	19.0%

In terms of column inches devoted to men's stories the ranges go from 26.4 percent in the *Santa Rosa Press-Democrat* to 32.1 percent in the *San Francisco Chronicle*. In all four papers the men's column inches were 29 percent.

The percentages of column inches range from 22.1 percent in the *Marin Independent-Journal*, compared to 21 percent in story count. In the *Santa Rosa Press-Democrat* column inches fell to 20.4 percent from a 21.3 percent story count, the *San Francisco Chronicle* saw a gain in column inches to 15.3 percent from a 14.1 percent

story percentage. However, the *Chronicle* and *Examiner* both had considerably higher ratios of men's to women's coverage than the smaller papers. In the *Chronicle* men's column inches more than doubled those of women (784-373.5), while in the *Examiner*, men's coverage wasn't quite twice that of women (155.5-86). The *San Francisco Examiner's* percentage of column inches for women's stories dipped considerably to 14.7 from an 18.1 percent story count. (It should be noted that the *Examiner* numbers are small, covering only three Sundays and may not mirror the paper's overall coverage.) Overall the numbers stayed stable, climbing slightly from 18.9 percent to 19 percent.

Table 3. Olympic Total Newshole Comparison

Newspaper	Total Newshole Inches	Men's Inches	Men's Percent	Women's Inches	Women's Percent
Independent Journal	4,156.0	1,537.5	37.0%	883.0	21.2%
Press Democrat	7,529.0	2,167.5	28.8%	1,805.5	24.0%
San Francisco Chronicle	5,183.0	1,741.5	33.6%	828.5	16.0%
San Francisco Examiner	1,112.0	401.5	36.1%	144.0	12.9%
Total	17,980.0	5,848.0	32.5%	3,661.0	20.4%

The overall newshole given to men's sports range from 28.8 percent in the *Press-Democrat* to 37 percent in the *Independent-Journal.* Overall, 32.5 percent of the four papers' newsholes were devoted to men's sports. The 2.9 percent jump between the percentage of men's sports stories and percentage of newshole suggests that men's stories received prominent play with photographs and graphics.

The overall newshole for women's stories ranged between 24 percent in the *Press-Democrat* to 12.9 percent in the *Examiner.* The 20.4 percent overall newhole for women's stories compared to the 18.8 percent story indicates that they also received prominent play, although not to the extent of men.

The *Santa Rosa Press-Democrat* had more than 900 inches more of total space given to women's coverage than its nearest competitor. Its 1,805.5 inches of women's newshole was 45 percent of the newshole devoted to either men's or women's Olympic sports.

The two large San Francisco papers were not nearly as equitable in their coverage of women. The men's newshole in the *Chronicle* favored men (1,741.5-828.5), while the *Examiner's* newshole was tilted in men's favor 401.5-144. In both cases, men's coverage was over-reported in comparison to men's participation in the Olympics.

Table 4. Olympic Average Story Length - Column Inches

Newspaper	Men's	Women's	Both	Neutral	Total
Independent Journal	14.2	14.5	15.0	10.1	13.7
Press Democrat	17.8	18.9	20.1	22.2	19.8
San Francisco Chronicle	17.0	17.8	19.3	11.9	16.4
San Francisco Examiner	17.3	14.3	19.6	18.4	17.8
Total	16.5	16.9	18.1	15.8	16.8

Interestingly, in three of the four papers, women's stories were longer on average in column inches. The *Santa Rosa Press-Democrat* has the longest women's stories on average at 18.9 inches, compared to 17.8 inches for men's stories. In the *Press-Democrat*, the neutral stories were longest at 22.2 inches, followed by both-gender stories at 20.1 inches.

The *San Francisco Chronicle*'s men's stories averaged 17.8 inches, compared to 17.0 inches for women's stories. In the *Chronicle*, both-gender stories were longest at 19 inches, neutral stories averaged only 11.9 inches.

In the *Marin Independent-Journal*, women's stories were slightly longer than men's stories 14.5 inches to 14.3 inches. Both-gender stories averaged 15 inches and neutral stories were 10.1 inches.

The *San Francisco Examiner* had the shortest women's stories, 14.3 inches on average. Men's stories averaged 17.3 inches, both-gender stories were 18.6 inches and neutral stories (which included the opening and closing ceremonies) were 18.4 inches.

Overall, women's stories averaged 16.9 inches, compared to men's stories 16.5 inches. Both-gender stories were the longest 18.1 inches and neutral stories were 15.8 inches.

Table 5. Olympic Average Story Length – Newshole Inches

Newspaper	Men's	Women's	Both	Neutral	Total
Independent Journal	33.4	26.8	24.0	19.3	26.5
Press Democrat	42.5	48.8	45.3	38.2	43.3
San Francisco Chronicle	37.9	39.5	41.0	22.3	34.8
San Francisco Examiner	44.6	24.0	31.2	31.9	33.7
Total	38.5	37.7	35.4	28.3	35.0

Two papers offered more overall space per story to women's stories than men's stories. The *Santa Rosa Press-Democrat* devoted the most space in terms of total inches to women's stories, which averaged 48.8 inches, almost 30 inches per story longer than the column inch counts. The *Press-Democrat's* men's stories averaged 42.5 inches. Both-gender stories were 45.3 inches and neutral stories 38.2 inches. The *San Francisco Chronicle* devoted 39.5 total inches on average to women's stories and 37.9 inches to men's stories. Both-gender stories averaged 41 inches and neutral stories 22.3 inches.

The *San Francisco Examiner* gave the smallest coverage to women's stories. The overall length of women's stories averaged 24 inches, compared to 44.6 inches for men's stories. Neutral stories were 31.9 inches and both-gender stories averaged 31.2 inches.

Overall, women's total inches averaged 37.7 inches, men's stories were 38.5 inches, both-gender stories were 35.4 inches and neutral stories were 28.3 inches.

What's appropriate?

As mentioned earlier, all four papers provided extensive coverage of the Winter Olympiad in Nagano. As also noted, the amounts of coverage tended to mirror participation rates of the U.S. team. However, when specific sports were broken down, this study found some surprising results that could bolster claims that sports editors still tend to focus on the so-called "gender appropriate" sports.

Maybe the most exciting story of the Winter Olympics was the success of the American women's hockey team. The Nagano Olympics were the first Winter Games to include women's hockey as a medal sport. The U.S. team came in as heavy underdogs to the Canadian Olympic team. However, the U.S. women produced their own "Miracle on Ice" with a 3-1 victory against the Canadians in the gold medal game.

The U.S. men's team, by comparison was a major disappointment and failed to even reach the medal round, despite fielding a team featuring a number of professionals from the National Hockey League, including players such as Brett Hull. In addition to its failure to reach medal play, the U.S. team was best remembered for trashing a number of hotel rooms in Nagano.

Because the women's competition was a first-ever event, and because the U.S. unexpectedly dominated the play, one might expect more coverage of the women's sport,

but that was not the case. In fairness, it should also be noted that there were many more men's teams than women's at the Nagano Games, which helps account for some of the difference.

Table 6. Olympic Hockey Coverage

Newspaper	Story Counts		Column Inches		Total Inches	
	Men's	Women's	Men's	Women's	Men's	Women's
Independent Journal	13	5	188.5	65.0	319.5	137.5
Press Democrat	21	14	399.0	227.5	858.0	700.5
San Francisco Chronicle	17	9	344.5	179.5	755.5	493.0
San Francisco Examiner	4	1	82.0	2.5	217.0	3.5
Total	55	29	1,014.0	474.5	2,150.0	1,334.5

Overall in the four papers, men's hockey stories outnumbered women's stories 55-29, representing 65 percent of the coverage of Olympic hockey. The Olympic men's hockey stories totaled 1,014 inches, for an average of 18.4 inches and 67 percent of the hockey text inches. Women's stories measured 474.5 inches, for an average of 16.4 inches. The total inches for men's hockey was 2,150, for 39.1 inches per story, or 62 percent. Women's hockey total inches were 1,334.5, 46 inches per story.

In the four papers, men's hockey stories made the front page 25 times to 11 times for the women.

Interestingly, the *Marin Independent-Journal* had the largest disparity between men's and women's coverage. Men's stories outnumbered women's stories 13-5, for 72 percent of the stories. Men's text inches were 188.5-65 (75 percent) and total inches were

319.5-137.5 (70 percent). The *Independent-Journal* had nine men's hockey stories on the front page and only one women's story, when the U.S. women won the gold.

The *Santa Rosa Press-Democrat* came the closest to equitable coverage. Men's stories outnumbered women's stories 21-14, for 60 percent of the stories. Men's inches were 399-227.5(64 percent) and total inches were 858-700.5 (55 percent). The *Press-Democrat* had six men's stories on the front page and four women's.

The data in the coverage of women's hockey shows that although men's stories substantially outnumbered women's stories, the papers did on average give strong presentation to women's hockey as evidenced by the fact that women's total inches were substantially more per story than men's.

However, overall, in the rough and tumble world of hockey, newspapers only seemed to catch up with the unfolding drama once the U.S. women were in medal contention.

In figure skating, by contrast, the four papers heavily favored women's coverage. This bolsters the argument that papers support "gender appropriate" sports. If could be argued that the coverage was warranted because Americans Tara Lipinski and Michelle Kwan were battling for the women's gold medal, while there were no American men in the medal hunt. However, by that logic, it is hard to justify the comparative lack of coverage of women's hockey and alpine skiing.

Overall in the four papers, women's figure skating stories outnumbered men's stories 29-17, representing 63 percent of the coverage of men's vs. women's figure skating. The women's figure skating stories totaled 563.5 inches, for an average of 19.4

Table 7. Olympic Figure Skating Coverage

Newspaper	Story Counts		Column Inches		Total Inches	
	Men's	Women's	Men's	Women's	Men's	Women's
Independent Journal	5	13	99.5	202.5	251.5	389.5
Press Democrat	6	11	113.0	260.5	339.5	551.0
San Francisco Chronicle	5	3	71.0	52.0	150.5	109.0
San Francisco Examiner	1	2	16.5	48.5	20.0	97.5
Total	17	29	300.0	563.5	761.5	1,147.0

inches and 65 percent of the text inches. Men's stories measured 300 inches, for an average of 17.6 inches. Oddly, enough, men's stories got more prominent play than women's stories when headlines and photos were factored in. The total inches for women's figure skating 1,147, for 39.6 inches per story, or 60 percent. Men's total inches were 761.5, 44.8 inches per story.

In the four papers, women's figure skating stories made the front page nine times to six times for the men.

The *Marin Independent-Journal* had the largest disparity between men's and women's coverage. Women's stories outnumbered men's stories 13-5, for 72 percent of the stories. Women's text inches were 202.5-99.5 (67 percent) and total inches were 389.5-251.5 (61 percent). However, the *Independent-Journal* had four women's figure skating stories and four men's figure skating stories on page 1.

The *Santa Rosa Press-Democrat* had similar coverage. Women's stories outnumbered men's stories 11-6, for 65 percent of the stories. Women's inches were 260.5-113 (70 percent) and total inches were 551-339.5 (62 percent). The *Press-Democrat* had 11 women's stories on the front page and six men's.

The *San Francisco Chronicle*, unlike the rest of the papers and somewhat inexplicably, had more coverage of men's figure skating than women's. It also had much less coverage than the other publications. The *Chronicle* had five men's figure skating and three women's stories. The men's inches were 71-52 (58 percent) and total inches 150.5-109 (58 percent).

The *Chronicle* had five men's figure skating stories on page 1 and three women's stories on the section front.

(Note, Tara Lipinski's gold medal victory in the women's finale was run on page A-1 of the *Chronicle*.)

Alpine skiing also showed an unusual bias toward men's coverage. The papers in this study had more coverage of men's alpine skiing, which appears to be an odd editorial decision given the inspiring story of American Picabo Street. Plagued by knee injuries at different times in her career, Street made a triumphant return to the Olympic stage with a victory in the women's super giant slalom, then barely missed the bronze medal in the women's downhill. There were no similar stories in the men's competition. It was best remembered for a spectacular crash by Hermann Maier and Alberto Tomba sitting out the finals of the men's slalom.

Overall in the four papers, men's alpine skiing stories outnumbered women's stories 22-12, representing 67 percent of the coverage of men's vs. women's alpine skiing. The men's alpine stories totaled 326.5 inches, for an average of 14.8 inches and 62 percent of the text inches. Women's stories measured 199.5 inches, for an average of 18.1 inches. The total inches for men's alpine skiing 749.5, for 34.1 inches per story, or 58 percent. Women's total inches were 546, 49.6 inches per story.

Table 8. Olympic Alpine Skiing Coverage

Newspaper	Story Counts		Column Inches		Total Inches	
	Men's	Women's	Men's	Women's	Men's	Women's
Independent Journal	8	4	106.0	54.0	221.5	132.0
Press Democrat	7	4	132.5	77.0	303.5	275.0
San Francisco Chronicle	5	3	64.0	50.0	148.0	116.0
San Francisco Examiner	2	1	24.0	18.5	76.5	23.0
Total	22	12	326.5	199.5	749.5	546.0

In the four papers, men's alpine skiing stories made the front page 11 times to five.

Although, as the numbers indicate, women's stories were longer and contained more art and graphics than men's stories, it still is puzzling that overall, men's coverage was more than women's, considering the varying degrees of success and likely interest within the United States.

Picture this

It is said that a photo is worth 1,000 words, which would be about 25 inches of text, but for this thesis, I decided to use simpler math. Like stories, pictures were coded as either male, female, both or neutral.

Olympic photos were equitably distributed on page 1 with 49 men's photos on section fronts and 38 women's photos. These numbers (56 percent men, 44 percent women) match the U.S. men's and women's participation rates. The four papers also combined for 14 both-gender Olympic photographs, most depicting either the opening and closing ceremonies or pairs figure skating. However, a strong case could be made for higher photographic representation for U.S. women considering their success compared

to men. Also note that these numbers do not reflect photos that appeared on the front pages of news sections.

The *Santa Rosa Press-Democrat* was the only paper to have more women's Olympic photos than men's both on the front pages and inside. Overall, the *Press-Democrat* had 20 women's photos and 18 men's photos on page 1. Thus women were represented on 53 percent of the page 1 photos compared to men. The *Press-Democrat* also had four both-gender and one neutral Olympic photos on page 1, plus three both-gender and two neutral non-Olympic photos.

The *San Francisco Chronicle* had 13 men's photographs and 10 women's photos. Thus men were represented in 56 percent of the page 1 photos compared to women. The *Chronicle* also had two both-gender and two neutral Olympic photos on page 1, plus one neutral non-Olympic photo on page 1.

The *San Francisco Examiner* had very little Olympic coverage on its fronts, making comparisons difficult. On its three front sections on Olympic days, it had one photo each from the opening and closing ceremonies, plus a photo of Italian skier Alberto Tomba.

When inside photos were compared, the disparity between non-Olympic photos grew, but the difference decreased among Olympic photos.

Among the four papers, Olympic photos were equitably distributed inside with 96 men's photos and 92 women's photos. These numbers (52 percent men, 48 percent women) actually exceed women's participation rates.

The *Press-Democrat* had 56 women's Olympic photos and 47 men's photos. Thus women were represented by 54 percent of the inside photos compared to men and 48

percent of all inside Olympic photos. The *Press-Democrat* had 13 both-gender and one neutral Olympic photos inside, plus one both-gender and two neutral non-Olympic photos.

CONCLUSION:

Analysis of newspapers' coverage of the Olympics shows both how far women have come and how far they have yet to travel to gain equitable treatment from newspapers. Equitable coverage in terms of numbers of stories and column inches in special events is certainly a positive step. But it remains essentially an occasional blip on the radar that occurs on every couple of years.

Women deserve year-round coverage that in some way reflects their commitment and excellence in sport, their ever-increasing participation levels and to a certain degree the interest they generate or could generate if given a chance among fans and the sporting public.

In terms of commitment, excellence and participation, there is little doubt that women are making huge strides on the sports landscape. The achievements of the U.S. women's teams in recent Olympics and in the Women's World Cup of soccer prove that women can be successful and impressive athletes. That U.S. women have outperformed men as a whole in these different venues attests to the level of United States women's sport.

Much of the inequity of coverage of the women's hockey teams in the Olympics, derives from their relative anonymity outside of the Olympics. Whereas the Olympic men's teams have a built in public relations machine in the NHL, the American women's hockey team had very little exposure and played few games before the Olympics, except

for a pre-Olympic tournament with Canada. Once the Olympics were over, the U.S. team went back to training with few opportunities to build on the momentum created by its success in Nagano. With no league or information network to till the ground and create excitement before and after the Olympics, the women's team could only create a brief flurry of interest, despite its gold medal performance. Thus Cammi Granato and Sandra Whyte never got the chance before or after the Olympics to receive the exposure of Brett Hull and Dominik Hasek. As a result, it only makes sense that Cammi Granato is noted for being the sister of San Jose Shark player Tony Granato, as happened in a *San Francisco Chronicle*. Although Cammi Granato is probably a better player than her brother, as an NHL player Tony is the Granato people in the Bay Area know about.

Events such as the Women's World Cup and the Winter and Summer Olympics show that women's sports events can generate bursts of enormous interest and excitement. And, as this study shows, with several remarkable exceptions, newspaper coverage adequately represents and highlights women's achievements in selected instances. But what those events fail to show is whether women's sports can sustain those levels of interest.

Kerri Strug was a hero and a portrait of courage in the Atlanta Olympics. And she hasn't been heard from since.

The story of the U.S. Women's basketball team in Atlanta created tremendous interest in the game. And yet, the subsequent failure of the American Basketball League indicates that the "next step" for women in sports is tricky at best. The complicity of newspapers and other media in this equation is equally murky. Was the ABL, lacking the

endorsement and television backing of the rival Women's National Basketball Association, doomed to fail from the outset? Possibly.

Certainly liberal feminist theory, as descended from the Enlightenment and the values of individual liberty rooted in the writings of John Milton, John Stuart Mill, Mary Wollencroft, Sarah Grimke and others, would argue that women have the same inalienable rights as men (Messner & Sabo, 1992). As a result, it looks at the devaluation of women in society and seeks equity (Coakley, 1994) or, more precisely, "full and equal participation for girls and women" (Lenskyj cited in Coakley).

A liberal feminist would see the disparity of coverage as sexist and discriminatory and would seek equal treatment and recognition of women's achievements as a moral obligation and an issue of ethical treatment. Exclusion of women from the sports section would be seen as an issue of most male editors' bias.

Some suggest, with scientific support, that mere exposure to women's sports could increase its acceptance. Dr. Mimi Murray, a former president of the National Association For Girls and Women in Sport, says,

> There is a principle in psychology that indicates that more exposure one has to the unfamiliar, the more familiar it becomes, and the more one begins to like it. So we need to encourage more coverage of women's sporting events and applaud those journalists who represent women in sport as they should be -- as athletes (Fiege, 1991, p.1).

Equitable and unbiased coverage of women's sports in newspapers during the Olympics is but the first step. But until overall news coverage of women's sports events gains something approaching equity in the mainstream press, the Olympics will remain as anomalies, bright shining examples of what sports coverage could be -- but isn t.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Bryant J. (1980) A Two-Year Selective Investigation of the Female in Sport as Reported in the Paper Media, *Arena Review*, 4, 2, May p. 32-44.

Coakley, J (1994) *Sport in Society*, St. Louis, Mosby -- Year Book Inc.

Duncan, M.C., Messner, M.A., Williams, L., Jensen, K., Amateur Athletic Foundation *Coverage of Women's Sports in Four Daily Newspapers"* Amateur Athletic Foundation of Los Angeles, January, 1991.

Eastman S and Billings A. (1999) Gender Parity in the Olympics, Hyping women athletes, favoring men athletes *Journal of Sport and Social Issues*, 23, 2, p. 140-170.

Fiege, B. (1991) Women's Media Coverage: A Current Look, *CAHPERD Journal*, 53, 6, p. 1-2.

Giobbe, J., (1996) Women's Sports Coverage Unfair, says panelist, *Editor & Publisher*, 129 (21) p. 13.

Kinnick, K. (1998) Gender bias in newspaper profiles of 1996 Olympic athletes: A content analysis of five major dailies, *Women's Studies in Communication*, 21 (2) p 212-237.

Koppett L. (1981) *Sports Illusion, Sports Reality*, Boston MA. Hougton Mifflin.

Mellen G. (2000) At Play in the Field of the Word, A Content Analysis of Women's Sports in Selected San Francisco Bay Area Newspapers , Unpublished Masters Thesis, University of Missouri.

Messner M. & Sabo D. (1992) *Sport, men and the gender order: critical feminist perspectives*. Champaign, Ill. Human Kinetics Books.

National Collegiate Athletic Association (1999) *NCAA Sports Participation on the Rise*, Indianapolis, Ind.: Author

National Collegiate Athletic Association (1999) *NCAA Gender Equity Study*, Indianapolis, Ind.: Author

National Federation of State High School Associations (1999) *High School Athletics Participation Reaches All-Time High,* Kansas City, Mo.: Author

Neuwirth R. (1998) What do readers want? Surprising answers in Augusta, Ga. *Editor & Publisher*, 131 (4) p. 11.

Silverstein, L. (1996) Full-Court Press: The New York Times coverage of the 1995 Women's NCAA Tournament, Paper presented at Association for Education in Journalism and Mass Communication conference, Anaheim, CA. August 10-13, 1996)

Theberge N, and Cronk A. (1986) Work Routines in Newspaper Sports Departments and the Coverage of Women's Sports, (p289-298) In Birrell S.L. and Cole, C.L. (Eds.) *Women, Sport and Culture,* Champaign, IL., Human Kinetics Publishers.

Theberge N. (1991) A Content Analysis of Print Media Coverage of Gender, Women and Physical Activity, *Journal of Applied Sport Psychology,* 3, 1 March, p. 36-48.

Wann D., Schrader M., Allison J., McGeorge K., (1998) The Inequitable Newspaper Coverage of Men's and Women's Athletics at Small, Medium and Large Universities, *Journal of Sport and Social Issues,* 22 (1) p. 79-87.

Woolard H. (1983) A Content Analysis of Women's and Girls' Sports Articles in Selected Newspapers , Unpublished Masters Thesis, University of Iowa

NAMING RAPE VICTIMS AND SURVIVORS: A U.S. NEWSROOM POLICY STUDY, 2000

Kim E. Karloff

Assistant Professor of Journalism
California State University, Northridge
Department of Journalism

Contact Information:
Email: kekarloff@onebox.com
Mail: 30 Broadway, Los Gatos CA 95030
Phone: 408.399.9241

Presented to the Commission on the Status of Women
Association for Education in Journalism and Mass Communication
Conference: August 7, 2001
Washington, D.C.

NAMING RAPE VICTIMS AND SURVIVORS: A U.S. NEWSROOM POLICY STUDY, 2000

> The name of the woman was not used in the article. She is called 'the victim.' I want to give her a name, a face, a history. Whenever I see the words *the victim*, I want to fill in the blank. It is enough, I remind myself, to remember that she is not a blank. I know there is a good reason for the missing name. It protects her. The fact that this protection is necessary is proof, if ever one was needed, that there is still a widespread stigma for victims of rape, a stigma that is reinforced by the accumulation of unnamed names in our newspapers.
>
> *-- Nancy Venable Raine in "After Silence: Rape and My Journey Back"*[1]

Traditionally, editors of U.S. newspapers have withheld the identification of rape victims, unless the victim was well-known (as in the 1991 case of William Kennedy Smith and Patricia Bowman)[2] or unless the victim was murdered (as in the 1975 U.S. Supreme Court case of Martin Cohn and his daughter Cynthia Cohn).[3] As media scholars Maggie Thomas, Tommy Thomason, Paul LaRocque, Samuel Winch, Frank Thayer, Steve Pasternack, and Carol Oukrop point out, most editors do not publish the names of rape victims/survivors. In a 1982 survey of editors, Oukrop reported that 68 percent of

---

[1] Raine, "After Silence: Rape and My Journey Back," (New York: Crown Publishers, Inc., 1998), 90.

[2] Here it was the Kennedy name that made the headlines. Bowman is the Florida woman who accused William Kennedy Smith, Senator Edward Kennedy's nephew, of rape in April 1991. Bowman's identity was first revealed by *The Globe*, a nationally circulated tabloid based in Boca Raton, Florida. See Fox Butterfield and Mary B.W. Tabor, "Woman in Florida Rape Inquiry Fought Adversity and Sought Acceptance," *The New York Times*, 17 April 1991, 17A.

[3] In Cox Broadcasting Corp. v. Cohn, 420 U.S. 469, 95 S.Ct. 1029 (1975), the Supreme Court refused to allow tort recovery for invasion of privacy arising from the broadcast of a rape victim's name taken from a court record. Cynthia Cohn was the rape and murder victim. Her father, Martin Cohn, later filed suit against the press for invasion of privacy.

the editors said names of rape victims should not be published.[4] In a 1990 survey of editors, Winch reported that 43.6 percent of the editors said that rape victims should be named only in exceptional cases (ie: celebrity, well-known in community, murdered, etc.).[5] In a 1992 study of 90 daily newspapers with circulations of more than 50,000, Thayer and Pasternack reported that only one newspaper in their study routinely published the names of rape and sexual assault victims.[6] And in a 1994 survey of more than 500 newspaper editors across the United States, Thomason, LaRocque and Thomas reported that in 14 different rape coverage scenarios, editors were still reluctant to print the names of rape victims:

> In the rape situations presented, more than half of the editors said they would either definitely or probably use the victim's name in only three cases – if the victim were also murdered, if the victim asked to be identified, or if the victim "went public" in some way. In 10 of the 14 cases, less than 10 percent of the editors said they would definitely print the victim's name.[7]

While a few newspaper editors do choose to publish the names of rape victims/survivors, this is not the standard practice, according to these and other studies of newspaper editors and their newsroom policies on rape victim identification.[8]

---

[4] Carol E. Oukrop, "Views of Newspaper Gatekeepers on Rape and Rape Coverage," (Manhattan, Kansas: Kansas State University, October 1982), photocopy, 21.

[5] Samuel P. Winch, "On Naming Rape Victims: How Editors Stand on the Issue." Paper presented at the AEJMC national convention, Boston, Mass., 1991.

[6] Frank Thayer and Steve Pasternack, "Policies on Identification of People in Crime Stories," Newspaper Research Journal, vol. 15, no. 2 (Spring 1994), 59. Thayer and Pasternack found that in cases where the victim "goes public by choice," 75.6 percent of the newspaper editors in the study said they would then publish the name of the victim. They also reported that "about one in four dailies said they never print such names, no matter what."

[7] As quoted in Maggie Thomas and Tommy Thomason, "Newspapers, TV Rarely Name Victims of Sex Crimes, Study Shows," Newspaper Coverage of Rape: Dilemmas on Deadline (Oklahoma City: Ethics and Excellence in Journalism Foundation, 1996), 45. See also Tommy Thomason, Paul LaRocque and Maggie Thomas, "Editors Still Reluctant to Name Rape Victims," Newspaper Research Journal, vol. 16, no. 3 (Summer 1995), 42-51; and Dick Haws, "Rape Victims: Papers Shouldn't Name Us," American Journalism Review (September 1996), 12-13.

U.S. Newsroom Policy Study, 2000

There have been times when the press took exception to this general practice of not naming names -- the Patricia Bowman/William Kennedy Smith case and Desiree Washington/Mike Tyson[9] case being the most contemporary examples. On the other hand, the Central Park jogger case provides an illuminating example of how the press more often chooses to protect the victim's privacy and not to print the name of a sexual assault victim.[10] As media scholar Jay Black has said: "Most of us wish the news media did not disrupt the status quo or cause any discomfort or pain, but they often do, in their effort to create the greater good of informing and educating the citizenry. It goes with the territory."[11]

The following newsroom policy study focuses on whether or not the major newspaper in each state has a policy regarding the naming of rape victims, and what that policy says and/or what that policy allows its newspaper editors and reporters to cover in

---

[8] Joe Goodman, "We Name Names: Here Is Why We Do It," ASNE Bulletin, (July/August 1991), 19. See also Maggie Thomas, Tommy Thomason and Paul LaRocque, "Newspaper Coverage of the Smith/Bowman Rape: To Name or Not to Name the Victim?" Southwestern Mass Communication Journal, vol. 10, no. 1 (1994); Dick Haws, "A Qualitative Study: *The New York Times*, Patricia Bowman and William Kennedy Smith," Newspaper Research Journal, vol. 14, nos. 3 and 4 (Summer-Fall 1993), 137-145; and James Burgess Lake, "Of Crime and Consequences: Should Newspapers Report Rape Complainants' Names?" Journal of Mass Media Ethics, vol. 6, no. 2 (1991), 106-118.

[9] Desiree Washington was the woman raped by heavyweight boxing champion Mike Tyson in 1991. Upon Tyson's release from prison in March 1995, the *Sunday London Times* ran this caption: "Washington: forgotten." (19 March 1995, 19A).

[10] The 28-year-old New York woman who eventually came to be known as the "Central Park jogger" first made headlines in April 1989 after she was raped, sodomized and assaulted by at least six youths in New York's Central Park. See William Glaberson's "Times Article Naming Rape Accuser Ignites Debate on Journalistic Values," *The New York Times*, 13 June 1990, 3B; as well as Chapter 6 of Helen Benedict's "Virgin or Vamp: How the Press Covers Sex Crimes," (New York: Oxford University Press, 1992), 189-249.

[11] Black, "Rethinking the Naming of Sex Crime Victims," Newspaper Research Journal, vol. 16, no. 3 (Summer 1995), 99.

reporting on the crime of rape and/or sexual assault. This particular study was shaped by discussions with several colleagues following a panel presentation at the 1998 AEJMC National Convention in Baltimore, Maryland, on the news coverage of women. The four questions sent to each of the newspapers were most influenced by the 1994 survey of newspaper editors conducted by Thomason, LaRocque and Thomas, as well as by discussions with Carolyn Okazaki, a California State University at Northridge Counseling Services counselor and coordinator of the university's Project ACT, and Holly Wolcott, a police reporter with *The Los Angeles Times*. A pilot study made up of three questions was conducted in August 1998. On August 13, 1998, the three-point questionnaires were emailed to 20 daily newspapers listed in the 1997-98 Society of Professional Journalists' Internship Directory.[12] Based on feedback from Wolcott and eight of the respondents, a fourth question was added to the final questionnaire.[13] The questions posed in the current study:

- What is your newspaper's policy regarding the naming of a rape victim/survivor of a sexual assault?
- Who implemented your paper's rape victim identification policy? When? Under what circumstances was the policy implemented (ie: was it prompted by a particular incident or story)?
- What is the exact wording of your paper's policy?

---

[12] "1997-98 Society of Professional Journalists' Internship Directory," (Greencastle, Indiana: Society of Professional Journalists Reports, 1997).

[13] According to Roger Wimmer and Joseph Dominick, "Mass Media Research: An Introduction," (New York: Wadsworth Publishing, 1997), 151: "Self-administered questionnaires should be pretested with the type of respondents who will participate in the actual study." Such pretesting, as outlined by Wimmer and Dominick, was performed for the 2000 study. The gathering of data was also performed ala Wimmer and Dominick's instructions, 151-152, 161.

- What are your views regarding the naming of rape victims in the press? Should a victim's name be published? Why or why not?

Method

Questionnaires were emailed on November 3, 2000, to 54 daily newspapers listed in the 1999 Editor & Publisher International Yearbook.[14] The questionnaires, which targeted the largest newspaper in each of the 50 states (plus Washington, D.C., and two newspapers each in the states of California, Florida and Texas), were addressed to one of the following: the managing editor of the newspaper, reader advocate or ombudsperson, city editor or news editor, according to the most recent website addresses. A second round of emailing was sent to non-respondents on Nov. 14, 2000.

Of the 54 total questionnaires sent, 26 usable questionnaires were returned for a response rate of 48.148 percent. A similar response rate was reported in the three other major studies of newspaper policies on rape and rape coverage. In Oukrop's 1982 survey of a random sample of newspaper gatekeepers the response rate was 41.9 percent;[15] in Thayer and Pasternack's 1994 survey of daily newspapers the return rate was 47 percent;[16] and in Thomason, LaRocque and Thomas' 1994 study of newspaper editors the response rate was 38.6 percent.[17] According to Wimmer and Dominick, the average response rate for a mail survey is about 47 percent.[18] The current study then, with a

---

[14] "Editor & Publisher International Yearbook," (New York: Editor & Publisher, 1999).
[15] Oukrop, "Views of Newspaper Gatekeepers on Rape and Rape Coverage," 21.
[16] Thayer and Pasternack, "Policies on Identification of People in Crime Stories," 58.
[17] Thomason, LaRocque and Thomas, "Editors Still Reluctant to Name Rape Victims," 44.
[18] Wimmer and Dominick, 161. See also Don Dillman, "Mail and Internet Surveys: The Tailored Design Method," 2nd ed., (New York: John Wiley & Sons, Inc., 2000), most notably chapters 4 and 11.

response rate of 48.148 percent, falls well within the acceptable range established by these previous works.

Table 1: Newsroom Policies on Rape Victim Identification

	Percent
Policy is absolute: Do not name rape victims.	23.07
Policy is to not publish the name of a rape victim unless:	
■ ***victim is murdered***	7.69
■ ***victim asks for or consents to identification***	50
■ ***victim is well-known***	3.85
■ ***other media have already identified victim***	3.85
■ ***it is an "exceptional case"***	11.54
	N = 26

Findings

Not one of the 26 newspapers responding indicated that it routinely publishes the names of rape and/or sexual assault victims. However, 50 percent (13 out of 26) said they would publish the name of a rape/sexual assault victim if the victim asked for or consented to the publication of his/her name. As one West Coast editor put it: "We do not identify victims of rape, sexual assault, sexual battery or child molestation. We may name sex crime victims who expressly give permission for their names to be used or who come forward to talk publicly about their experience. When we do name such victims, we should include a boilerplate sentence that explains why we are doing so." In cases where the rape/sexual assault victim does not consent to identification, but another news

medium publishes or broadcasts his/her name, only one newspaper editor said they would then publish the victim's name. Two editors said the exception to their no-naming policies was in the case of murder. One editor noted the U.S. Supreme Court case *Cox Broadcasting Corp. v. Cohn* as an example of this exception. Only one editor said their newspaper's policy would allow for publication of a rape victim's name in the case of the victim being well-known or a celebrity. And nearly a quarter of the editors (23.07 percent) said they never print such names, no matter what. Their policies are absolute. "We do not name victims of rape."

Table 2: Percent of Newsrooms With Written Policy on Naming Rape Victims

	Percent
Policy on naming part of newspaper's guidelines or stylebook:	61.54
Policy on naming not part of written guidelines, but "generally known" by staff:	38.46
No policy on naming rape victims:	0
	N = 26

Nearly 40 percent (38.46 percent) of the daily newspapers surveyed have no written policy regarding the identification of rape victims. This percentage is similar to the findings of Thayer and Pasternack, who in a 1992 study found that:

> About 4 in 10 dailies surveyed have no such written set of guidelines, leaving editors to rely on common newsroom custom and case-by-case deliberations. Some editors said that, although their newspaper has no written guidelines, the actions an editor should

take in such cases are well understood.

In the study at hand, of the newspapers without written guidelines most said their decisions are made by the paper's top editors on a "case-by-case basis." One newspaper's city editor replied: "Long-time employees say it (the paper's practice to not name rape victims) has been the policy for at least 30 years, but I've never seen a copy of the policy. It's told to reporters and editors."

The majority of the newspapers, however, did have a written policy either as part of their newsroom guidelines or published in the paper's stylebook. According to Tom Shine, assistant managing editor of *The Wichita Eagle* of Wichita, Kansas, his newspaper's policy to not identify rape victims has been in place since the 1980s. In 2000, the policy was reiterated in "*The Eagle's* 2000 Ethics Policy":

> Our first objective should be to treat people with dignity and respect. We need to be sensitive when seeking interviews or using photographs of those affected by tragedy or grief. Remember that private citizens have a greater right to control information about themselves than do public officials. *The Eagle*'s policy is not to identify victims of a sex crime, or family members of the victim if doing so will expose the identity of the victim. If you think a particular case warrants an exception, check with your editor. We also should not identify victims of crime if we believe the subjects will be in danger if we print their names and addresses.

In Utah, James E. Shelledy, editor of *The Salt Lake Tribune*, said that their naming policy was not implemented until the early 1990s, when Shelledy was hired as the paper's editor. At the time, *The Tribune* did not as a general practice name rape victims, but there was no formal policy. *The Tribune*'s policy, published in 1998, reads:

> Do not identify victims of sexual assaults unless they give us their permission to do so or you are directed to do so by the editor.

> Juvenile offenders normally are not named except in cases where they are tried as adults or the crime with which they are charged is particularly heinous.

John McIntyre, assistant managing editor of *The Baltimore Sun*, said his newspaper's rape victim identification policy has been in place since at least 1958 (as he indicated in the photocopy of two pages from the paper's stylebook[19] of that era). The 1958 policy read:

> Care should be taken that the living victim of a sex crime not be identified by too detailed a description. In the case of a high school girl who has been raped, for instance, it is sufficient that the general area of the city in which she lives be mentioned rather than the exact block.

According to McIntyre, *The Sun*'s policy was revised in the first edition of the paper's guidelines book that came out "about 1993 or 1994." The current version (published on January 7, 1997) reads:

> Victims:
> a. Names of victims are to be included in crime stories, along with the generalized community addresses (Mount Vernon, for example) of living victims. We will also state the location of the crime. In order to make the story as clear to as many readers as possible, it is often appropriate to include a neighborhood name or broader geographical identification (for example, Otterbein, west of the Inner Harbor.)
> b. As a matter of routine, all reasonable efforts should be made to interview crime victims and their families.
> c. Exceptions:
> 1) Victims of sex crimes are not to be identified in crime stories or trial reports. Their addresses should be provided only in very general terms (for example, A Towson woman ...). On rare occasions – if, for example, the purported victim holds a news conference or appears on a talk show – he or she should be identified by name. In cases where an alleged victim is the

[19] See "Style Book," (Baltimore, Maryland: Sun Papers of Baltimore, 1958), 4.

> plaintiff in a civil suit against the alleged abuser, the reporter and editors of department-head rank or higher should weigh the circumstances to determine whether disclosure of the plaintiff's name is appropriate.
> 2) Minor children who are victims of child abuse are not to be identified, nor are family members or neighbors whose identities might be used to identify the child. In some cases, this means we will not name the person charged with the crime. Only the most general addresses should be used in these cases.
> 3) The Police Blotter and similar listings need not include victims' names.
> 4) Further exceptions to the general rule of naming victims may be granted by the editor or the highest-ranking editor on duty if there is reason to believe that public identification will expose the victim or witnesses to significant harm. Any staff member who is aware of such a possibility should report it to his or her editor.[20]

In Ohio, *The Cleveland Plain-Dealer*'s policy "has remained virtually unchanged in the entire tenure of our oldest editors, which means that it has been in place since at least 1950," said Ted Diadiun, assistant managing editor. The wording of the paper's current policy:

> We do not publish the names of victims of rape or other victims of sexual attack except in very extraordinary circumstances. The decision to publish such names will be made only by the most senior editor who can be contacted.
>
> Extraordinary efforts must be made to reach the editor if such a decision is being considered.
>
> In the interest of a logical extension of protecting the names of rape victims and victims of attempted rape, we will omit the name of a person filing suit to recover damages as the result of a rape or attempted rape. This is to protect the privacy of the victim and preserve the right to file civil suit without fear of embarrassment.
>
> If a case ever arises where there could be justification for using the name, the editor will consider arguments for an exception.

[20] "Baltimore Sun Guidelines for Writing & Editing," (Baltimore: Sun Papers, 1997), 44-45.

Such editor-granted exceptions are noted in other newspaper's policies as well. At *The Omaha World-Herald* in Nebraska, the policy to not name victims of rape has "been in effect for at least 25 years," according to Larry King, executive editor. The wording of the policy from the current staff guide:

> *The World-Herald* usually does not reveal the identities of people who are victims of sex crimes. Exceptions can be made, but the identities of victims of sex crimes cannot be published in staff-written or wire-service stories without thorough discussion with the assistant managing editor for news and the managing editor.

King said he has seen the paper make only three types of exceptions to this policy:

> When a sexual assault victim becomes an activist on the issue; when a murder victim has been raped; and when the victim of a related crime – a severe beating, a kidnapping, a robbery – has already been identified in the newspaper and the fact that a rape also occurred does not immediately come out. Then we make the decision on a case-by-case basis. If we find out quickly – within a day or two – and/or the other crime is not a major, page-one story, we will quit naming the victim, even if we have done so once or twice. We have had a few major cases, however, when the fact of the rape has not come out for several days or weeks and the identity of the victim already has been widely reported. Then it becomes a question not whether to name the victim but whether to report the rape. We usually hold off reporting the rape unless or until that comes out during the course of a court hearing or trial.

Two of the largest daily newspapers in the United States, *The Los Angeles Times* and *The New York Times*, have rape victim identification policies that are quite general in nature. As Allan Siegal, assistant managing editor of *The New York Times*, explained: "The phrasing is intentionally generalized because we want to engage the thoughtful attention of top editors each time the question arises, rather than allow varying interpretations of my more junior members of the staff."

According the Siegal, the policy "has existed informally for many years. It was refined in the 1980s by Max Frankel, who was then our executive editor, and refined again after the William Kennedy Smith prosecution in 1991. Widespread distress at our identification of the complainant in that case led to our tightening the notion of what circumstances might cause us to print such a name."[21] *The New York Times*' policy reads:

> Most often *The Times* shields the identity of a sex crime complainant, but rare circumstances may warrant an exception. Every decision to divulge such an identity or to withhold it should be discussed with a masthead editor or with the head of the news desk.[22]

The policy at *The Los Angeles Times* is similarly brief:

> *The Times* does not name rape victims in most cases. Any exception to this standard, for whatever reason, must be approved by the editor, the managing editor, the associate editor or the senior editor.[23]

Editors at *The Los Angeles Times* said the only exceptions they were aware of was in cases in which the victim came forward and agreed to be named.

Do the managing editors, assistant managing editors and ombudspersons who responded to this study agree with their newspapers' policies? What are their views regarding the naming of rape victims in the press? Most of the editors responding to this study's questions thoughtfully addressed personal views, professional views and, in the majority of the responses, the realities of the societal stigma often associated with the crime and its victims. Several of the editors' responses follow.

---

[21] See also "The Trust: The Private and Powerful Family Behind *The New York Times*," (New York: Little, Brown and Company, 1999), 621-624, 674, 828.
[22] From "*The New York Times* Manual of Style and Usage," (New York: Crown Publishing/Random House, 1999).
[23] From "*Los Angeles Times* Style and Usage Guide," (Los Angeles: The Times Mirror Company, 1995), R1.

Tom Shine, assistant managing editor of *The Wichita Eagle*:

> I agree with our policy. I think rape still carries a special stigma in our society. Running a victim's name only victimizes that person again. Some would argue that running rape victims' names, as we often do with other victims of violent crimes, would help erase that stigma. I'm not sure I agree with that.

Larry King, executive editor of *The Omaha World-Herald*:

> Although we as editors know there should be no stigma attached to a rape any more than to any other crime against a person, we know that stigma exists in the minds of many of our readers and of many victims themselves. I've heard the argument that the news media, by treating rape victims differently, help perpetuate the stigma. Perhaps. In this chicken-or-the-egg question, however, our position will be that with the relatively few exceptions, we will not name sexual assault victims.

John McIntyre, assistant managing editor, *The Baltimore Sun*:

> Some of my colleagues oppose the withholding of any kind of information, on the ground that our job is to provide it and not show favoritism. But the policy reflects that to be a victim of a sex crime carries some social stigma – whether one thinks that should be so or not – and it is therefore appropriate to spare the victims embarrassment.

Ted Diadiun, assistant managing editor, *Cleveland Plain-Dealer*:

> I believe that the names of victims – or alleged victims – of rape and sexual assault should be withheld from publication during all phases of a criminal action. It is still a crime that carries with it such a stigma that some victims would be reluctant or refuse to pursue charges against their assailants if they knew their names would be in the newspaper. I would not want to hinder their attempts to bring criminals to justice.
>
> However, I do not agree with our policy to withhold the names of alleged rape victims in civil trials. Civil trials can be initiated by anyone, with any motive and without proof of probable cause, and I think it is unfair to name the defendant without naming the plaintiff.

Kelly Bostian, news editor, *Fairbanks Daily News-Miner*:

> I think there is some merit to the argument that publishing names of rape victims destigmatizes the crime. I also worry about the fairness, or unfairness, in naming the accused but not the accuser. However, I

> know through many conversations with readers in this town that such a policy would undoubtedly cause some harm to families and victims themselves, and perhaps cause some victims to avoid reporting the crime for fear of publicity.

Larry Olmstead of *The Miami Herald*:

> I think it (not naming surviving victims of sexual assaults) is the right, wise and compassionate wise policy, followed by most responsible newspapers in America, and that such an approach has stood the test of time.

Mike Casey, assistant city editor, *Kansas City Star*:

> Rape victims should not be named because of the crime's trauma.

Michele McLellan, special projects editor, *The Oregonian*:

> I endorse the practice of not naming or otherwise identifying a rape victim most of the time. Generally, I would consider exceptions in two areas: The victim is OK with being identified and understands the potential impact; and not identifying the victim would distort the story in a way that could harm public understanding (the wife of a local judge is raped, for example).

Carroll Ann Kimsey, newsroom manager, *The Idaho Statesman*:

> Each case is an individual matter and should be handled as such. You should know that I work as a rape crisis advocate and would just as soon never publish a victim's name, area where he/she lives, or any other personal information, so when we have these discussions in the newsroom I am always the victim advocate – above and beyond the public's need/right to know.

Peggy Sagen, editor of the *Rapid City Journal*:

> Personally, I think the adult victim of a sexual assault should be named if a paper names the victim of any other kind of assault. Not naming rape victims perpetuates the stigma attached to a crime of violence. Will I change our policy? Probably not, based on community standards. Will I print a story using the name of a victim willing to go public? Yes. Would I go to great lengths to protect the identity of a child victim of sexual abuse? Yes.

Louise Seals, managing editor, *Richmond Times-Dispatch*:

> I'm torn. I understand the argument that identifying victims would help remove some of the stigma associated with sexual assault, but I'm not sure it's valid. On the other hand, we are finding more and more people, especially women, who are willing for their names to be used, especially for an in-depth article, as opposed to a police blotter item.

Candace Page, assistant managing editor of Vermont's *Burlington Free Press*:

> I think we are evolving towards a time when such victims will be identified. We are finding that in the best publicized cases – ones where the victim gets lots of support from her family, friends and the community – victims now are willing to be identified. Should a victim's name be publicized? Yes, whenever possible. Putting a name and a face to the crime serves the purposes of good journalism and the social purpose of removing the stigma that attaches to rape victims.

James Shelledy, editor of *The Salt Lake Tribune*:

> At the present, rape is not universally considered a crime of violence. As long as some still see it as purely a sexual crime, then the name of the victim ought to be protected. Hopefully in time, the crime will be accepted for what it is and unfair stigmas will be a thing of the past. Perhaps then, we can treat coverage of rape the same as any other crime of violence.

Allan Siegal, assistant managing editor, *The New York Times*:

> It is clear that society heavily penalizes a sex crime victim or complainant by 'blaming the victim' or subjecting the person's life to merciless and often unwarranted public scrutiny. On the other hand, sex crimes are often the only ones in which the accused is named and the accuser remains anonymous – a state of affairs that offends civil libertarians and can lead to abuses. ...
>
> It is in society's interest to remove the stigma that attaches to a complaint of rape or sexual assault, so that victims can freely allow the use of their names, as in other crimes. But it is unrealistic to pretend that that has happened or will happen soon.

Conclusions

Based on this study's findings, most daily newspaper editors support employing and maintaining policies to withhold the names of rape/sexual assault victims. However, 50 percent of the daily newspaper editors said they would make an exception and name the victim if she or he asked for or consented to identification.

Responses in support of naming rape victims with their consent mirror the conclusions of William Cote and Roger Simpson in their work, "Covering Violence: A Guide to Ethical Reporting About Victims and Trauma":

> Rape survivors who want to come forward, be named, and talk about their experiences should be supported. We strongly believe, however, that journalists may harm women, men, and children who are raped – and survive – if their names are used in news reports without their consent. Trauma persuades us that names should be withheld.[24]

While most of the editors surveyed remarked upon the social stigma associated with victims of rape and/or sexual assault, only three of the editors said anything about the actual trauma or violence to victims/survivors of such a crime. As Mike Casey of the *Kansas City Star* so succinctly put it: "Rape victims should not be named because of the crime's trauma." As Cote and Simpson imply in their work, future studies might well address reporters' and editors' understanding of the nature of this crime as well as the level of their professional education/training on the subject.

As Cote and Simpson note:

> Rape recovery involves struggling against a raging current of misperceptions about the assault and its victims. The survivor finds her suffering 'edited' in the words and responses of others,

[24] Cote and Simpson, "Covering Violence: A Guide to Ethical Reporting About Victims and Trauma," (New York: Columbia University Press, 2000), 229-230.

> then confronts distorted representations of rape in the media. No amount of clarity or accuracy in news reporting will end the trauma of someone who has been raped, but care in reporting may avoid the infliction of fresh wounds through stories that ignore or misrepresent the survivor.[25]

Such care was the focus of Nancy Venable Raine's work in her book, "After Silence: Rape and My Journey Back." The premise of Raine's work is to give voice to the "unspeakable" by telling the story of her rape and confronting the stigma that so often surrounds the victims and survivors of rape. Raine addresses the often-felt brutality of public disclosure (and exposure) of rape through a brief retelling of the William Kennedy Smith/Patricia Bowman rape case. Raine knows victims often are blamed for these crimes. She also acknowledges that the issue of privacy in rape cases is an emotionally charged one "that divides journalists, law-enforcement officials, feminists and rape victims themselves."[26] Raine's belief parallels the responses of the majority of daily newspaper editors in this study. Most daily newspaper editors say they agree with policies to not name victims of rape, but that they would make an exception to this policy if the rape victim consented to his/her name being published. As Raine points out: "'The victim' is a woman with a name – and a legacy of terror. Both belong to her."[27]

While few editors specifically addressed a victim's real-life trauma, almost all of them were aware of the issues that often served to harm such victims upon publication of their identities.

---

[25] Cote and Simpson, 164.
[26] Raine, 91.
[27] Raine, 92.

While media scholar Jay Black has noted that those in the news media "are not sure how to handle the options before them,"[28] when it comes to the reporting of rape and sexual assault -- including whether or not to identify the victims of violent sex crimes -- I think the responses of the editors in the Newsroom Policy Study support the notion that journalists, at the very least, are open to consent being a prime condition for the publication of a rape victim's identity. In doing so, many of these journalists appear to be embracing the press's "real" social responsibility. As Marian Meyers,[29] Helen Benedict and others have agreed, press freedom may very well be sacrosanct to democracy, but this should not keep journalists from listening to and addressing the potential harms served victims of sexual violence via dogmatic adherence to the press' First Amendment rights. Journalists, this study seems to indicate, are beginning to do just that.

---

[28] As quoted in Black's "Rethinking the Naming of Sex Crime Victims," Newspaper Coverage of Rape: Dilemmas on Deadline. (Oklahoma City: Ethics and Excellence in Journalism Education, 1996), 14. Black is the Poynter-Jamison Chair in Media Studies and Press Policy at the University of South Florida and founding co-editor of the Journal of Mass Media Ethics.

[29] See Meyers, "News Coverage of Violence Against Women: Engendering Blame," (Thousand Oaks, California: Sage, 1997).

Portrayals of Wife Abuse in the New York Times 1915 & 1925

Ginger L. Park
Kansas State University

105 Kedzie Hall
Manhattan, KS 66506-1501
785-532-3965
gpark@ksu.edu

Presented to the Commission on the Status of Women,
Association for Education in Journalism and Mass Communication,
annual convention, Washington, D.C., August 2001

Introduction

Husbands have beaten wives throughout history in all cultures. Instances of wife abuse are noted as long ago as the Roman Empire. Before the mid-1800s wife beating in America was condoned. In fact in 1824 the Supreme Court of Mississippi supported the right of men to chastise their wives.[1] Unfortunately the issue of wife beating, spouse abuse, or domestic violence before 1960 has only been examined by a few scholars, and the media's portrayal of wife abuse before 1960 has been largely ignored.

David Peterson Del Mar is one of the few scholars who has examined the history of wife abuse. He studied Oregon divorce records from the 1840s to 1970 to examine changes in wife abuse and changes in society's views of wife abuse. Del Mar found that the nature of violence varied with the changes in society's value of self-restraint and with the changes in the relationships with friends and neighbors. Violence increased as people became more reluctant to intervene in each other's lives.

Elizabeth Pleck examined changes in the social policy of family violence from Colonial times to the 1980s. She found that, "Inattention to the problem of domestic abuse lasted from about 1680 to 1874 and from 1890 to 1960. The first signs of declining attention are easy to detect: ministers, writers, or judges would urge a return to a more private family life or argue that the state should refrain from interfering in the family."[2]

While there is still debate on the amount of influence the media has on public opinion and personal actions, it is generally accepted that the media does have some influence on society and does reflect the beliefs and activities of an era. Michael Schudson wrote, "When the media offer the public an item of news, they confer upon it public legitimacy. They bring it into a common public forum where it can be discussed by a general audience. They not only distribute the report of an event or announcement to a large group, they amplify it."[3]

Since wife beating has always been present in the United States it is important to examine how the media have portrayed the issue historically. Such an examination will offer insight into intimate relationships during the period and of the importance of women's rights and safety to society. It is especially important to examine how the issue of wife beating was portrayed to a general audience. This portrayal may have affected how and if women sought help if they were victims of domestic violence. This portrayal may have affected how the men who beat their wives viewed themselves and how socially acceptable they believed their actions were. This portrayal may have affected public opinion of wife beating, which in turn would have affected court rulings on wife beating. This portrayal may have affected how supportive women were of others who were victims. And this portrayal may have affected women's self-worth.

This study will examine the New York Times to determine how it portrayed victims, perpetrators and wife abuse in general in sample years before and after a major turning point in women's history. This study will focus on wife abuse and not domestic violence or family violence, which includes wives abusing husbands, abuse of children and the elderly. As Michele Bograd notes in Feminist Perspective on Wife Abuse:

> Feminists argue that such terms (as domestic violence) obscure the dimensions of gender and power that are fundamental to understanding wife abuse. Generic terms ignore the context of the violence, its nature, and consequences, the role obligations of each family member and the different mechanisms or transactional sequences that lead to various forms of abuse.[4]

Since social change does not occur immediately, the years 1915 and 1925 were chosen for this study. This is five years before and five years after the passing of the Nineteenth Amendment, which gave women the right to vote in the United States.

The Reform Movement

Women's struggle for the right to vote began in the mid-1800s. The women's reform movement encompassed several goals including equal pay, eight-hour workdays, suffrage and temperance. According to Elizabeth Pleck there was an attempt by some in the women's movement to address the issue of domestic violence. "In the 1850s Elizabeth Cady Stanton and Susan B. Anthony, leaders of the woman's rights movement, sponsored but failed to pass legislation to add physical cruelty as ground for divorce in New York state."[5]

In the late 1880s the women's movement grew from hundreds to thousands of supporters. In the early 1900s suffragists at the state level held open-air meetings, staged mass parades, and held impromptu rallies.[6] Some people considered these activities controversial because they took women away from their domestic duties.

Indeed the suffrage movement and the passing of the Nineteenth Amendment were seen by some as having a greater impact on society than just the right to vote. According to Buhel & Buhel, journalist Walter Lippmann was one of these people. "He saw that the demand for the right to vote was, in a larger sense, the insistence upon public recognition that women no longer lived (if they ever had lived) in a sheltered existence of sentimental nineteenth century romance."[7]

After the passing of the Nineteenth Amendment many women became more concerned with their place in the public sphere and grew less concerned with their domestic lives. Feminist scholar Mary Fainsod Katzenstein argues: "The 1920s looks to me like a period of intense activism, aimed at achieving ever increasing autonomy for women, broadening the spheres within which women can live their daily lives. This is not a period in which women call for a return to the home–to the obligations of

mothering. It is a decade in which women's pursuits proliferate, their social and political commitments expand."[8]

According to Del Mar men "expressed anxiety over the shrinking gap between women's world and their own."[9] When examining the period between the world wars, Del Mar wrote, "Men found in the movement of women toward political, economic, and social equality and in their own contradictory reactions to modernity fuel for both instrumental and affective violence."[10] Instrumental violence is intended to punish and keep women obedient. Affective violence is strictly out of anger or dislike not related to the woman's actions.

One of the largest changes in women's roles in the 1920s was their move into the workforce, which caused them to spend less time at home. By 1929 almost 200 women held administrative and supervisory positions in the federal government.[11] Not only were women joining the workforce, some of them were becoming leaders.

These changes in women's roles and the broadening of their activities may have affected not only their domestic tranquility, but also the way the media portrayed women. Women's new voice in politics gave them a new importance in society and may have changed the public opinion of how they should be treated. This examination of the portrayal of wife abuse at such a critical time in women's history could offer clues about how this new woman's right may have affected media coverage of women's issues.

Also this new law may have caused a rift between husbands and wives, which may have caused more instances of wife abuse. Robert Whitehurst's "Violence in Husband-Wife Interaction" discusses changes that may increase domestic violence. "...changes which bring about greater equality between the sexes (such as changes in legal rights, increases in female employment, and economic and technological changes

…) will result in strain and frustration for males attempting to retain their superior positions."[12] Will this strain become evident in mainstream media?

The Era Press

Newspapers were the dominant medium that most Americans could afford in the early 1900s, and thus newspapers are a good place to start examining how these changes in women's roles affected their portrayal in the media. The early 1900s was a time of reform in newspapers; newspapers were exposing corruption and initiating social reform. Yet it was also the era of "Yellow Journalism." While the New York Journal and the New York World were in a fierce competition that resulted in sensationalist content during this time, the New York Times was focused on avoiding sensationalism and emphasizing facts and solid news reporting. Adolph S. Ochs, owner of the New York Times from 1896 to 1935, wrote a declaration of principle that contained the following:

> It will be my earnest aim that the New York Times give the news, all the news, in concise and attractive form, in language that is parliamentary in good society, and give it as early, if not earlier, than it can be learned through any other reliable medium; to give the news impartially without fear or favor, regardless of any party, sect or interest involved; to make the columns of the New York Times a forum for the consideration of all questions of public importance, and to that end to invite intelligent discussion from all shades of opinion.[13]

With its emphasis on facts and solid news, how did the New York Times portray wife abuse? Did its coverage seem factual? And, if it did, how did the Times portray and victim and the abuse in its description of the facts? This study aims to answer these questions and provide insight into the way that a mainstream newspaper represented

women's issues before and after the passing of the Nineteenth Amendment.[14] This examination of the New York Times is a starting point for the examination of media coverage of wife abuse historically.

Method

This study examines articles listed in the New York Times Index of 1915 and 1925 under the headings of assaults and murders that listed a male and female involved in violence. After initial examination, only articles that stated or implied a romantic relationship (marriage, engagement or dating) existed or had existed between the people involved in the violence were included. The term wife abuse is used throughout this study to apply to all romantic relationships mentioned above, not only husbands and wives. Articles in which the woman was the perpetrator were removed, which eliminated only a total of 30 articles from both years. These articles included in the sample were examined to discover how the victim and perpetrator were portrayed, what attributes of the victim and perpetrator were listed, how the event was described, and if the wife abuse was treated lightly or seriously.

Results

A total of 131 articles were examined from both years. Fifty-five articles from 1915 were examined and 76 articles from 1925. There are several possible reasons for this increase in articles on wife abuse from 1915 to 1925. The passing of the Nineteenth Amendment may have increased the focus on all women's issues. There may have been an increase in instances of wife abuse. This increase may be due to the increased size of the New York Times, which allowed the paper to include more news. Another reason for this increase may be World War I. Some scholars have found that there is an

increase in violence following a war,[15] and a few of the 1925 articles did note that the perpetrators were shell-shocked veterans.

The following lead was used in an October 18, 1925 article: "Pleas for mercy by his wife may save Stanley Aglak of Philadelphia, shell-shocked World War veteran, from prison after conviction of an attempt to kill her."[16] Another 1925 article used a similar description for a man who had stabbed his wife to death. "Rayburn is a veteran who has suffered from shell shock."[17]

While there were more articles in 1925, a smaller percentage of these articles involved the murder of the woman. In 1915 the woman was murdered in more than 70 percent of the articles. In 1925 the woman was murdered in slightly more than 60 percent of the articles. Of these articles on murder, more than a third of these were murder suicides in 1915. This dropped to less than a fifth in 1925.

Almost all the articles treated the abuse seriously, that is to say that the articles discussed the abuse, the perpetrator, and legal action being taken against the perpetrator. The other articles either implied that the perpetrator shouldn't be punished or that the abuse was minor and/or frivolous. Surprisingly the few stories that were not treated seriously were printed in 1925. This included an article with the headline "Pots or Politics, Is Choice: Husband, Finding Dinner Not Ready, Tells Wife to Take Pick."[18] The article stated that the husband was arrested on the wife's claim that he struck her after she told him she had been busy with political work and hadn't prepared dinner. This is also the only direct mention of a woman's political work being a factor in wife abuse.

Another article where the abuse was treated lightly was about a man who beat his wife because he was tired of having the same meal for dinner every night. "Stew Daily for 7 Years: Husband Complains for First Time and Gets Into Court"[19] was the

headline of this article. The perpetrator was described as temporarily crazed. The headline itself implies that the abuse was warranted, he should not go to court for his first complaint about the cooking. The headline omits the fact that his complaint was physical.

There was also an article on the court upholding a husband's right to spank his wife.[20] This was a very brief article that listed a judge's ruling of not guilty in a case of a husband charged with assault and battery. The judge was reported to have said that a husband could spank his wife under certain circumstances. The article did not describe what these circumstances were. This article upholds the belief that some amount of violence is normal in relationships.[21] This ruling also reinforces the concept that husbands have the ultimate power and authority in the home.

Portrayal of the Victims

The victims of wife abuse in 1915 were portrayed as innocent in 70 percent of the articles, if there was any portrayal of the victim. Several of the articles were brief one or two paragraph stories that stated only that violence had occurred and listed any charges. Many stories only focused on the perpetrator or the event and made very little mention of the victim. Seventeen percent of the 1915 articles examined that portrayed the victim, implied blame on the victim for provoking the attack or doing something to upset the perpetrator. These blame activities included starting an argument, disagreeing with the perpetrator, disobeying the perpetrator, having an affair or having previously abused the perpetrator.

For example, the headline of one 1915 article was "Lietner Confesses He Killed His Wife; Private Detective Admits Shooting Her After She Had Attacked Him with a Hatpin; Married Life Was Unhappy; Husband Says Trouble Started When She Began to

Spend Nights Away From Home."[22] This headline clearly blames the wife for provoking the attack and for starting trouble in the marriage. In another article a husband shot his wife because she would not follow the orders of his military superiors to leave the camp. The article stated that the husband had asked his wife to leave several times. When she would not leave the article implied that he was left with no other option. "... the officer fearing dishonor and degradation shot and killed her."[23]

The portrayal of the victim was very different ten years later. Only 34 percent of the articles portrayed the victim as innocent, compared to 70 percent in 1915. Twice as many articles in 1925 portrayed the victim as responsible for the attack. "Say Taxi Driver Shot Wife. Angered When She Asked How Much Money He Had Brought Home,"[24] was the headline of one of the 1925 articles that blamed the victim for the violence. The headline and article imply that the victim would not have been hurt had she not angered her husband.

Another 1925 article placed the blame on the victim with the following statement: "His wife after disagreeing with him as to where they should live, cheated him out of his savings with the help of another man, according to state police."[25] It was after this alleged cheating that the victim bought a gun and shot his wife. The same article also used a statement from a family friend, "Simonovitch parried that he always had to do the work and his wife had never been a help to him."[26]

The character of the victim and her behavior was also cited as the reason for abuse in another 1925 article. A husband shot his wife after finding his 3-year-old stepson alone in the apartment when he came home from work at four in the morning. According to the article the husband suspected that his wife was with rowdy friends in another apartment. The article also mentioned a letter found in the apartment addressed to the victim's parents from the husband. "An unmailed letter ... in which

he complained that his wife was 'smoking and using lipsticks and having a good time with men friends while he was working.'"[27] The use of this information helps blame the woman for the violence with no evidence or collaboration from others of her behavior.

There were a few positive portrayals of the victim as self-sacrificing, hardworking, devoted or trying to protect her children. One 1925 article described a scene where a man had killed two of his children and was attempting to kill the third when the wife intervened. "Rushing into the house, Mrs. Tierney saw the bodies of the two children on the basement floor, and her husband grappling with the older daughter. The woman succeeded in holding her husband until the daughter made her escape. Tierney then turned on his wife, slashing her across the hand with the knife before she was able to free herself."[28]

A new development in the portrayal of victims in 1925 was the idea of continuous abuse or victims living in fear. Only four articles portrayed the victim this way, but this idea of continuous abuse or previous fear of a spouse was never mentioned in 1915. One 1925 article stated, "Mrs. MacRobert testified that she was married in 1915 and since that time had been treated abusively by her husband."[29] The article continued by describing Mrs. MacRobert's testimony in which she discussed instances of abuse. In another 1925 article that described a husband killing his wife who he was separated from, the police discuss the wife's fear. "The woman had been in fear of Morano for some time, the police said, and kept the doors and windows locked."[30]

It seems as though the woman's relationship to a man was one of her most important attributes in 1915. More than half of the 1915 articles only listed the victim's name or her relation to the perpetrator. Attributes of the perpetrator were mentioned much more often. Just 27 percent of the 1915 articles listed only the perpetrator's name or his relation to the victim. For example, in a ten paragraph 1915 article about a man

accused of killing his three wives the following information is given about the women: "The Public Prosecutor gave the names of the three women and the dates of the alleged murders as Beatrice Mundy, July, 1912; Alice Burnham, December 1913; and Margaret Lofty, December 1914."[31] The following information is then given about the perpetrator: "Smith, according to the police, was born in London, the son of and insurance agent, and is 45 years of age."[32] In another 1915 article a woman killed by her husband is only referred to as his wife. "Crazed by illness and lack of sleep, Edward McManus, a footman, killed his wife, ..."[33] She was mentioned later in the story as follows: "McManus attacked his wife without warning, ..." These are the only times the woman is mentioned in this story.

There was a change in the number of victim attributes mentioned in 1925; 43 percent of the articles listed only the victim's name or relation to the perpetrator, an decrease from 58 percent in 1915. This change may reflect society's acknowledgement of women as more than just spouses or girlfriends. The importance of the victim's life is greatly diminished when the media only mentions her relation to a man. This change may be an example of the changing public opinion of women.

Portrayal of the Perpetrator

Profession, family, social prominence, education, honors, activities and past employment were listed more than twice as often for the perpetrator as for the victim in 1915. This remained almost the same in 1925, but the number of these attributes listed for the perpetrator dropped more than 10 percent. Drinking and previous legal charges of the perpetrator were listed in only about 2 percent of the articles in both 1915 and 1925. Surprisingly the appearance of the victim and the perpetrator was listed almost

equally as often in both 1915 and 1925. And in both years appearance was rarely mentioned.

In most of the articles the perpetrator was portrayed as not having planned the violence. The perpetrator was portrayed as insane, crazed, disturbed, depressed, troubled or temporarily insane in 27 percent of the portrayals in the 1915 articles. The perpetrator was described as having snapped. This portrayal of the perpetrator takes the blame off of him and places it on some uncontrollable condition. In 1925 this dropped to only 16 percent of the portrayals.

One of the 1915 articles used the perpetrator's mother's statement to explain the his actions. "She said Calvin had been on the verge of a nervous breakdown for some time and had contemplated retirement to a farm for rest and quiet. She told the police that her son's condition made itself apparent in hallucinations concerning his wife, one being that she was robbing him."[34]

Another 1915 article emphasized the quickness of the insanity. "The triple crime is attributed to a sudden attack of insanity."[35] This article does not cite who is stating this attribution of the attack of insanity. The only implication of why this was a sudden attack is that no other reason could be identified because the perpetrator was described as prosperous, happy in his domestic life and devoted to his wife and daughter. The headline of another 1915 article mentioneds the cause of insanity. "Kills Wife and 2 Children. Footman, Insane from Illness, Then Commits Suicide."[36] Here again there is little explanation of how this conclusion of insanity was made other than rumors that the man had been despondent. It seems as though insanity was used as the reason when no other reason could be found.

The Times was not much better at identifying who had diagnosed the perpetrator as being or having been insane, crazed or disturbed in 1925, but as stated

earlier they do list the excuse less often. One 1925 article does give a reason for the dementia, but no authority is listed as making this claim. "Believed to have been demented as the result of excessive drinking during the last few months, Anthony Tierney … today killed two of his children, attempted to kill a third and his wife, and then ended his own life."[37]

Of the 1925 insanity portrayals the reason for the insanity is often unrequited love, but again the insanity seems to be an assumption. Here is an example from an April 20, 1925 article. "Colonel Ossipoff is reported to have become crazed when Mrs. Hutareff persisted in spurning his attentions."[38] The way this sentence is phrased also goes back to the idea of blaming the victim, stating that she "persisted in spurning his attentions." The sentence seems less accusing when the word persisted is omitted.

Reasons for Abuse

This idea of blaming the victim also carried over to the reason given for the abuse. Only one 1915 article directly blames the victim by listing the reason for the abuse as the wife's nagging with the headline, "Shoots Wife for Nagging."[39] This increases slightly in 1925 to six articles that list the victim's bad behavior, the victim leaving the perpetrator, victim issuing a court summons to the perpetrator, the victim making a bad dinner or the victim being disobedient as the reason for the abuse.

"Thomas Chisari … told his flaxen haired wife … that he did not like bobbed hair. That settled it, as far as he was concerned. … The attack, she said, was committed when she returned home Friday night minus most of her hair, after she had finally succumbed to the temptation to shorten it."[40] This portion of a 1925 article not only implies blame to the victim for not following orders, but also makes a statement about the victim's weak character by using the words "succumbed to temptation." Another

1925 article stated, "Mrs. Franschino went to Harlem Court Wednesday and got a summons for her husband on a charge of disorderly conduct. It was returnable yesterday, and anger at her action is believed to have been the cause of his deed."[41] Mrs. Franschino was stabbed to death by her husband.

Blame is also implied in many of the articles that give the reason for the abuse as argument, jealousy or unrequited love. Twenty-five percent of the 1915 articles listed jealousy, rejection of love or an affair as reasons for the abuse. Argument was listed as the reason in 22 percent of the 1915 articles. In 1925 the order of the reasons switched. Twenty-four percent of the 1925 articles listed argument as one of the reasons for the abuse and 16 percent listed jealousy, rejection or an affair.

One 1915 article describes the reason for the attack this way, "Erdman met the young woman while on her way to church and pleaded with her to reinstate him in her good graces, but she refused. ... Erdman waited until the services began ... and fired, shooting the girl in the back."[42] Another 1915 article in which jealousy is the reason, read, "Jealous of his bride of two weeks, Joseph Dobas ... attempted to kill her at noon today. ... He said he saw her at 12 o'clock with a strange man."[43] Both these article segments imply that jealousy was a logical reason to kill a woman.

Almost one-sixth of the 1915 articles did not give a reason for the abuse or stated that the reason was unknown. This number doubled in 1925 with more than one-third of articles not giving a reason or stating the reason was unknown. Some of these articles tried to invoke sympathy for the perpetrator. One such article in 1925 focused on the perpetrator who was an Ex-Chief of Police and all the troubles he had faced. "Apparently deserted by his friends, Joseph Margerum, former Police Chief and political leader of Somers Point, near here, is in the county jail at May's Landing in default of $300 bail."[44] The article continues by mentioning that he is being held under a

magistrate who had been one of his supporters. The wife is mentioned only by name in this brief story.

Story Focus

The perpetrator was also more important than the victim as the focus of stories in 1915. In 1915, 11 percent of the articles had a focus on the perpetrator and only 2 percent on the victim. Some stories split the focus between more than one situation or person. In 1925 the focus on the perpetrator and victim was equal, they were each a focus of the story in 9 percent of the articles. While these percentages are small, it does represent a change to focus attention as often on the victim as on the perpetrator in 1925. The event was a focus of more than half the articles in both 1915 and 1925. Court proceedings, which included testimony, arraignment and sentencing, were a focus of more than one-fourth of the articles in both years.

Sensationalism & Editorializing

While the New York Times of the early 1900s was known for its lack of sensationalism, there were a few articles that mentioned the sensationalism or drama of the case. One article in 1915 stated, "The case promises to be the most sensational here since the trial of Dr. Crippen."[45] The case this article is referring to is the case of George Smith who was accused of killing his three consecutive wives for their insurance money and inheritance. Another 1915 article quotes a note found on the perpetrator. The note said, "I am going to take the creature with me that has caused me all this misfortune. I cannot live with her and I cannot live without her."[46]

A 1925 article also used a statement from a note left by the perpetrator. "Moral: Never trifle with a man's love."[47] Another note, this time left by the victim, in a March

24, 1925 story seems suspicious. The perpetrator, Bob Noonan, had killed himself and his lawyer gave the court the following note: "To Whom It May Concern: I, Catherine Dempsey, have been a lover of Bob Noonan for one year, and this I swear to God–no false god–I am writing this willingly. I am living with my husband for my baby's sake only, and I will go out with him until such time I will be with him always."[48] The article does state that this note was allegedly written by the victim.

A couple of the 1925 articles report that the judges of the cases reprimanded the perpetrator and insulted him in the courtroom. In one article the judge is listed as doubling the sentence after the wife's testimony and the judge, "characterized him as 'a brute' and advised the woman to obtain a divorce as soon as possible."[49] Another 1925 article described the judge's public humiliation of the perpetrator. The judge had witnessed the abuse and after finding him guilty, "ordered him to turn and face the spectators in the courtroom. ... 'Let them see the coward who beat this little girl, the mother of that coward's two-year-old son. Even jail is too good for you. ... You are a low and despicable character.'"[50]

Generally all the stories were told with straight facts and little editorializing. One story that did editorialize was a 1925 article about a husband who had given his wife a black eye and threatened his son with a razor. "The policeman gave his father a taste of his own medicine and then locked him up."[51] This statement implies the paper's support of the victim.

Some editorializing was done in both years by describing the event as a tragedy. The violent event was described as a tragedy twice as often in 1925 than in 1915. In 1915 less than 10 percent of the articles used the word tragedy to describe the event and in 1925, 20 percent described the event as a tragedy.

Conclusion

Overall wife abuse was treated seriously and written about fairly factually in the New York Times both in 1915 and 1925. There were several differences between the 1915 articles and the 1925 articles. The portrayal of the victim as innocent decreased dramatically from 1915 to 1925. The perpetrator was portrayed as insane or temporarily insane less often in 1925 than in 1915. In 1925 the number of articles that focused on the perpetrator or victim was equal, as opposed to 1915 when only one article focused on the victim. Another change in 1925 was the mention of continuous abuse or victims living in fear. Finally the abuse was described as a tragedy more than twice as often in 1925 than 1915.

The dramatic decrease of the portrayal of victims as innocent can be seen as a defeat or a victory. This change may represent that women after the Nineteenth Amendment were no longer seen as helpless victims but as participants in their own lives. This is not to say that victims deserve blame for what happens to them, but that women's innocence may no longer have been an automatic assumption. The defeat is that with this decrease of innocence there was a sharp increase in blaming the victim. Twice as many articles in 1925 blamed the victim for provoking the attack.

Another change from 1915 to 1925 was the decrease in the portrayal of the perpetrator as insane or temporarily insane. This is encouraging to see the perpetrator portrayed less often as overcome with an uncontrollable act that justifies the violence. Even in modern America there is an idea that society accepts rationalizations of abuse such as loss of control.[52]

Victims were the focus of as many articles in 1925 as perpetrators. In 1915 the perpetrator was the focus of the story six times as often as the victim. The new equality

in article focus may be a result of era social and political progress for women. The media may have begun every so gradually treating women more equally to men.

The concept of continuous abuse or the victim's fear of the perpetrator was seen in 1925, but not in 1915. Only four articles portrayed the victim this way, but this idea of continuous abuse or previous fear helps support the now commonly held belief that wife abuse is not usually a one-time incident, but an escalating problem. This new portrayal may have given support to others who were suffering abuse. Victims are believed to benefit from the understanding that they are not the only ones with this problem. This change may be a result of the reform era in which journalists were looking to correct the wrongs of society

The abuse was represented more often as a tragedy in 1925 than in 1915, which may reflect the increased importance of women outside the home. As women became more active in politics and the working world after the Nineteenth Amendment, public opinion of their value may have increased. It may have been viewed as more tragic for the women to have been hurt or killed.

Discussion

This study provides some evidence that the media's coverage of women did change after the Nineteenth Amendment. In most of the articles the changes were subtle, but this does imply that women and issues surrounding them were being treated with greater importance.

This study revealed many other issues that should be examined in early 20th century coverage of domestic violence. It would be interesting to look at articles in

which the woman was the perpetrator and compare the portrayal of both the victim and perpetrator in these articles to the portrayals examined in this study. Were women portrayed differently when they were the perpetrators? Were men portrayed differently when they were the victims?

The portrayal of women and abuse in other newspapers of this time period should also be examined to compare the results to this study of the New York Times. Examination of other types of publications, including newsletters and magazines, from both the mainstream press and alternative press would also add to this knowledge on the changing attitudes about women during the suffrage movement. Schudson and many other scholars state that the media does influence public opinion. This influence on public opinion is an important reason for continued research on media in history to increase our knowledge of society's past.

Family violence during this period should also be examined. The perpetrator in many of the articles in both years abused several members of the family. This is especially evident in articles about murder and murder suicides. The perpetrator often killed or tried to kill several members of his family or his entire family. It would also be interesting to compare this information to modern homicide statistics to see if there has been a change in the number of perpetrators who kill or attempt to kill more than one member of their family.

Another issue for further examination is the mention of ethnicity in articles on domestic violence and crimes in general. There was not any mention of ethnicity in the 1915 articles that were examined, but it was mentioned a few times in the 1925 articles. On article began with the lead, "From the crowded melting pot of the lower east side came yesterday a story of primitive and barbaric human passions which one might expect to find in a story dealing with European horrors, rather than in the actual daily

life of the city of New York in the year 1925."[53] The story then mentioned that the perpetrator was Rumanian and the victim Lithuanian.

As stated earlier, this study of the New York Times is only a beginning for the examination of the portrayal of wife abuse historically, and is intended to be a starting point for further research.

---

[1] Terry Davidson, "Wifebeating: A Recurring Phenomenon Throughout History", in *Battered Women: A Psychosociological Study of Domestic Violence*, edited by Maria Roy (New York: Van Nostrand Reinhold Company, 1977), 1-23.
[2] Elizabeth Pleck, *Domestic Tyranny: The Making of Social Policy against Family Violence from Colonial Times to the Present* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1987), 5.
[3] Michael Schudson, *The Power of News* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1995), 19.
[4] Michele Bograd, "An Introduction", in *Feminist Perspectives on Wife Abuse*, edited by Kersti Yllo & Michele Bograd (Newbury Park, CT: Sage Publication, 1988), 13.
[5] Elizabeth Pleck, *Domestic Tyranny: The Making of Social Policy against Family Violence from Colonial Times to the Present* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1987), 6.
[6] Mari Jo Buhle & Paul Buhle, *The Concise History of Woman Suffrage* (Urbana, IL: Univrsity of Illinois Press, 1978), 1-48.
[7] Mari Jo Buhle & Paul Buhle, *The Concise History of Woman Suffrage* (Urbana, IL: Univrsity of Illinois Press, 1978), 44.
[8] Mary Fainsod Katzenstein, "Constitutional Politics and the Feminist Movement", in *Voting and the Spirit of American Democracy*, edited by Donald W. Rogers (Urbana, IL: University of Illinois Press, 1992), 88.
[9] David Peterson Del Mar, *What Trouble I Have Seen* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1996),107.
[10] David Peterson Del Mar, *What Trouble I Have Seen* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1996),118.
[11] See note 6 above.
[12] Robert N. Whitehurst, "Violence in Husband-Wife Interaction," in *Violence in the Family*, edited by Suzanne K. Steinmetz and Murray A. Straus (New York: Dodd, Mead & Company, 1974), 75.
[13] Michael Emery & Edwin Emery, *The Press and America: An Interpretive History of the Mass Media* (Boston: Allyn and Bacon, 1996), 239.
[14] According to 8 above the New York Times had a daily circulation of 330,000 in 1921 and a Sunday circulation of 500,000.
[15] Dane Archer & Rosemary Gartner, "Violent Acts and Violent Times: A Comparative Approach to Postwar Homicide Rates," *American Sociological Review* 41 (6, 1976): 937-963.
[16] "Wife Pleads for Convicted Husband." *New York Times* October 18, 1925: 18.
[17] "Negro Held as Slayer of Wife." *New York Times* August 31, 1925: 6.
[18] "Pots or Politics, is Choice: Husband, Finding Dinner not Ready, Tells wife to Take Pick." *New York Times* August 11, 1925: 3.
[19] "Stew Daily for 7 Years: Husband Complains for First Time and Gets Into Court." *New York Times* April 3, 1925: 36.
[20] "Upholds 'Right' to Spank a Wife." *New York Times* April 15, 1925: 11.
[21] A. Jones, *Next Time She'll Be Dead: Battering and How To Stop It* (Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Periodical Press), 59-70.
[22] "Lietner Confesses He Killed His Wife; Private Detective Admits Shooting Her After She Had Attacked Him with a Hatpin; Married Life was Unhappy; Husband Says Trouble Started When She Began to Spend Nights Away from Home." *New York Times* September 1, 1915: 7.
[23] "Court-Martial for Herail: French Officer Who Killed His Too-Faithful Wife to Face Trial." *New York Times* April 6, 1915: 3.

[24] "Say Taxi Driver Shot Wife. Angered When She Asked How Much Money He Had Brought Home." *New York Times* March 9, 1925: 23.
[25] "Kills Child, Shoots Three, Ends His Life." *New York Times* July 21, 1925: 3.
[26] See note 18 above.
[27] "Stabs Wife to Death, Then Slashes Himself." *New York Times* October 15, 1925: 8.
[28] "Slays Son and Daughter." *New York Times* January 14, 1925: 12.
[29] "MacRobert Cruel, His Wife Testifies." *New York Times* May 5, 1925: 14.
[30] "Kills Wife and Son While They Sleep." *New York Times* December 21, 1925: 2.
[31] "Three of His Wives Died in Their Baths" *New York Times* March 24, 1915: 7.
[32] See note 27 above.
[33] "Kills Wife and 2 Children. Footman, Insane from Illness, Then Commits Suicide." *New York Times* November 5, 1915: 22.
[34] "billiardist Assails Wife." *New York Times* June17, 1915: 20.
[35] "Wipes Out His Own Family." *New York Times* October 10, 1915: 5.
[36] See note 29 above.
[37] See note 24 above.
[38] "Diplomat a Suicide, Had Shot a Woman." *New York Times* April 20, 1925: 3.
[39] "Shoots Wife for Nagging." *New York Times* November 26, 1915: 20.
[40] "Beaten, Says Bobbed Wife." *New York Times* August 31, 1925: 17.
[41] "Stabs Wife To Death for Summoning Him." *New York Times* October 23, 1925: 16.
[42] "Shoots Girl in Church." *New York Times* January 18, 1915: 3.
[43] "Shoots Bride in Street." *New York Times* October 29, 1915: 24.
[44] Ex-Chief of Police in Jersey Jail." *New York Times* December 4, 1925: 25.
[45] Try Man for Death of Brides in Bath." *New York Times* June 23, 1915: 7.
[46] "Leaves Warning to Others." *New York Times* September 29, 1915: 7.
[47] "Chemist Shoots Girl Instructor." *New York Times* January 8, 1925: 7.
[48] "Note in Dead Woman's Name." *New York Times* March 24, 1925: 2.
[49] "Bound and Lashed Wife." *New York Times* March 29, 1925: II 2.
[50] "Court Scores Wifebeater." *New York Times* April 4, 1925: 36.
[51] "Arrests His Father." *New York Times* July 22, 1925: 10.
[52] J. Ptacek, "Why Do Men Batter Their Wives?" In *Feminist Perspectives on Wife Abuse*, edited by Kersti Yllo & Michele Bograd (Newbury Park, CT: Sage Publication, 1988), 13.
[53] "Puts Woman, Alive, Into Kiln Furnace." *New York Times* September 23, 1925: 2.

A Descriptive Analysis of NBC's Coverage of the 2000 Summer Olympics

Submitted to the AEJMC

Commission on the Status of Women

C. A. Tuggle, Ph.D.
University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill
P. O. Box 3365
Chapel Hill, North Carolina 27599-3365
(919) 962-5694, phone (919) 962-0620, fax
catuggle@unc.edu

and

Suzanne Huffman, Ph.D.
Texas Christian University
TCU Box 298060
Fort Worth, Texas 76129
(817) 257-6557, phone (817) 257-7322, fax
s.huffman@tcu.edu

and

Dana Scott Rosengard
University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill
P.O. Box 3365
Chapel Hill, North Carolina 27599-3365
(919) 967-6680, phone (919) 962-0620, fax
danar@unc.edu

Abstract

This study examines the amount of NBC's 2000 Olympics coverage devoted to women's athletics. Analysis showed that women received proportionately less coverage in 2000 than they did in 1996 on the U.S. network, and that coverage focused on individual events, with women competing in team sports receiving relatively little coverage. As was the case in 1996, women who competed in 2000 in sports involving power or hard physical contact received almost no attention.

Introduction

Nearly 4,000 women competed in the 2000 Summer Olympics, the largest group of females ever, comprising nearly 40 percent of the competitors (Lewis, 2000). These Games included the first ever weightlifting competition for women. Weightlifting is but one of several women's competitions included in these Games for the first time in Olympic history. Triathlon, tae kwon do and modern pentathlon were new, and others sports added certain disciplines for women for the first time. Cycling added the women's 500-meter time trial; track and field added the women's hammer throw and the women's pole vault (Lewis, 2000).

The 2000 Olympics in Sydney marked 100 years of female Olympic participation. At the 1900 Olympics in Paris, France, 19 women competed in tennis and golf. Now women compete in all Olympic sports except boxing, wrestling and baseball. Of the 300 events on the 2000 program, 168 were for men, 120 were for women, and 12 were mixed (May-Mons, 2000, p. 7F).

The Olympics have changed greatly in 100 years. Women weren't allowed to compete in the first modern Olympics in 1896 because it was thought to be "inappropriate" for them to do so (May-Mons, 2000, p. 7F). The 1960 Games marked the first time women's events were televised into U.S. homes (Creedon, 1994), and both the number of women competing and the proportion of broadcast coverage devoted to them have increased with each successive Olympics (Leder, 1996). At the 1996 Summer Games in Atlanta, the U.S. women's gymnastics, basketball, soccer and softball teams played to full houses, won gold medals and made headlines (Eisenberg, 2000). The female audience for the Games continues to grow. And the majority of the audience for the 2000 Games was expected to be women (Eisenberg, 2000).

Literature Review

In one of the few studies to examine the coverage of men and women at the Olympics, Alexander (1994) found that although female athletes competing in the 1992 Summer Olympics were covered more extensively than are women in non-Olympic competitions, British television coverage of the Games nonetheless focused on men. More time was devoted to men's events, and male competition was more likely to be shown live and in its entirety, with women's competition more likely to be edited and shown later. Historically, women's team sports have been slower to gain acceptance at the Olympics than have individual sports (Leder, 1996).

In their content analysis of NBC coverage of the 1996 Summer Olympics in Atlanta, Tuggle and Owen (1999) found that women were covered extensively, but that coverage of women concentrated on individual sports such as swimming, diving, and gymnastics, to the exclusion of team events. They found that men's team competitions received substantially more coverage than did women's team events, and women in sports that involved power or hard physical contact between athletes received almost no attention. Tuggle and Owen (1999) also reported that many more men were used as on-camera sources and that most event announcers were male.

The degree to which the media cover female athletes helps mold society's view of female athletes and its perceptions of women in general. Media issues of status conferral, agenda setting, salience, and framing, all come into play. Sports media reflect, shape, and may even help create attitudes and values about what type of sports participation is appropriate and acceptable for females. Because female sporting events and female athletes are "grossly underreported" (Kane, 1989, p. 59), readers and viewers can come away with the impression that few women participate in sports, and that women who do participate in athletics are involved in individual, not team sports.

Newspapers, magazines, radio, nor television can cover all sports at all levels because of restrictions on space or time. Sportswriters and sportscasters must be

selective in what they cover because of these limitations and often base their coverage on the perceived level of reader or viewer interest (Belliotti 1983). Decisions by NBC network executives about which Olympics sports to cover and how extensively to cover them can reinforce pre-conceived concepts among audience members about which sports and which athletes really matter and create a self-perpetuating stereotype of women and sports.

Kane (1989) found that women in more "feminine" or "socially acceptable" sports such as tennis and golf received significantly more coverage than women who participated in "socially unacceptable" sports such as basketball or softball.

Alexander (1994) concluded that television ignores women's team sports, although it devotes a disproportionate amount of time to team sports. In addition, television's portrayal of women's sports reinforces stereotypes that suggest that female athletes should be glamorous and graceful and should not participate in sports that involve contact or which cause them to sweat. According to Alexander, this portrayal contributes to a social system that forces women to conform to social sanctions that shape their participation in sports. The message is that female sport is of little interest and female athletes are second rate. This can affect women contemplating or actually participating in athletics and how they view themselves and sport. Few people will choose to become involved in an activity that receives little if any social sanction.

Numerous researchers (Boutilier and SanGiovanni, 1983; Bryant, 1980; Duncan and Messner, 1994; Hallmark and Armstrong, 1999; Hilliard, 1984; Himmelberg, 1992; Lattimore, 1996; Messner, 1992; Tuggle, 1997; Tuggle and Owen, 1999) have found that coverage of women athletes pales in comparison to coverage of males in sports. This difference manifests itself in total column inches and running times, persons quoted, placement of articles and stories, presence and size/length and placement of an accompanying photograph or videotaped highlight, the range of sports depicted in photos

and tapes, and the size and content of newspaper headlines and magazine article titles. Media therefore frame female sports as less deserving of coverage than men's competition. Study after study has shown that female athletes are so underrepresented in the media that they are rendered almost absent from the sports world (Kane, 1989).

Messner (1992) concluded that sports news means men's sports news and that sport is a key component to our current gender order. "A key to whether or not increasing female athleticism will amount to a real challenge to sport's role in a system of masculine domination is whether and how the media cover girls' and women's sport" (Messner, 1992, p. 164).

Many feminists would agree that although trends toward equity in opportunity for male and female athletes are important, the current structure of sport and the role it plays in society must also change. Many people think of discrimination only when it takes the form of overt social barriers, failing to recognize the subtle forms of discrimination embedded in social ideology (Greendorfer, 1983). In contrast, many feminists see sport as a patriarchal institution created by men without regard to the existence and experience of women (Boutilier & SanGiovanni, 1983; Creedon, 1994; Duncan & Hasbrook, 1988; Penelope, 1990). How change should be pursued is open to debate, even among feminists. There is a wealth of literature about the variations in feminist thought (e.g. Alcoff, 1988; Altman, 1989; Jaggar, 1983; Offen, 1988), but for the purposes of this study Boutilier and SanGiovanni (1983) offer a useful outline of liberal feminist theory.

Liberal feminists see no inherent structural impediments to women's equality and expect that media coverage, prize money, and corporate sponsorship will naturally increase as girls and women achieve a longer history of participation in sports. Under the legislation of Title IX, liberal feminists argue for equal opportunity for women in sport; any benefits that males may derive from sports participation should be made available to females as well. Liberalism presupposes progress as an inevitable by-product of legal

and political reform. The thrust is toward seeking equal opportunity, but within what might be called "the male-dominated, winning isn't everything, it's the only thing" system. (For more on this perspective see Scott, 1971; and Friedan, 1981).

Coverage could change in coming years with the growth of women pursuing careers in sports journalism. Creedon (1993, 1994) found that more than one-third of the students enrolled in sports journalism classes at the major communications programs in universities across the country were females.

As with participation, the numbers of males and females watching sports are not grossly disparate. Fifty percent or more of the women in various industrialized countries report that they watch sports regularly (Cooper-Chen, 1994). ABC's 1992 Winter Olympic telecasts from Calgary marked what is believed to be the first time in television history that women made up the majority of the audience for a network sports telecast or series (Burnett, Menon, & Smart, 1993).

In this study we seek to examine the amount and scope of NBC's coverage of men and women in the 2000 Olympics and how that coverage compares to 1996.

The NBC network's coverage of the 2000 Summer Games came under fire from several quarters as the Games progressed and ratings declined (Lowry, 2000, p. 1). The dramatic time-zone difference, the 15-hour tape-delayed action, and the September start of a two-week, five-hours-a-night run were problematic for viewers.

NBC sports division president Dick Ebersol told interviewers that the Olympics have a greater impact "as TV fare" when the athletes and their sport are put in "context, through personality profiles" (Rating, 2000, p. 59). Nearly 150 personality features were worked into the 1996 coverage in an effort to attract female viewers who, according to network research, are more interested in stories than competition (Bianculli, 1996). NBC's Olympics coordinating producer for the 2000 Games described the 2000 audience

as "much more like the audience that watches 'ER' than the audience that watched a baseball game on Saturday afternoon" (Eisenberg, 2000, page 3F).

But some viewers objected to the emphasis in 2000 on feature stories compared to coverage of events. In a letter to The Seattle Times, one viewer wrote: "NBC seems to be putting more and more of these athlete stories to go with the actual events. I am told they do that to cater to the female population. Personally, I think that is nuts. Women want to see the events as much as men do" (McFadden, 2000, September 28).

Research Hypotheses

Based on the literature cited herein, the researchers are able to advance certain predictions about how coverage of male and female athletes in the 2000 Summer Olympics might differ.

Previous studies have found that television coverage of women's sports tends toward events such as tennis, golf, gymnastics, and ice skating, all involving individual competitors. NBC's coverage of the 2000 Olympics is expected to follow this pattern.

Hypothesis 1a: Coverage of women's events will concentrate on individual competition rather than team events.

Industry and academic research shows that the female audience for sports is growing. Network executives want to attract that audience. It seems intuitive that decision makers would try to attract more female viewers with more coverage of female athletes.

Hypothesis 1b: The proportion of coverage of women in the 2000 Olympics will be greater than that of the 1996 Olympics.

Duncan and Messner (1994) and Tuggle (1997) found that males are quoted more frequently than females in sports highlights programs, in addition to being the subjects of an overwhelming majority of the coverage. Although the amount of coverage of women competing in the 2000 Olympics is expected to be more balanced than that found in highlights programs in the past, the proportion of females as on-camera sources is expected to mirror that found in earlier studies.

> *Hypothesis 2*: Quotes will be more likely to come from male competitors, coaches, officials, and observers than from females in the same roles.

Kane (1989) and Tuggle and Owen (1999) found that women involved in sports that require physical bulk, power, and/or hard physical contact between athletes receive almost no coverage compared to women competing in what Kane called "socially acceptable" sports, such as gymnastics and swimming.

> *Hypothesis 3*: Coverage of power and contact sports will focus on males, with females involved in such events receiving relatively little attention.

The ranks of sports announcers and sports commentators have long been filled, to a large degree, by men. Although more women are studying sports journalism at colleges and universities (Creedon, 1994), those women who are hired as announcers are often placed in secondary roles.

> *Hypothesis 4a*: The televising network will use a higher proportion of male than of female announcers.
> *Hypothesis 4b*: The proportion of female announcers will be even lower in primary announcer positions.

Method

The sample consisted of video tape recordings of NBC's prime time Olympic coverage for the dates September 15 through October 1, 2000. Opening and closing ceremonies were not included in the analysis. The same was the case for segments that did not include direct participation by athletes, such as a feature about pin trading among fans or a story about the night-life in Sydney. Excluding such items and commercials left approximately 67% of evening programming subject to content analysis (42.9 hours of 64 total hours of coverage).

Once all data were collected, the content was coded. The unit of analysis was the broadcast segment.[1] Coding indicated the sport, the length of the segment, the type of presentation (event, interview, awards ceremony, etc.), the sex of the participants, the role of quotes sources (athlete, coach, sports official, etc.) whether the segment was presented live (or as live) or edited into condensed form, whether the competition involved physical power or unpenalized hard body contact as a primary component, and whether individual or team medals were at stake. In addition, coding indicated the job description of all speakers (anchor, reporter, etc.) and the speaker's sex. Coding was completed by two trained graduate students, under the direction of the primary author. To check intercoder reliability, each of the graduate students coded the items from a broadcast date previously coded by the other. This resulted in 831 item comparisons with disagreement on but 36 items for an intercoder agreement rate of 95.7 percent. The data were then subjected to chi-square or analysis of variance testing using SPSS 10.0 for Windows (1993).

[1] Broadcast segment is defined as coverage of a particular sport from a particular venue. The segment is considered to have ended when the venue changes.

Findings

This section presents the results of the hypotheses tests along with other findings. Hypothesis 1a predicted that coverage of women's events would concentrate on individual rather than team competition. It was supported. More than twice as much airtime went to women's individual events as to team events. The disparity was even greater when gymnastics was removed from the team category. Although a team medal was at stake for a portion of the competition, gymnastics does not meet the usual definition of a team sport, in which athletes compete simultaneously (such as in basketball or soccer) or in rapid succession (such as in swimming or track relays). The finding that individual women's competition received more coverage than women's team events is not surprising, because there were many more individual events than team events for women.

Males received more overall coverage, and men's team sports (not considering gymnastics) were covered more extensively than were women's team sports. This, again, is not surprising because men competed in nearly twice as many individual events as women did, but the number of team events for males was only slightly greater than the number of female team events. In the only team sport in which both the male and female teams from the United States enjoyed medal success, basketball, the men's team was afforded considerably more coverage than was the women's team (126 minutes to less than 3 minutes). Table 1 presents a comparison of airtime devoted to coverage of men and women competing as individuals or as teams.

Table 1/Event Coverage (in seconds)

Event Coverage	Male		Female	
Total	**81, 648**	**55.2%**	**66,363**	**44.8%**
Individual	55, 826	54.6%	46,329	45.4%
Team	25,824	56.3%	20,033	43.7%
Team without gymnastics	18,499	63.2%	10,759	36.8%
Basketball	**7,572**	**98.1%**	**144**	**1.9%**
Diving	**7,733**	**49.7%**	**7,919**	**50.3%**
Gymnastics	**16,157**	**44.9%**	**19,808**	**55.1%**
Individual	8,832	45.6%	10,535	54.4%
Team	7,325	44.1%	9.274	55.9%
Soccer	**497**	**66.9%**	**246**	**33.1%**
Baseball/Softball	**896**	**44.8%**	**1,106**	**55.2%**
Swimming	**13,714**	**58.4%**	**9,767**	**41.6%**
Individual	11,734	56.5%	9,049	43.5%
Team	1,979	73.4%	716	26.6%
Track	**24,840**	**60.2%**	**16,419**	**39.8%**
Individual	20,564	57.2%	15,378	42.8%
Team	4,276	80.4%	1,041	19.6%

NOTE: Combination sports (sports in which men and women compete as equals) = 6,334 seconds.

Hypothesis 1b predicted the proportion of women's coverage in the 2000 Olympic games in Sydney would be greater than the 1996 coverage in Atlanta. It was not supported. There was an 18.4% drop in television time devoted to the coverage of athletes and competition from 1996 to 2000, but coverage of men's events represented almost 4% more of the total coverage in 2000 than it did in 1996. Table 2 presents a comparison of airtime devoted to coverage of men and women competing in 1996 and 2000.

Table 2/1996 versus 2000 Event Coverage (in seconds)

Event Coverage	Male		Female		**TOTAL**
2000	81, 648	55.2%	66,363	44.8%	**148,011**
1996	95,460	52.6%	85,926	47.4%	**181,386**

In 2000, women competed in 41.66% of Olympic events. American women claimed 41.2% (40) of the nation's 97 medals. Hence, their medal success was proportionate to their participation. Teams consisting of men and women competing together or against one another (equestrian, shooting) netted five (5.2%) medals, with men alone claiming 52 (53.6%). If medal success were the only criterion for coverage, U.S. women should have received 41.2% of the total airtime. America's female athletes actually garnered 44.8% of the airtime, higher than medal success alone would warrant. However, amount of overall airtime is only one gauge of equitable treatment of women in sports.

Hypothesis 2 stated that on-camera comments would be more likely to come from male participants or observers. It was supported as male sources outnumbered female sources 192 to 136. Chi-square analysis revealed a highly significant difference between males and females as the first source quoted in a given segment ($\chi 2 = 9.507$, $df=1$, $p < .003$). There was no significant difference in the proportion of males and females who appeared as on-camera sources in subsequent positions, as approximately the same number of men and women appeared as second, third, and fourth sources. There were approximately equal numbers of quotes from male and female current athletes and family members of athletes, two of the three largest categories. However, the number of comments from sources in another of the three largest categories, current coaches, differed widely by sex. Current male coaches appeared 19 times, but current female coaches were used as sources on only two occasions. Table 3 presents a breakdown of on-camera sources by sex.

Table 3/On-Camera Sources

Category of Source	Source 1	Source 2	Source 3	Source 4	Total
Current Athletes	**194**	**43**	**22**	**9**	**268**
Males	113	25	10	3	151 (56.2%)
Females	81	18	12	6	117 (43.8%)
Current Coaches	**6**	**10**	**3**	**2**	**21**
Males	6	8	3	2	19 (90.5%)
Females	-	2	-	-	2 (9.5%)
Family	**5**	**9**	**5**	**0**	**19**
Males	4	4	0	-	8 (42.1%)
Females	1	5	5	-	11 (57.9%)
Total **(all categories)**	**214**	**71**	**32**	**11**	**328**
Males	130	42	15	5	192 (58.5%)
Females	84	29	17	6	136 (41.5%)

Hypothesis 3 predicted that coverage of sports involving physical bulk, power over an opponent or object, or unpenalized hard contact would concentrate on men. The difference based on sex was most noticeable. Discounting boxing and wrestling in which only men compete, coverage of men's sports involving physical bulk, power, or contact was much greater than coverage of women's events involving those characteristics ($\chi 2 = 10.075$, $df=1$, $p < .002$) Table 4 presents a comparison of airtime devoted to coverage of men and women competing in these sports.

Table 4/Event Coverage of Bulk, Power, and Contact sports (in seconds)

Event Coverage	Male		Female	
Weightlifting	1,067	97.0%	32	3.0%
Rowing	1,249	72.0%	500	28.0%
Judo	342	54.5%	286	45.5%
Boxing	*men's-only event*	---	*men's-only event*	---
Wrestling	*men's-only event*	---	*men's-only event*	---
Canoe/Kayak	*no recorded coverage*	---	*no recorded coverage*	---

Hypothesis 4a predicted a greater number of males in announcer positions. It was supported. NBC used 35 men and 15 women on-air throughout its 2000 Summer Olympic coverage. Of the 15 women, only one, Michelle Tafoya, was listed as a play-by-plan announcer, covering softball and rhythmic gymnastics. All other women in on-air positions were used as reporters and analysts. Men were the primary play-by-play announcers at the 26 other sporting venues.

Hypothesis 4b predicted that the proportion of female announces would be even lower in primary announcer positions. It was supported. NBC used a lone male, Bob Costas, to anchor its prime-time broadcasts. The network used an anchor pair for its late-night coverage, Jim Lampley and Hannah Storm, giving men a 2-to-1 edge in Olympic anchor slots.

Following this dominance of men, it should not be surprising that overwhelmingly, a man's voice was much more likely to be the first one heard when a new segment began ($\chi 2 = 939.01$, $df = 1$, $p < .001$). Analysis showed this to be the case not only for the first voice, but for the second voice ($\chi 2 = 357.06$, $df = 1$, $p < .001$) and third voice ($\chi 2 = 16.980$, $df = 1$, $p < .001$) heard as well. Only at position four was the

number of females roughly equivalent to the number of males. Table 5 presents the gender breakdown of sources of sound by order of appearance.

Table 5/ Order of Source Appearance by Gender (in number of appearances)

Order of Appearance	Male	Female
first	491	8
second	157	28
third	70	29
fourth	28	16

Conclusions and Discussion

As was the case in 1996, at first blush NBC's coverage of male and female athletes in the 2000 Summer games seem equitable, with females receiving more than their fair share of coverage based both on numbers of athletes competing and on overall medal success. But further analysis reveals a pattern that feminist observers of sports coverage have noted for decades. Typically, for female athletes to garner media coverage, even in the Olympics, they must be involved in socially acceptable individual sports, rather than in team sports. Women who take part in sports that involve either power or hard body contact are particularly unlikely to receive media coverage.

In the 2000 Olympics, four sports accounted for more than two-thirds of all coverage of women. In all four, the participants competed one at a time, even when a team medal was at stake, such as with swimming or track relays, or when the gymnastics team medals were up for grabs. Notably, the two women's team sports covered most extensively by the network, softball and soccer, do not involve unpenalized body contact.

One can argue whether basketball should or should not be considered a contact sport, and there is no way to ascertain if that factor affected NBC coverage of basketball.

However, the stark contrast in the amount of coverage of the men's and women's U.S. squads in basketball, the only team sport in which both U.S. teams won gold medals, reinforces the idea that success on the field or court is not enough for women to attract media attention. Though both the men's and the women's teams won gold, the "Dream Team" received 98 percent of the coverage devoted to basketball. The women's team barely showed up in prime time.

In two other team sports, a degree of direct comparison is also possible. NBC covered the gold-medal-winning women's softball team more extensively than it covered the baseball team, and both the men and women won gold. The women received about 22 percent more coverage than the men did. In soccer, the women's team won silver, yet received only half as much coverage as the men's team did. The men did not medal. One can only surmise what coverage patterns would have been like had the situation been reversed. The data in this study seem to indicate a continuing under-representation and trivialization of women's participation in certain sports. Of the 40 medals won by U.S. women, 29 came in the six most-covered sports: Swimming, diving, gymnastics, track, softball, and soccer. Those six sports accounted for more than 90 percent of NBC's coverage of women's sports. Female athletes in all other sports had to fight for less than 10 percent of allotted airtime. The female winners of 11 other medals, undoubtedly the top athletes in their sports in the world, received little if any attention from the televising network.

The disparity in coverage of men and women was particularly noticeable in two "power" sports, rowing and weightlifting. In rowing, U.S. women won two medals to one for U.S. men, yet received less than a third as much coverage. NBC devoted nearly

18 minutes of coverage to men's weightlifting, though no U.S. man medaled in the sport. Two U.S. women did earn medals, a gold and a bronze. Their success warranted less than one minute (32 seconds) of prime time coverage.

Men not only get more coverage, they are given more opportunity to speak about their accomplishments. The number of female athletes quoted mirrors the percentage of coverage they receive, just a bit more than 40%. Interestingly, it is primarily men who describe the accomplishments of both male and female athletes. Typically, viewers did not hear the voice of a female announcer or reporter until three men had already commented. Only one female handled play-by-play for the network. She covered two venues each involving only female athletes. At all other venues, the play-by-play announcer was male, as were most of the analysts for both men's and women's competition.

Decisions made by network executives regarding which sports to cover and how extensively to cover those competitions serve to reinforce the idea that women who participate in certain sports are somehow "different." NBC's coverage of the 2000 Olympics was, of course, an improvement compared to the time when women's participation in almost any sport was socially unacceptable. But in contrast to the proportional rise in coverage of women up to and including the 1996 Games, female athletes lost ground in 2000. Compared to 1996, NBC devoted less coverage to female athletes in the 2000 Games. Perhaps more noteworthy than amount of coverage is what is covered. Even today, it seems that women are accepted as athletes only if they continue to look and act as women are expected to look and act.

In keeping with the liberal feminist framework, this study suggests that it is possible to effect change within existing media and sports institutions. But to bring about change that goes beyond equity in the proportion of coverage, those who make coverage decisions must be made aware that the type of coverage they afford can serve to reinforce stereotypes and trivialize participation by female athletes in sports that are still seen by many in society as more appropriate for men.

None of the suggestions listed here is made out of a concern for "political correctness," but rather out of a concern for fairness and accuracy. NBC's coverage certainly shows the viewing audience that women can be highly successful in sports, but leaves the impression that women do, or should, compete in a limited range of sports. It also suggests that the audience the network was most interested in attracting – women – is much more interested in sports that involve grace and fluid movement than in sports in which athletes sweat, grunt, or try to exert physically mastery of an opponent or object. The success of women playing team sports or taking part in "power" sports at both the 1996 and 2000 Olympics may help to slowly change how some sportswomen are perceived.

Though NBC anchor Bob Costas noted during the 1996 Atlanta Games that it is an overstatement to say that the Olympics can change the world, coverage of female athletes, along with other societal forces, can help change attitudes about what is appropriate for women in the athletic arena. Boutlier and San Giovanni (1983) note that the media's treatment of the relationship between women and sport shapes the direction and content of that relationship. Television and other media should reflect the continuing advances of women in both individual and team athletics. As the network televising the

next several Olympics, NBC is well positioned to impact the growth and acceptance of women's athletics, particularly women's team sports.

Bibliography

Alcoff, L. (1988). Cultural feminism vs. post-structuralism: The identity crisis in feminist theory. Signs, 13, pp. 405-427.

Alexander, S. (1994). Newspaper coverage of athletics as a function of gender. Women's Studies International Forum, 17, 655-662.

Altman, K. (1989). Rhetorics of difference in feminist argument. In B. Gronbeck's (Ed.). Spheres of argument: Proceedings of the sixth SCA/AFA conference on argumentation. Annandale, VA: Speech Communication Association.

Belliotti, R. (1983). Sports, sex equality, and the media. In B. Postow (Ed.). Women, philosophy, and sport: A collection of new essays. Metuchen, NJ: Scarecrow, pp. 96-114.

Bianculli, D. (1996, July 31). NBC's coverage deserves fool's gold medal. New York Daily News, Television, p. 70.

Boutilier, M., & SanGiovanni, L. (1983). The sporting woman. Champaign, IL: Human Kinetics.

Bryant, J. (1980). A two-year investigation of the female in sport as reported in the paper media. Arena Review, 4, 32-44.

Burnett, J., Menon, A., & Smart, D. (1993). Sports marketing: A new ball game with new rules. Journal of Advertising Research, 33(5), pp. 21-35.

Cooper-Chen, A. (1994). Global games, entertainment, and leisure: Women as TV spectators. In P. Creedon (Ed.). Women, media, and sport: Challenging gender values. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage, pp. 257-272.

Cox, Ted. (2000, September 22). NBC coverage lacks surprise. Chicago Daily Herald. Sports Weekend section, page 1.

Creedon, P. (1993, Spring). Training women as sportswriters: Coverage of women in athletics. Journalism Educator, pp. 46-51.

Creedon, P. (1994). Women, media, and sport: Creating and reflecting gender values. In P. Creedon (Ed.), Women, media, and sport: Challenging gender values (pp. 3-27). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Duncan, M., & Hasbrook, C. (1988). Denial of power in televised women's sport. Sociology of Sport Journal, 5, pp. 1-21.

Duncan, M., & Messner, M. (1994). Gender stereotyping in televised sports: A follow-up to the 1989 study. Los Angeles: Amateur Athletic Foundation.

Eisenberg, John. (2000, September 13). Circle complete, women are now at the center. The Baltimore Sun. Sports, 3F.

Friedan, B. (1981). The second stage. New York: Summit.

Greendorfer, S. (1983). Shaping the female athlete: The impact of the family. In M. Boutilier & L. SanGiovanni (Eds.). The sporting woman. Champaign, IL: Human Kinetics.

Hallmark, James R., & Armstrong, Richard N. (1999). Gender Equity in Televised Sports: A Comparative Analysis of Men's and Women's NCAA Division I Basketball Championship Broadcasts, 1991-1995. Journal of Broadcasting & Electronic Media. Spring 1999, 43(2), pp. 222-235.

Hilliard, D. (1984). Media images of male and female athletes: An interpretative analysis of magazine articles. Sociology of Sport Journal, 5, 251-262.

Himmelberg, M. (1992, Spring). Sexism still rampant. Nieman Reports, 46(1), 38-41.

Jagger, A. (1983). Feminist politics and human nature. Totowa, NJ: Rowman and Allanheld.

Kane, M. (1989, March). The post Title IX female athlete in the media: Things are changing, but how much? Journal of Physical Education, Recreation, and Dance, 60(1), 58-62.

Lattimore, L. (1996, August). Let's go to the videotape: Gender bias in local television sports coverage. Paper presented at the national conference of the Association for Education in Journalism and Mass Communication, Anaheim, CA.

Leder, J. (1996). Grace and glory: A century of women in the Olympics. Chicago: Triumph Books.

Lewis, Michael C. (2000, September 21). Lifting Women's Sports: Forty percent of Oly athletes are female -- the most ever. The Salt Lake Tribune. Final section, page D10.

Lowry, Brian. (2000, September 29). Ratings Critics Missing Points. Los Angeles Times. Special Section; Part U; Page 1; Sports Desk.

May-Mons, Javonna. (2000, September 26). Women in the Olympics. Fort Worth Star-Telegram. Page 7F.

McFadden, Kay. (2000, September 27). NBC misses boat again by locking on Hunter story. The Seattle Times. Sports section, page C2.

McFadden, Kay. (2000, September 28). Mailbag full of commentary on NBC, CBC. The Seattle Times. Sports section, page C2.

Messner, M. (1992). Power at play: Sports and the problem of masculinity. Boston: Beacon.

Offen, K. (1988). Defining feminism: A comparative historical approach. Signs, 14, pp. 119-157.

Penelope, J. (1990). Speaking freely: Unlearning the lies of the fathers' tongues. New York: Pergamon.

Rating NBC's Games (2000, October 2). Newsweek, pages 59-60.

Scott, J. (1971). The athletic revolution. New York: Free Press.

SPSS 10.0 for Windows. (1993).

Tuggle, C.A. (1997). Differences in television sports reporting of men's and women's athletics: ESPN SportsCenter and CNN Sports Tonight. Journal of Broadcasting & Electronic Media, 41(1), 14-24.

Tuggle, C.A., & Owen, Anne. (1999). A Descriptive Analysis of NBC's Coverage of The Centennial Olympics. Journal of Sport & Social Issues, Volume 23, No. 2, May 1999, pp. 171-182.

TITLE IX BABIES, SPORTS MEDIA AND ATTITUDES TOWARD WOMEN IN SPORTS AND SOCIETY

Submitted to
2001 AEJMC CONVENTION
COMMISSION ON THE STATUS OF WOMEN
WASHINGTON, DC

By

Paula Whatley Matabane, Ph.D.
And
Bishetta D. Merritt, Ph.D.
Department of Radio, TV and Film
Howard University
Washington, D.C.

pmatabane@howard.edu
bmerritt@howard.edu

TITLE IX BABIES, SPORTS MEDIA AND ATTITUDES TOWARD WOMEN IN SPORTS AND SOCIETY

ABSTRACT

The 1990's are a watershed decade reflecting the impact of Title IX on American sports with unprecedented numbers of females participating. A study of 189 college students' use of sports media and participation showed females' positive attitudes toward women in sports and society were related to watching women sports on television; males negative attitudes were related to watching male sports on television and sports news.

Submitted by

Paula Whatley Matabane, Ph.D.
Bishetta D. Merritt, Ph.D.
Howard University
Dept. Radio, TV and Film
Washington, DC 20059.

TITLE IX BABIES, SPORTS MEDIA

AND

ATTITUDES TOWARD WOMEN IN SPORTS AND SOCIETY

Introduction

It is sobering to recall that barely 30 years ago, sex discrimination in sport was the norm even down to game rules that forbade women from playing full court basketball. Sex discrimination in sport was not illegal in the United States until passage of Title IX in the 1972 Education Amendments Act that prohibited discrimination on the basis of sex in the provision of athletics at institutions receiving federal funds. Up until the 1990's female participation in sport was minimal if not marginalized. The 1990's are the watershed decade reflecting the impact of Title IX on the shape and face of American sports. Research indicates that unprecedented numbers of females now actively participate in sport and physical activity at all levels (Women's Sports Foundation, 2000). Between the mid-1990's and 2000, two women's professional leagues, Women's National Basketball Association (WNBA) and the Women's United Soccer Association (WUSA) were established, immediately gaining a huge adoring audience especially among women. By the end of the 1999 season, 1.96 million fans had attended WNBA games. It took the men's National Basketball Association over 20 years to bring in more than 1.9 million fans over the length of a season (Ackerman, 1999). Perhaps ironically, NBA Commissioner David Stern is counting on the WNBA to create new fans or crossovers for the NBA thus helping shore up their sagging television ratings since the retirement of superstar Michael Jordan. These gains in the creation of professional women's sports and

the dramatic increase in women's participation in the 1996 and 2000 Olympics Games are directly attributable to implementation of Title IX.

This radical change in women's sports participation and interest raises the possibility of sport becoming a more important socializing factor in teaching women how to occupy a more dominant role in society and in redefining gender relations. Sport has long been recognized as a significant socio-cultural learning factor in the lives of males. Numerous sports television shows promote images of males as "weekend warriors" or "iron men." With the flood of professional and college women's sports on television one may expect a similar impact on females. Changes in gender attitudes related to sports activity and use of sports media should be evident among current college students, the first generation to have grown up entirely in school environments where women's sports are encouraged, supported, and validated. It is reasonable to expect that traditional stereotypes about women athletes, women's sports and women's role in society will be reduced among women involved in sport as participants or as fans. We also expect that men who are attentive to women's sport will hold beliefs that are supportive of female athletes and women's sports even if they maintain traditional beliefs about gender roles in society.

However, it is necessary to consider the nature and role of the media as significant mediating factors in the re-presentation and packaging of women in sports for mass consumption. The merger between media and sport has created one of the largest businesses in America. The television sports audience is so lucrative that Fox, CBS, ABC/ESPN paid 2.2 billion dollars to broadcast the 1998 National Football League regular season. Advertisers paid CBS 2.8 million

dollars per thirty-second commercial during the 2000 Super Bowl game (Schwartz, 2000). The women's sports market is relatively new but offers the potential for generating billions in the marketing of sports clothing, sports equipment, and other consumer items. Nike, Reebok and other sports apparel manufacturers are retooling their marketing approach to accurately target women. To that end, Reebok recently signed tennis star Venus Williams to a 40 million dollar endorsement contract, the highest ever for a female.

The media's history and perceived need to rely upon stereotypes as the means to capturing and maintaining its mass audiences may result in the retention of traditional gender stereotypes in and through women's sports coverage. For example, the Amateur Athletic Foundation of Los Angeles (1994) found that "gender was verbally, visually and graphically marked" by television announcers in women's basketball games. Denoting gender was almost never mentioned in men's basketball games, suggesting that media sports coverage may help reproduce gender differences, stereotypes and hierarchy despite women's gains in the sports world. New marketing strategies to sell sports apparel to women also mark gender. Nike's new women's sports line is entitled "Nike Goddess" and Reebok says it is seeking a "more fashion conscious woman to join our brand" (Wong, 2001).

Our study is exploratory and examines the relationship of media use, both general and sports specific, and involvement in sport to attitudes about women's sports, women athletes, and gender equality among African American female and male college students.

Literature Review

Previous research has indirectly addressed issues of sport and gender role, including the acceptance of women in roles different from those traditionally associated with hearth and home. The attitudes that women and men have toward gender roles influence how they function in the family as well as how they accept gender differences in opportunities in employment, education and other areas which may include sports. There is a body of literature documenting the ways that females learn gender typecasting from their mothers (Blee and Tickamyer, 1986; Boyd, 1989; Stevens and Boyd, 1980 Thornton, Alwin, and Camburn, 1983). With boys and men, research suggests that male attitudes toward female gender roles vary. The belief that women should be restricted to the home and to the family may be confined to a narrow segment of the male population while other males may accept wider or different roles for women (Messner, 1992). Blee (1995), for example, whose study did not include attitudes toward women in sports, determined that African American men were significantly more liberal toward working wives but more conservative on other general gender role issues.

Social psychologists have examined sport involvement by women and whether their participation in specific sports was considered socially acceptable by conforming to generally accepted images of feminine behavior (Kane, 1988; Methany, 1967; Rowe, 1998). Male appropriate sports include team sports like basketball, soccer, and football, while female appropriate sports are limited to individual competition such as gymnastics, ice skating and ballet (Matteo, 1986). Traditional norms dictate that female athletes should participate in sports encouraging beauty and aesthetics, discouraging physical contact (Csizma,

Wittig, Schurr, 1988; Kane and Snyder, 1989; Salminen, 1990). Further, Theberge (1997) contends that women who participate in sports outside that traditional paradigm and who challenge sex role stereotypes are forced to combat the belief that their participation is less valuable than male participation.

Researchers have examined extensively how the media portray female athletes and how they cover sports events where women compete (Cohen, 1993, Kane and Greendorfer, 1994; Welky, 1997). From this research, one may be able to determine how attitudes toward sports (as an institution) generate and support sexist ideologies and beliefs about gender (Blinde, Greendofer and Sanker, 1991; Harry, 1995; Higgs and Weiller, 1994; Kane, 1995).

The 1960 Olympics Games stand out as the first time women's events received coverage in television homes (Creedon, 1994). Leder (1996) reports that amount of media coverage and the number of female participants increased with each successive Olympics. The 1996 Games marked the emergence of women's team sports like volleyball (Ebersol and Roy, 1996). Yet, non-Olympic media coverage of women's sports continues to lag behind that of males. For example, Tuggle (1997) documented that two nightly sports programs, ESPN's *SportsCenter* and CNN's *Sports Tonight*, devoted only five percent of air time to women's sports. Local television sports programs, analyzed by Duncan and Messner (1994) and Lattimore (1996), determined that similar under-representation existed at the local level. Other researchers (Boutlier and SanGiovanni, 1983; Bryant, 1980; Hilliard, 1984; Himmelberg, 1992; Messner, 1992) found that coverage of female athletes, in media other than television, is heavily skewed toward individual sports. In addition, males receive most of the coverage.

In order to explain this different treatment of men and women in sports coverage prior to media coverage of the 1996 Summer Olympics and the more recent success of the WNBA, researchers (McGregor, 1989; Rintala and Birrell, 1984), concluded that market forces may have served as the major reason for this inequity. The public is more interested in and will pay for male sports events and the traditional feminine portrayal of women than in the portrayal of women in diverse sports activities. The attendance records of the WNBA render such findings obsolete. Still, WNBA Commissioner Gail Ackerman (1999) acknowledges the league's need to increase television ratings. Shifflett and Revelle (1994), found that in the *NCAA News*, where market forces should have little direct impact, female athletes were underrepresented with respect to allocation of space, location of articles and pictures, and presence in pictures. The findings suggest a stubborn and continuing bias against women in sport.

Research analyzing sport magazines or newspaper coverage of sports events indicates that female athletes receive less coverage than males (Rintala & Birrell, 1984). Bryant, in a 1980 review *of Sports Illustrated*, reported no coverage of women. A more extensive study of the magazine by Lumpkin and Williams in 1991 reported that 3,178 articles featured men compared to 280 featuring women. These researchers also noted that coverage of women generally focused on those sports traditionally accepted as feminine (ice skating, tennis, synchronized swimming, etc.). Photographs and descriptions of women athletes also reinforced gender stereotypes by focusing on the female body with sexist overtones (Duquin, 1989; Lumpkin and Williams, 1991).

The Women's Sports Foundation, founded by tennis star Billie Jean King in 1974, issued guidelines in 1995 for female athletes and the media, public

relations, advertising and marketing communities. The foundation's guidelines point out that often time female athletes in advertisements are depicted without their heads in the photograph. This may sexualize women athletes' body parts with the message that only their breasts and buttocks are important. The guidelines further recommend that women athletes not appear in the act of dressing or undressing.

Wann, Schrader, Allison, and McGeorge (1998) examined three university-sponsored newspapers, focusing on the number of male and female authors, the number of articles on male and female athletes, the number of column lines featuring male and female athletics, and the number of photographs depicting male and female athletes. The male athletes received greater coverage than female athletes and the percentage of female athletes coverage was less than the percentage of females enrolled at the institutions. The inequities were greater at the two larger universities.

Male bias in covering and commentating sports events (Nelson, 1991; Lattimore, 1996; Tuggle, 1997) has not discouraged women from watching women team sports nor from being avid viewers of men's professional sports. Arrington (1995) reported that women comprise more than 40 percent of the viewers of games from Major League Baseball, to the National Basketball Association, and the National Football League. Further, Young (1998) determined that in the second year of the WNBA, an average of more than 10,000 fans attended games, thus rivaling National Hockey League attendance.

The growing success and popularity of women's sports have afforded the networks numerous opportunities for capitalizing on professional women's sports. In 1999, the WNBA playoffs and championship games aired prime time

on ESPN, Lifetime, and NBC. Advertisers took advantage of the popularity of the U.S. women's professional soccer team that won the 1999 World Cup Championship. Popular players appeared in television commercials and in magazines selling milk, athletic shoes, soft drinks and even seasoned salt. Individual players were profiled on national sports programs such as HBO's *Real Sport*. Others had their personal lives outside basketball documented on air during half time or before the games. To provide coverage of the expanding participation of women in sport, the publishers of *Sports Illustrated* created *Sports Illustrated for Women* in January 1999.

The upsurge in women's sport participation offers the possibility of many psychological, physiological, and sociological benefits for females. For example, teenaged girls who participate in sports report fewer unwanted pregnancies, higher grades, higher graduation rates, higher levels of confidence and self esteem, more positive body image and lower levels of depression and risk for breast cancer and osteoporosis than girls who do not participate (Women's Sports Foundation, 2000). Meanwhile, the preponderance of research documents ongoing media portrayals of female athletes in traditional paradigms of femininity and gender stereotypes that undermine and trivialize the importance of women's sports and respect for women athletes.

To study the dynamic between women's involvement in sport, media use and attitudes toward women's sports and gender role, we posed our main research question:

> What is the relative contribution of general media use, media use for sport content, sport participation, attendance of women's sport events, and sex to attitudes about women athletes, women's sport, gender roles, and male-female equality in sport and society among college students who grew up under Title IX?

Specific research questions were:

R_1 Is there a significant difference in sport participation, attendance of women's sport events, and media use for sport between females and males?

R_2 Is there a significant relationship between general media use, media use for sport content, sport participation, attendance of women's sport events and attitudes toward women athletes, women's sport, gender roles, and male-female equality in sport and society and did it differ based on sex?

R_3 Do sport participation and attendance of women's sport events make a more important contribution to the construction of females' attitudes toward women athletes than use of sport media?

Methodology

To test our research questions, we administered the survey to 189 undergraduate college students in an introductory communications course at an East Coast university over a five-day period. Respondents ranged in age from 17 to 33 years old. This sample of convenience consisted of 125 (66 percent) females and 64 males. All were African American. Among the females, 61 percent (76) had once played or were currently playing on an organized sports team compared to 73 percent (47) of the males.

Because of the type of the sample, the findings from this exploratory study are not generalizable but are formative toward development of a more comprehensive explanatory study using a random probability sample of young adults. This is the first time in modern history that significant numbers of women are participating in competitive sports in school and professionally with broad media coverage and public acceptance. An exploratory study was

warranted to test these questions in the context of new social relations and attitudes towards women and sports in this age set.

The researchers developed the survey with 15 criterion variables measuring attitudes toward women athletes, women's sport, equality in sport and traditional cultural beliefs about gender roles, using a five-point Likert type scale that ranged from strongly agree to strongly disagree. All questions were developed based on literature findings on social issues facing female athletes and women's sport. All questions were judged by a panel of four judges for unidimensionalism, readability and face validity. The questions were pre-tested and selected for use in the final instrument on the basis of a split halves test.

The following statements were tested to measure attitudes toward:

a) Women's Sport:

- Women's sports are not as exciting as male sports.

b) Women Athletes:

- Women who play sports are masculine.
- Men are more competitive in sports than women.
- Women athletes are usually not attractive.
- Women are not physically able to compete against men in the same sports.
- Women must be careful playing sports because their bodies were designed to have babies.

c) Gender Roles:

- Most women are physically inferior to men.
- Men are intimidated by women who are more physically fit than them.
- Society is better off when women stay home to care for their children.
- Women don't make good coaches.
- Women can't coach males effectively.

d) Gender Equality:

- Professional women athletes currently make enough money.
- Men's sports generate more money therefore men should be paid more than women athletes.
- There should be more women referees in all sports.
- Schools that receive government money should provide equal support to men's and women's sports (i.e. Title IX).

The survey included two general media use variables that measured amount of daily television viewing and daily newspaper readership. Six variables measured specific use and frequency of television, radio, Internet, magazines and newspapers for sport content in general, and two variables asked about frequency of watching women's sports and watching specific sports in the past 12 months (yes or no) -- tennis, basketball, soccer, track and field, softball, volleyball, and swimming. Sports involvement was measured by participation on an organized sports team (yes or no), and attendance at women's sporting events (yes or no) -- tennis, basketball, soccer, track/field, softball, volleyball, and swimming. We were interested in differences in male-female responses based on the respondents viewing or attending women's team sports versus individual competition sports. We also collected general demographic data on respondents' age and sex.

The data was analyzed using correlations and partial correlations, reliability in the creation of several indices, multivariate analysis of variance (ANOVA) and stepwise multiple regression analysis. The level of significance was set at .05. We aggregated all15 criterion variables into one index called BELIEFS (Cronbach's alpha = .81) by adding respondents' scores on each item. Higher scores indicated greater support for women athletes and women's

equality in sports and society. (The results of factor analyses and reliability tests did not warrant the creation of additional indices based on subgroups of criterion questions measuring specific attitudes.) We created indices for watching specific women's sports on television, WATCHSPORTS (Cronbach's alpha = .84), and attending specific women's sporting events, GOSPORTS (Cronbach's alpha = .78) by adding respondents' scores on individual items.

WATCHSPORTS and frequency of viewing women's sports on television were highly intercorrelated ($r=.59$, $p<.000$) for the sample. Similarly, we found that both were not strongly correlated with watching sports in general on television (WATCHSPORTS — $r=.27$, $p<.003$; frequency of viewing – $r=..25$, $p<.001$). Additional correlations (reported in the Findings) indicated that WATCHSPORTS was a stronger and more robust measure of viewing women's sports on television than frequency of viewing women's sports on television. We decided to drop the latter measure from further discussion in this report.

Findings and Discussion

Our first research question was designed to provide a descriptive picture of the sample.

R_1: Is there a significant difference in sports team participation, attendance of women's sport events, use of sports media and beliefs about women in sports and society between females and males?

To answer this question we compared the media and sports behavior of females and males using frequencies, one-way analyses of variance and correlations. A majority of both sexes reported previous or current athletic team experience with no significant difference in their respective rates of participation (see Methodology). These findings confirm the impact of Title IX in the life of the

young women in this survey. Studies indicate much lower levels of female sport participation in the pre-Title IX era.

Women respondents had slightly higher (but not significantly different) overall attendance at women's sports events (GOSPORTS). However, females were significantly more likely to report attending a women's volleyball game ($F=4.4$, $p<.04$). Still, 35 percent of all respondents did not attend any of seven sports events in the past 12 months and only 13 percent attended four or more different events. Though the question did not measure frequency of attendance it seems fairly clear that despite the presence and affordability of women's sport competitions on campus, few students, including females took advantage of the opportunity to attend. They were more likely to watch sports on television.

Females and males watched general (or male) sports and women's sports on television in similar ways. The moderate zero order and partial correlations controlling for sex between viewing women's sports (WATCHSPORTS) and general sports, $r= .27$ ($p<.003$), accounted for only seven percent of the variance in each variable. This indicates that the two items measured different types of viewing behavior, most likely general sports measured male sporting events. A majority (61 percent) of all respondents watched women's sports at least once a month with preferences for WNBA basketball, track and field, tennis and swimming. WNBA basketball was the overwhelming favorite for both sexes. Since the University does not provide cable service in the dormitories, many respondents may not have had televised access to sports such as volleyball and softball.

While females and males watched an average of three hours of television per day, and read daily newspapers similarly, males significantly exceeded

females in their intentional use of media for sports news (see **TABLE 1**). Analysis of variance shows that males were significantly more likely to report watching television sports news "sometimes" or "everyday," using the Internet, and the radio to obtain sports information, and reading newspaper sports pages and sports magazines (see **TABLE 2**). These findings suggest a more selective and intensive use of media by males for sports content. Females reported watching, attending and playing sports at the same level that males did but did not seek sports news like males. This may be a reflection of the overwhelming male bias and gender stereotyping in media sports news coverage documented in some of the studies cited above in our literature review.

Females had significantly higher scores on nearly all beliefs measures than males. Their overall BELIEFS score was 44.6 compared to that of males (36.9, f=.0000). There were only four belief questions in which females and males responded similarly (see **TABLE 6**). Females (m=2.7) most differed from males (m=1.6) in their belief that male athletes did not deserve more money than female athletes because their events generate more money.

Having observed that females were significantly more supportive of women in sports and society, and gender equality, we searched for correlates to these beliefs based on media use, sport participation and attendance of women's sport events.

R_2 Is there was a significant relationship between general media use, media use for sport content, sport participation, attendance of women's sport events and attitudes toward women athletes, women's sport, gender roles, and male-female equality in sport and society and did it differ based on sex?

General media use (television viewing and daily newspaper reading) was insignificant in explaining gender beliefs among females. While television viewing was unrelated to males' beliefs, control for watching general (or male) sports revealed that daily newspaper use was significantly related to some beliefs among males (see discussion below). Sports media use, however, was significantly and differentially related to beliefs among both females and males.

Watching women's sports on television (WATCHSPORTS) was the main media variable significantly and strongly correlated ($r = .45$, $p < .000$) to women's beliefs about women's sport, gender roles, and gender equality using zero and first order control for sports team participation. WATCHSPORTS was also significantly correlated to 12 of the 15 individual belief statements using zero and first order control for sports team participation (see **TABLE 3**). It was significantly and strongly correlated to sports team participation ($r = .39$, $p < .000$). However, sports team participation was not significantly related to BELIEFS and therefore, may not be an important socializing factor for females. Notably, there were no significant zero order correlations between women's beliefs and watching general (or male) sports on television. Control for WATCHSPORTS showed a weak but significant correlation ($r = .19$, $p < .03$) between watching male sports and the belief that women's sports are not as exciting as male sports.

To further investigate the role of sports media in young women's beliefs, we looked at correlations between beliefs and sports media variables controlling for watching general (or male) sports on television. This variable had little effect on any of the zero correlations except in the relationship between WATCHSPORTS and the belief that "professional women athletes currently do not make enough money." The "r" value increased from .20 to .27, a three

percent increase in explained variance, with the control suggesting that women who watch male sports on television just slightly are more likely to feel that women athletes currently earn enough. Far from suggesting that these females are any less supportive of women's equality we find that removing the effects of watching general sports resulted in a slight reduction in the "r" value in the correlation between WATCHSPORTS and the belief that "Society is not better off when women stay home to care for their children". This finding suggests that watching general sports leads to a somewhat stronger support for women's role outside the home. Women who watch male sports may be more aware of the business of sports and simply hold a more pragmatic or measured evaluation of remunerations for athletes.

Reading a sports magazine (.21, $p<02$) and obtaining sport content from the radio (.19, $p<.02$) were weakly but significantly correlated to BELIEFS. First order controls for sports team participation and watching general (male) sports had little effect on these relationships. This finding reinforces an earlier observation that women interested in sports may find print sports media unsatisfactory due to a strong male bias. It also points to the more pronounced importance and role of television viewing in these young women's lives. This can be seen in how the zero order relationship between attending women's sports (GOSPORTS) and BELIEFS ($r=.35$, $p<.000$) is reduced to a nonsignificant level when we control for WATCHSPORTS ($r=.16$, $p<.07$) (see **TABLE 3**). The support these women showed for women in sport and gender equality was not related to attending but watching the sports on television. This answers our third research question concerning the relative importance of actual sport

participation and attendance versus use of women's sports media as influences in young women's beliefs about women in sport and society.

The relationship between males' beliefs and their use of sports media and attendance of women's sports was far more complicated than the findings on the females in this sample. Male beliefs were significantly related to a broader range of sports media, sports team participation and attendance of women's tennis matches but in a negative way. In each instance, as sports media use and attendance increased, support for females in sports and gender equality decreased. Specific sports media variables and their zero order correlation to BELIEFS include

- Watching television general (or male) sports (-.45, $p<.000$)
- WATCHSPORTS (-.24, $p<.05$),
- Internet use for sports (-.34, $p<.005$)
- Reading the sports page (-.20, $p<.02$)
- Reading a sports magazine (-.36, $p<.004$)
- Attendance of women's tennis matches (-.29, $p<.02$) (see **TABLE 4**).

All of the above sports media - BELIEFS relationships disappeared once we controlled for watching general (i.e. male) sports on television. However, the relationship between attending women's tennis matches and beliefs increased with general sports control suggesting a stronger anti-female athlete and anti-gender equality position among males who attend women tennis matches. After examining the media variables, we will return to discuss this tennis variable.

Watching general (i.e. male) sports on television was significantly related (zero order) to support of the following individual belief statements among male respondents:

- Professional women athletes currently make enough money (.27, $p<.03$).
- Most women are physically inferior to men (.25, $p<.02$).
- Men are more competitive than women in sports (.28, $p<.03$).
- Women athletes are usually not attractive (.38, $p<.002$).
- Women's sports are not as exciting as male sports (.28, $p<.03$).
- Men's sports generate more money therefore men should be paid more than women athletes (.37, $p<.002$).
- Women must be careful playing sports because their bodies are designed to have babies (.36, $p<.003$).
- There are enough women referees in all sports (.38, $p<.002$).

With first order controls for sports team participation, WATCHSPORTS, and GOSPORTS we found that, except in two cases, the relationship between watching male sports and beliefs held consistent (see **TABLE 4**). First order controls eliminated the significance between male sports and the belief that men are more competitive than women in sports. Controls reduced the magnitude of the relationship between male sports and the belief that male athletes should be paid more but not its significance. This suggests that males who have sports team experience and or watch or attend women's sports are more impressed with the level of women's competition and feel they deserve higher remuneration as professional athletes. On the other hand first order control for WATCHSPORTS and GOSPORTS revealed a significant relationship between male sports and the belief that women cannot compete against men in the same sports. It seems that these males appreciate women's athleticism for its own value but are convinced that it is not on par with male athleticism.

With first order control for watching general (i.e. male) sports, we observed that men who frequently read daily newspapers of reading held supportive beliefs about women as below:

- BELIEFS (r=.30, p<.02)
- Most women are not physically inferior to men (r=.29, p<.02)
- Men are not more competitive than women (r=.28, p<.03)
- Women's sports are as exciting as men's sports (r=.29, p<.02)
- Women can physically compete against men in the same sports (r=.28, p<.03) (see **TABLE 4**).

Attending women's tennis matches was strongly correlated to non support of Title IX (.43, p<.000) and a belief that society is better off when women stay home (.33, p<.008). First order control for watching male sports revealed beliefs that men are more competitive in sports (r=.26, p<.04), women athletes are usually not attractive (r=.30, p<.02), women's sports are not as exciting (r=.25, p<.04) and society is better off when women stay home to care for their children (r=.25, p<.04) (see **TABLE 4**). Attending women's tennis matches was the only sports attendance variable significantly related to beliefs among males. It was also the only attendance variable not correlated to attending a team sport. It was only significantly related to swimming (r=.39, p<.001). Tennis is not a team sport and has approval as an acceptable sport where female participants maintain traditional images of femininity.

Sports team participation was not significantly related to BELIEFS overall, but men with team sport experience felt that women could not effectively coach male athletes (.33, p<.008), even with first order control for watching male sports and watching female sports. That was the only belief variable to which athletic

status was significantly related among men and would seem to be integrally linked to their real experience as athletes.

Our main research question asked about the structure of BELIEFS among all respondents. To answer this, we used stepwise multiple regression analysis ($p<.05$) using the following independent variables: sex, watching male sports on television, attending women's tennis, WATCHSPORTS, watching television sports news, Internet use for sports content, and GOSPORTS. We obtained $R^2 = .30$, and $F=19.97$ ($p<.0000$). The strongest predictor of beliefs was sex, being female, (beta=.38, $p<.0000$, on step four). The next best predictors in order of magnitude (see **TABLE** 5) were watching female sports on television (beta=.31, $p<.000$), watching male sports on television (beta= -.18, $p<.01$) and using the Internet for sports information (beta= -.16, $p<.02$). BELIEFS was best defined by being female, high viewing of women's sports on television, low viewing of male sports, and low use of the Internet for sports information. Save sex, beliefs were mainly determined by media variables and not variables related to actual sports experience such as attendance and participation.

Conclusion

It is worth observing that regardless of athletic team experience, women in this study who used sports media especially television for women's sports tended to favor nontraditional roles for women in sports and society. This points to the possibility of a more significant role for the media than actual sports participation as an influence on females' beliefs about women in sports and society. Television sports media may serve as a new socializing factor among young women empowering their aspirations and desire for nontraditional female

roles in society. Yet, it is surprising that media use exceeds actual experience in sports in understanding females' beliefs about women in sports and society. It points to the power of the media in the lives of a generation raised in a media saturated society. It may possibly point to the weakness of the sports team experience for most females. This may not be an important place of bonding and formation of gender identification as it is for males. There may still be an overriding concern by adult gatekeepers that girls in sports not lose their sense of traditional femininity. Further, while female participation in sport may be accepted, it is not necessarily the case that sport will be redefined as a female activity, a place where femininity is developed as it is for the growth of masculinity. We also acknowledge that our measure of sports participation may not have been robust enough to capture variance in experience. The measure did not consider the level of competition, when or for how long a respondent participated on a team. A future testing of these relationships should include a stronger sports team measure.

Nonetheless, we expected organized sports team experience to be a significant factor among the females given arguments of its importance in teaching males values about competitiveness and cooperation under difficulty. It seems that in this sample, the vicarious enjoyment of women's sports through media was more importantly related to beliefs than actual participation or attendance for females. This may speak to the important role of television in conveying power to events through its coverage for this generation. Media coverage of the civil rights and anti-war movements, and the war in Vietnam demonstrated the power of the media to raise the significance level of locally confined events to national and worldwide attention and esteem.

It is clear that men who read the sports page and sports magazines enjoyed all sports including women's sports. Our understanding of why their use of various sports media and not actual sports participation is linked to nonsupport of women athletes and women in society is an area for further research. We speculate that, indeed, as the research indicates, sports media coverage is male biased and heavily imbued with gender stereotyping along with trivialization of female athleticism. Despite their attention to women's sports, these males were against Title IX. This may be result from some criticisms in the media that current rules for the implementation of Title IX are allegedly forcing cutbacks in male sports teams at some colleges and universities. Media sports coverage may be not only focused on males but also specifically anti-female. At any rate, Title IX and the flood of well-trained women into sports have not generated support for gender equality nor for nontraditional roles in sports and society for women among the young males in our sample.

What is evident is that the media – sports industry sees the vast potential for women's rising interest in sports either as fans and or participants as a potential market worth billions. Women's sports today makes economic sense and will likely receive even more media coverage and marketing space in the future. Marketing research indicates that women do not relate or respond to sports culture the same way that men do. Women are typically not looking to become "iron men" or "weekend warriors" and I suspect that there is concern by many males and females that not all traditional notions of femininity get lost as women pursue sports. At the same time, our research clearly suggests that young women attach support for gender equality and diverse roles in society for women to their consumption of women's sports that to some may seem

anathema to traditional femininity and submissiveness. With its huge market potential and Title IX, women's interest and participation in sports, along with male interest in women's sports, are not likely to go away anytime soon. We do not know if the Title IX age males in our study who enjoyed women's sports will adopt more supportive attitudes of women's social equality as they grow older. It is unlikely that the Title IX age women in our study will become more traditional unless media and marketing forces combine to reconstruct and overlap images of women in sports with traditional femininity. Women's equality advocates should carefully monitor media coverage of women's sports and marketing themes in selling sport to women and girls.

TABLE 1

FREQUENCIES AND MEANS OF FEMALE AND MALE SPORTS MEDIA USE AND SPORTS PARTICIPATION

	FEMALES(n =125)		MALES (n=64)			
	N (%)	MEAN	N (%)	MEAN	F ration	F prob.
Team participation	76 (66%)	.61	47 (73%)	.73	2.99	.09
Go women sports (43+)	31 (24.8%)	1.6	13 (20.4%)	1.4	.40	.53
Go volleyball	27 (21.6%)	.22	6 (9.4%)	.09	4.44	.04
Watch female TV sports sometimes or regularly	57 (45.6%)	3.30	31 (48.5%)	3.42	.11	.74
Watch male TV sports sometimes or regularly	81 (73.8%)	2.89	41 (79.7%)	3.11	2.92	.09
Watch TV sports news – sometimes or everyday	54 (43.2%)	2.3	48 (75%)	2.89	17.46	.0000
Radio sports	21 (16.8%)	.17	19 (29.7%)	,30	4.26	.04
Sport magazines – sometimes or regularly	27 (21.6%)	1.82	37 (57.9%)	2.59	29.52	.0000
Internet sports	32 (25.6%)	.6	35 (54.7%)	.55	16.88	.0001
Newspaper sports page – sometimes or everyday	37 (29.6%)	2.01	37 (57.8%)	2.63	20.64	.0000

TABLE 2

ANALYSIS OF VARIANCE OF SPORTS MEDIA USE BY SEX

	Female means (n=125)	Male means (n=64)	F Ratio	F Probability
Internet sports	.26	.55	16.88	.0001
Radio sports	.17	.30	4.26	.04
Sports page	2.01	2.62	20.64	.0000
Sports magazine	1.82	2.59	29.52	.0000
TV sports news	2.30	2.89	17.46	.0000
Watch female sports	3.30	2.89	.11	.74
Watch male sports	2.89	3.11	2.92	.09

TABLE 3

CORRELATIONS OF SPORTS MEDIA AND BELIEFS AMONG FEMALES ZERO AND FIRST ORDER CONTROL FOR WATCHING FEMALE SPORTS[i]

	Watch female sports (sports team)	Watch male sports[1]	Sports magazine[1]	Radio[1]	Go female sports[1]
BELIEFS	.44** (.45**)		.21* (.05)	.19* (.11)	.35** (.16)
Belief 1	.18* (.18*)	.18* (.14)	.22* (.16)	.20* (.17)	.17* (.09)
Belief 2	.24* (.20*)				.21* (-.01)
Belief 3	.24* (.27**)				
Belief 4	.27** (.27**)	(-.19*)			.20* (.08)
Belief 5	.36** (.33**)		.18* (.08)		.28** (.12)
Belief 6	.19* (.22*)				
Belief 7	.27* (.23*)				
Belief 8	.29** (.26**)				.29** (.17)
Belief 9	.35** (.37**)				.21* (.03)
Belief 10	.29* (.28**)				
Belief 11			.28** (.27**)		.20* (.18*)
Belief 12	(.18*)				
Belief 13	(.20*)				

Legend

First order control for watch male sports in ( ); *= P<.05; **= p<.005

Belief 1= Women who play sports are not masculine.
Belief 2 = Professional women athletes currently do not make enough money.
Belief 3= Men are more competitive in sports than women.
Belief 4 = Women's sports are not as exciting as male sports.
Belief 5 = Men's sports generate more money still men should not be paid more than women athletes.
Belief 6 = Women are physically able to compete against men in the same sports.
Belief 7 = There should be more women referees in all sports.
Belief 8 = Women make good coaches.
Belief 9 = Women can effectively coach males.
Belief 10= Schools that receive government money should provide equal support to men's and women's sports.
Belief 11= Most women are not physically inferior to men.
Belief 12 = Women athletes are usually not unattractive.
Belief 13 = Society is better off when women stay home to care for their children.

TABLE 4

CORRELATIONS OF SPORTS MEDIA AND BELIEFS AMONG MALES ZERO AND FIRST ORDER CONTROL FOR WATCHING MALE SPORTS

	Watch Male sports	Watch Female sports	Internet	Sports page	Sports magazine	Go Tennis matches	Daily newspaper	TV Sports News
BELIEFS	-.45**	-.24* (-.14)	-.34** (-.15)	-.20* (-.03)	-.36** (-.19)	-.29* (-.33**)	(.30*)	-.49** (-.27*)
Belief 1	-.27*							
Belief 2	-.25*						(.29*)	
Belief 3	-.28*					-.25*	(.28*)	-.26* (-.18)
Belief 4	.39**			.24* (-.02)	.41** (-.31*)	.29* (-.02)		.42** (-.29*)
Belief 5	-.28*		-.25* (-.07)		-.26* (-.09)	(-.24*)	(.29*)	-.43** (-.24*)
Belief 6	-.37**		-.26* (-.14)					-.29* (-.14)
Belief 7	-.36**		-.24* (-.07)	-.41** (-.23*)	-.30* (-.16)			
Belief 8	-.38**			-.27* (-.01)				
Belief 9	-.37**		-.30* (-.14)		-.35** (-.21)		(.28*)	
Belief 10						-.33* (-.25*)		-.24* (-.19)
Belief 11						-.43**		
Belief 12			-.27* (-.14)	-.20* (-.21)	-.35** (-.29*)			-.36** (-.31*)

Legend
First order control for watch male sports in ( )
*= P<.05; **= p<.005

Belief 1 = Professional women athletes currently do not make enough money.
Belief 2 = Most women are not physically inferior to men.
Belief 3 = Men are more not competitive than women in sports.
Belief 4 = Women athletes are usually not unattractive.
Belief 5 = Women's sports are as exciting as male sports.
Belief 6 = Men's sports generate more money still men should not be paid more than women athletes.
Belief 7 = Women need not be careful playing sports because their bodies are designed to have babies.
Belief 8 = There are not enough women referees in all sports.
Belief 9 = Women can physically compete against men in the same sports.
Belief 10 = Society is not better off when women stay home to care for their children.
Belief 11 = Schools that receive government money should not provide equal support to men's and women's sports.
Belief 12 = Women can coach males effectively.

TABLE 5

STEPWISE MULTIPLE REGRESSION ANALYSIS OF BELIEFS AMONG ALL RESPONDENTS

R^2=.30 (F=19.97***)

PREDICTORS	Step 1	Step 2	Step 3	Step 4
Sex	.44***	.44***	.41***	.38**
WATCHSPORTS		.21*	.28*	.31**
Watch male sports			-.23*	-.18*
Internet sports				-.16*

* = p<.05
** = p<.001
*** = p<.0000

TABLE 6

ONE WAY ANALYSIS OF VARIANCE BETWEEN FEMALE AND MALE BELIEFS ABOUT WOMEN IN SPORTS AND SOCIETY, GENDER EQUALITY

	Female means	Male means	F ratio	F probability
Overall BELIEFS	**44.6**	**36.9**	**43.78**	**.0000**
Belief 1	**2.9**	**2.5**	**7.07**	**.0009**
Belief 2	**2.8**	**2.0**	**17.31**	**.0000**
Belief 3	**2.9**	**2.3**	**13.50**	**.0003**
Belief 4	**3.1**	**2.4**	**15.90**	**.0001**
Belief 5	**2.5**	**1.9**	**8.49**	**.0004**
Belief 6	**2.7**	**1.6**	**35.69**	**.0000**
Belief 7	**2.7**	**1.9**	**22.45**	**.0000**
Belief 8	**3.0**	**2.5**	**15.69**	**.0001**
Belief 9	**3.6**	**3.2**	**11.90**	**.0007**
Belief 10	**3.2**	**2.6**	**17.02**	**.0001**
Belief 11	**3.2**	**3.1**	**16.95**	**.0001**

Females = 125; Males = 64

Legend

Belief 1: Women who play sports are not masculine.
Belief 2: Most women are not physically inferior to men.
Belief 3: Men are not more competitive in sports than women.
Belief 4: Women athletes are usually not unattractive.
Belief 5: Women's sports are as exciting as male sports.
Belief 6: Men's sports generate more money, still men should not be paid more than women athletes.
Belief 7: Women are not physically able to compete against men in the same sports.
Belief 8: There should be more women referees in all sports.
Belief 9: Women make good coaches.
Belief 10: Women can coach males effectively.
Belief 11: Schools that receive government money should provide equal support to men's and women's sports.

REFERENCES

Ackerman, V. (1999, September 4), The state of the WNBA.

Amateur Athletic Foundation of Los Angeles (1994).Coverage of women's sports in four daily newspapers. Amateur Athletic Foundation of Los Angeles, CA.

Arrington, D. (1995, January 22). Women own a greater share of sports market, yet are ignored. *Orlando (Fl.) Sentinel*, p. C15.

Blee, K. M., and Tichamyer, A. R. (1986). Black-White differences in mother-to-daughter transmission of sex-role attitudes. *The Sociological Quarterly, 28*, 205-222.

Blee, K. M. (1995). Racial differences in men's attitudes about women's gender roles. *Journal of Marriage and Family.*

Blinde, E. M., Greendorfer, S. C., and Sankner, R. J. (1991). Differential media coverage of men's and women's intercollegiate basketball: Reflection of gender ideology. *Journal of Sport and Social Issues, 15*, 98-114.

Boutlier, M., and SanGiovanni, L. (1983). *The sporting woman*. Champaign, IL: Human Kinetics.

Boyd, C. J. (1989). Mothers and daughters: A discussion of theory and research. *Journal of Marriage and the Family, 55*, 338-355.

Bryant, J. (1980). A two-year investigation of the female in sport as reported by the paper media. *Arena Review, 4*, 32-44.

Cohen, G. L. (1993). Media portrayal of the female athlete. In G. L. Cohen (Ed.), *Women in sports: Issues and controversies* (pp. 171-185). New York: Russell Sage.

Creedon, P. (1994). women, media and sport: Creating and reflecting gender values. In P. Creedon (Ed.), *Women, media and sport: Challenging gender values* (pp. 3-27). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Csizma, K.A., Wittig, A. F., and Schurr, K. T. (1988). Sports stereotypes and gender. *Journal of Sport and Exercise Psychology, 10*, 62-74.

Duncan, M., and Messner, M. (1994), *Gender stereotyping in televised sports*: A follow up to the 1989 study. Los Angeles: Amateur Athletic Foundation.

Duquin, M. C. (1989). Fashion and fitness: Images in women's magazine advertisements. *Arena Review, 13*, 97-107.

Ebersol, D. , and Roy, T. (Executive Producers). (1996, July 24). *The Games of the XXVI Olympiad*. New York: NBC.

Harry, J. (1995). Sports ideology, attitudes toward women, and anti-homosexual attitudes. *Sex Roles, 32*(1-2), 109-117.

Higgs, C. T., and Weiller, K. H. (1994). Gender bias and the 1992 Summer Olympic Games: An analysis of television coverage. *Journal of Sport and Social Issues, 18*, 234-246.

Hilliard, D. (1984). Media images of male and female athletes: An interpretative analysis of magazine articles. *Sociology of Sport Journal, 5*, 251-262.

Himmelberg, M. (1992, Spring). Sexism still rampant. *Nieman Reports, 46*(1), 38-41.

Jenkins, Sally. (2001, June 24). In sports, no longer the 2nd sex. *Washington Post*, p. D1.

Kane, M. J. (1988). The female athletic role as a status determinant within the social systems of high school adolescents. *Adolescence. 23*(90), 253-264.

Kane, M. J. (1995). Resistance / transformation of the oppositional binary: Exposing sport as a continuum. *Journal of Sport and Social Issues, 19*(2), 191-218.

Kane, M. J., andGreendorfer, S. L. (1994). The media's role in accommodating and resisting stereotyped images of women in sport. In P. J. Creedon (Ed.), *Women, media and sport: Challenging gender values* (pp. 28-44). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Kane, M. J., and Snyder, E. E. (1989). Sport typing : The social "containment" of women in sport. *Arena Review, 13*, 77-96.

Lattimore, L. (1996, August). *Let's go to the videotape: Gender bias in local television sports coverage.* Paper presented at the national conference of the Association of Education in Journalism and Mass Communications, Anaheim, CA.

Leder, J. (1996). *Grace and glory: A century of women in the Olympics.* Chicago: Triumph Books.

Lumpkin, A., and Williams, L. D. (1991). An analysis of *Sports Illustrated* feature articles 1954-1987. *Sociology of Sport Journal, 8*, 16-32.

McGregor, E. (1989). Mass media and sport: Influences on the public. *The Physical Educator, 46*(1), 52-55.

Messner, M. (1992). *Power at play: Sports and the problem of masculinity.* Boston: Beacon.

Methany, E. (1967). *Connotations of movement in sport and dance.* Dubuque, IA: William C. Brown.

Nelson, M. (1991). *Are we winning yet?* New York: Random House.

Rintala, J., and Birrell, S. (1984). Fair treatment for the active female: A content analysis of Young Athlete magazine. *Sociology and Sport Journal, 1*, 231-250.

Rowe, D. (1998). Rethinking power and resistance in sport. *Journal of Sport and Social Issues, 22*(3), 241-251.

Salminen, S. (1990). Sex role and participation in traditionally inappropriate sports. *Perceptual and Motor Skills, 71*, 1216-1218.

Schwartz, J. (2000, January 31). The super day to screen ads. *The Washington Post*, H1, Hll.

Shifflett, B., and Revelle, R. (1994). Gender equity in sports media coverage: A review of the NCAA news, *Journal of Sport and Social Issues*, 18(2), 144-150.

Stevens,G. and Boyd, M. (1980). The importance of mother: Labor force participation and intergenerational mobility of women. *Social Forces*, 59, 186-199

Theberge, N. (1997). "It's part of the game": Physicality and the production of gender in women's hockey. *Gender and Society, 11*(1), 69-88.

Thornton, A., Alwin, D.F., and Camburn, D. (1983). Causes and consequences of sex-role attitudes and attitude change. *American Sociological Review*, 48, 211-227.

Tuggle, C. A. (1997). Differences, in television sports reporting of men's and women's athletics: ESPN *SportsCenter* and CNN *Sports Tonight. Journal of Broadcasting and Electronic Media, 41*(1) 14-24.

Wann, D., Schrader, M., Allison, J., and McGeorge, K. (1998). The inequitable newspaper coverage of men's and women's athletics at small, medium, and large universities. *Journal of Sport and Social Issues*, 22(1), 79-87.

Welky, D. B. (1997). Viking girls, mermaids, and little brown men: U. S. journalism and the 1932 Olympics. *Journal of Sport History*, 24 (1), 24-46.

Women's Sports Foundation Point of View (2000). The cause: Why sports participation for girls and women? Women's Sports Foundation, East Meadow: New York.

Women's Sports Foundation (1995). Addressing the issue of images and words in women's sports: Guidelines for female athletes and the media, public relations, advertising and marketing communities. Women's Sports Foundation, East Meadow: New York.

Wong, Edward. (2001, June 19). Nike trying new strategies for women. *New York Times* (www.nytimes.com).

Young, C. (1998, September 9). Not all feminists are happy with WNBA. *Detroit News*, p. A11.

Running head: HOME COURT DISADVANTAGE?

HOME COURT DISADVANTAGE?:

EXAMINING THE COVERAGE OF FEMALE ATHLETES ON LEADING SPORTS WEBSITES – A PILOT STUDY

by
Tara M. Kachgal
Park Fellow and Ph.D. Student
School of Journalism and Mass Communication
University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill
P.O. Box 15
Chapel Hill, NC 27514
919.968.0036
tarakachgal@netscape.net

Submitted to the Commission on the Status of Women on April 1, 2001, for presentation at the Association for Education in Journalism and Mass Communication annual meeting in August 2001

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS: The author wishes to express her deeply felt gratitude to Professors Steven Dick, Max Grubb, and, most especially, Walter McDowell, of Southern Illinois University. This work stemmed from Masters thesis research, to which they all contributed their guidance and expertise.

Home Court Disadvantage?:
Examining the Coverage of Female Athletes on Leading Sports Websites – A Pilot Study

ABSTRACT

Tara M. Kachgal
Park Fellow and Ph.D. Student
School of Journalism and Mass Communication
University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill
P.O. Box 15
Chapel Hill, NC 27514
919.968.0036
tarakachgal@netscape.net

This exploratory content analysis study examined gender representation of female athletes on three leading sports websites (CBSSportsLine, CNNSI, and ESPN) using descriptive indicators and framing analysis. Results show that female athletes received less coverage (i.e., number of news items and images) than male athletes but were not framed any more ambivalently. These findings suggest that sports websites may marginalize athletes in the same way that traditional sports media do but may differ in gender stereotyping.

Home Court Disadvantage?:

Examining the Coverage of Female Athletes on Leading Sports Websites – A Pilot Study

Since the enactment of Title IX of the Education Amendments of 1972, participation in and spectatorship of women's sports has grown remarkably. In 1998, 39% of all collegiate athletes were women, a dramatic increase from 1972, when it stood at only 2% (American Association of University Women [AAUW], 2001). In addition, more female athletes participated in the 2000 Summer Olympic Games than at any time before, comprising over 40% of the total number of athletes ("Olympics end with highs for women," 2000). Among spectators and media audiences, women's sports are also finding a following. The 78,972 spectators at the opening game of the 1999 Women's World Cup soccer tournament constituted the largest audience ever recorded for a women's sporting event (Lieber, 1999). Buoyed by this success, a women's professional soccer league began play in April 2001 ("WUSA unveils nicknames," 2000). Marketing and media exposure of women's sports have accelerated in recent years (McCarthy, 2000; Navarro, 2001).

Despite these gains, a growing body of evidence shows that female athletes are often either marginalized or stereotyped in sports television programming and print content. Marginalization occurs when female athletes are excluded or underrepresented in media coverage. Bruce's (1998) finding that women's teams constituted only 3% of all National Collegiate Athletic Association (NCAA) games broadcast during the 1996-1997 regular season is one example. Stereotyping encompasses an array of representational strategies that are used in order to represent female athletes in formulaic and overly simplistic terms based on gender. These strategies include favoring sex typed sports, emphasizing weakness and dependence, crediting male direction or luck for success, focusing on appearance and sexuality, and

referencing gender status in naming and titling (Creedon, 1994a; Blinde, Greendorfer & Sankner, 1991; Duncan & Messner, 1998; Duncan, Messner, Williams & Jensen, 1990; Fink, 1998; Kane, 1996; Lenskyj, 1991; Messner, 1988; Theberge & Cronk, 1994; Tuggle & Owen, 1999). The resulting image of female athletes as weak and trivial stands in stark contrast to the consuming depiction of male athletes as heroic and significant (Duncan & Messner, 1998).

Two theoretical frameworks are particularly helpful in explaining the representation of female athletes in sports media. Framing theory suggests that gender stereotypes persist in media coverage because strategies for representing gender have become entrenched in news practice (Gamson & Modigliani, 1989; Pan & Kosicki, 1993) due to the myriad of influences affecting newswork (Herman & Chomsky, 1988; Shoemaker & Reese, 1996; Tuchman, 1978b). Cultural hegemony theory focuses on patriarchal ideology (i.e., the subordination of women to men) as an all-encompassing influence on content, which supports the reality presented and reinforced through framing (Curran, 1982; Hall, 1982; Herman & Chomsky, 1988). The sports industry, as well as sports media, have traditionally been male-defined and -controlled (McDaniel & Sullivan, 1998).

Perhaps, no single force has had a greater impact on the sports media marketplace in recent years than the World Wide Web. Features such as asynchrony, non-linearity, non-hierarchical organization, dynamism, and interactivity (Newhagen & Rafaeli, 1996) make the medium unlike traditional sports media (e.g., broadcast and cable television programming and newspaper and magazine print materials) in many ways. Twenty percent of all Americans regularly access sports news and information from sports websites (ESPN CHILTON, 1999). Based on its increasing pervasiveness, some scholars (Morris & Ogan, 1996; Newhagen & Rafaeli, 1996) have called it a mass medium. It remains to be seen whether the representational

strategies used by traditional sports media in the coverage of female athletes will be ruptured or replicated in this new medium.

Stemming from the call for further research made by both Duncan and Messner (1998) and Kinkema and Harris (1998), the purpose of this exploratory study was to extend the analysis of gender representation to sports-oriented websites through the use of content analysis. Leading news items from the tennis, golf, and soccer pages of ESPN.com, CBSSportsLine.com, and CNNSI.com were analyzed with an instrument incorporating two content analyses approaches: descriptive indicators to assess marginalization and a frame analysis index to assess stereotyping.

Literature Review

According to Kinkema and Harris (1998), sports news and information has evolved into a heavily-codified set of media practices that are meant to "recreat[e] an athletic event in order to attract an audience and entertain spectators" (p. 33); the goal is to yield large and attractive audiences for sports product. These practices encompass a variety of drama-building and plot resolution tactics, such as emphasizing athlete personality through characterization, close-ups, features, segments, and personal interest stories (Chalip & Chalip, 1987; O'Connor & Boyle, 1993), creating a sense of action and conflict by using militaristic language and by pitting athletes against one another (O'Connor & Boyle, 1993; Wenner & Gantz, 1998; Whitson, 1994), and promoting the game's importance through the recitation of records and statistics and the use of forecasting and embellishment (Sage, 1998). The seamless narrative which results from these practices has led to sports media being described as having the "open, serialized quality of dramatic offerings in daytime television soap operas" (Harris & Hills, 1993, p. 108).

The similarities between sports news, information, and entertainment have been well-observed. As Gamson (1989) advised, "Think of news as telling stories about the world rather

than as presenting 'information,' even though the stories, of course, include factual elements" (p. 157). This statement implies the notion of multiple realities, only one of which is endorsed by the news media. In his influential essay on frame analysis, sociologist Erving Goffman (1974) argued that social experience is governed by frameworks, or "principles of organization" (p. 10), which anchor daily activity. Under framing theory, media are a socializing agent in that they foster common expectations regarding social life and reinforce the "closed, finite set of rules" (p. 5) that govern social interaction.

Newsmakers incorporate framing when they "select some aspects of a perceived reality and make them more [or less] salient in communicating a text, in such a way as to promote a particular problem, definition, causal interpretation, moral evaluation, and/or treatment recommendation" (Entman, 1993, p. 52). Framing is achieved through two primary news processes: selection and production. The first step, selection, involves deciding which of a multitude of occurrences are newsworthy events that merit coverage (Entman, 1993; Gitlin, 1980; Tuchman, 1978b). The second step, production, involves imparting meaning in news texts through consistent use of orderly rules, patterns, and formulae. These conventions can be classified in terms of four structural dimensions: (1) syntactic structures, which denote the organized, sequential arrangement of sentences and adherence to journalistic standards of balance and source attribution; (2) script structures, which denote the use of narrative conventions in news coverage; (3) thematic structures, which denote the organization of news stories based on causal arguments; and (4) rhetorical structures, which denote a reliance on symbolic imagery to convey meaning (Pan & Kosicki, 1993). Metaphors, exemplars, catchphrases, and visual images are common framing devices (Gamson, 1989).

In studies examining gender representation in sports media, researchers have consistently

found that female athletes are either absent or depicted in biased terms. In other words, stories concerning female athletes are either not selected for coverage, or they are produced in such a way as to convey gender stereotypes. Regarding marginalization, Kinnick (1998) found that female athletes received fewer cover stories and fewer photos and graphics than male athletes in newspapers. Bruce's (1998) findings on televised sports coverage were very similar; female athletes received fewer clips, segments, and on-air time than did male athletes. Panel studies conducted for the Amateur Athletic Foundation (AAF) of Los Angeles in 1990 and 1994, for instance, concluded that female athletes were featured in only 10% of televised sports programming (Duncan & Messner, 1998). In addition, Tuggle (1997) found that women's sports coverage was placed in less desirable program blocks on nightly cable news programs ESPN Sports Center and CNN Sports Tonight.

There is considerable evidence of gender stereotyping in sports media, as well (e.g., Creedon, 1994a; Kane, 1996; Kane & Lenskyj, 1998; Kinkema & Harris, 1998). The researcher has organized the themes commonly identified in the literature into three classifications of gender-specific news frames. These are Appropriate Sports, Gender Reference, and Ambivalence. Each category will be described in further detail below.

Appropriate Sports Frame

This frame refers to the almost exclusive emphasis in media coverage on sports deemed appropriate for women. Graceful, fluid sports, mostly individual ones, receive more coverage, for example, than team sports involving bodily contact. In their content analysis of the 1996 Summer Games, for example, Tuggle and Owen (1999) found that female athletes in individual sports received twice as much airtime as those in team sports. Creedon (1994a) and Lenskyj (1991) found that non-contact sports such as figure skating, gymnastics, tennis, swimming, and

diving—sports which tend to be consistent with traditional notions of femininity and which do not involve face-to-face competition or the use of heavy objects—receive most media coverage (Duncan & Messner, 1998). These findings are striking because more girls and women play team, contact sports such as basketball and softball than individual, non-contact sports such as tennis and golf (Kane, 1996).

Gender Reference Frame

The second frame has two components: "hierarchy of naming" (Duncan et al., 1990, p. 268) and "gender marking" (Duncan & Messner, 1998, p. 180). Hierarchy of naming embodies a dominant group's privilege in referring to members of subordinate groups in ways that deemphasize status. Whereas journalists refer to male athletes more often by their family names, they commonly call female athletes by their first names, nicknames, or by terms such as "girl" (Blinde et al., 1991; Pfister, 1987). In their AAF-sponsored study, Duncan et al. found that U. S. Open tennis commentators referred to female athletes by their first names 53% of the time but to males only 8% of the time. Gender marking signifies the focus in media coverage on female athletes as being, first and foremost, female. Blinde et al.'s (1991) content analysis study of men's and women's intercollegiate basketball coverage found persistent reference to gender in program titles, graphics, and commentary only during women's games (e.g., announcers referred to the women's event as "Women's NCAA" but used only "NCAA" to signify the men's event). Gender marking signifies not only that women's sports are different from men's sports, but also that they are also sub-standard in comparison.

Ambivalence Frame

The third frame is rendered by undercutting positive messages about female athletes with suggestions of weakness or diminishing the achievement of female athletes through the use of

patronizing language, images, and other cues (Blinde et al., 1991; Fink, 1998; Kane, 1996). The phrase, "she plays like a man" (Messner, 1988, p. 74), for example, conveys that female athletes are inferior to male athletes. Lower production quality and the absence of enticing graphics and other content, such as player statistics and slow-motion replays, also serve to dismiss women's sports (Duncan & Messner, 1998; Fink, 1998). Several studies illustrate various dimensions of ambivalent framing of women's sports media. The researcher has organized these findings into six types, or sub-frames: Weakness, Luck, Status, Dependence, Appearance and Sexuality, and Trivialization.

Weakness Sub-frame

Whereas sports media routinely depict female athletes as being powerless and weak (physically or mentally), coverage conveys that male athletes are powerful, strong, and aggressive, in other words, "larger than life" (Duncan & Messner, 1998, p. 174). This is done mostly through language, specifically the use of "martial metaphors" (Duncan et al., 1990, p. 263) and power descriptors that suggest combat or strength, and agency, respectively. Examples found in men's sports coverage include

> buries, bangs in, yanks, firepower, ambushed, explode, whips, hits, punches, fights, battles, knocks, routed, pounds, misfire, attach, stalk, force, exert pressure, wrestling, squeezing trigger, scorch, fully armed, duel, shootout, bullet pass, penetrate, warrior, big guns, jam, powers ball in, fire away, hit bullets, blasting away, bob punch, drawing first blood and weapons.... (Duncan et al., 1990, p. 263)

Martial metaphors and power descriptors are much less commonly used in women's sports coverage, which, instead, has been found to accentuate female athletes' past mistakes and interior emotional states (Duncan & Messner, 1998). Failure by female athletes is treated as a

personal shortcoming (usually due to incompetence), whereas failure by male athletes is treated as, nonetheless, a success (due to mitigating circumstances).

Luck Sub-frame

Embedded in much sports media coverage is the assumption that female athletes are not as capable, physically and intellectually, as their male counterparts and that their success is due either to luck or the direction of male coaches (Tuggle, 1997; Tuggle & Owen, 1999). Although male athletes are often praised for the strategy and complex maneuvering underlying their successful performances, female athletes are regularly dismissed as being non-intellectual (Bryson, 1994; Jones & Murrell, 1999). As an example, they are praised for mastering routine and unspectacular tasks (e.g., a basketball announcer's comment during a women's NCAA game, "Not only do you have to pass the ball but you have to think about what you are going to do, and the player can be distracted by that" [Blinde et al., 1991, p. 108]).

Status Sub-frame

In sports coverage, female athletes' familial, romantic, and other relationships to men (i.e., their status) are emphasized more than athletic performance. Blinde et al. (1991) found that female basketball players were commonly referred to as "mother of two", "wife of a fellow athlete", or "daughter of a cardiologist" (p. 3). Such references not only lend female athletes less authority and individuality, but they also diminish the importance of sports participation to their daily lives.

Dependence Sub-frame

Sports coverage not only accentuates female athletes' relationships, but it also attributes their athletic performance more to entities such as families and coaches than to the athletes themselves (Kinnick, 1998). An article providing game analysis of a women's soccer match, for

example, would invoke the dependence sub-frame if it were to have more commentary from team members' parents than from the players themselves. By neglecting their voices, sports coverage fosters the impression that female athletes have no agency.

Appearance and Sexuality Sub-frame

In sports coverage of female athletes, personal appearance, family values, and (hetero)sexuality have been found to take center stage (Creedon, 1994b; Pfister, 1987), a strategy which Kane (1996) termed the "female apologetic" (p. 121). On one end of the continuum, coverage emphasizes female athletes' wholesomeness. For example, Sheryl Swoopes, a star player for the Women's National Basketball Association (WNBA), has commonly been referred to as a mother and wife (Fish, 1998). On the other end, coverage emphasizes female athletes' looks and sexual appeal, a tactic that at least some researchers have contended sometimes constitutes soft-core pornography (Sabo & Jansen, 1998). By downplaying athleticism and focusing, instead, on femininity, heterosexuality, and family-centeredness, sports coverage seeks to counter longstanding fears that women's sports are unnatural. As Willis (1982) noted, "To succeed as an athlete can be to fail as a woman" (p. 36).

Trivialization Sub-frame

In its coverage, sports media conveys that women's sports are insignificant or trivial. Commentary or promotions of upcoming men's games during women's games, for example, implies that women's sports are only a prelude to men's sports (Duncan & Messner, 1998). Similarly, focusing on female athletes' non-sports-related achievements, such as being named class valedictorian, being voted most popular, or holding class office, more than their sports records or statistics, implies that sports are not of primary importance in the lives of female athletes (Blinde et al., 1991). Reporting on soft news items (e.g., humorous and exotic stories

about females who are not athletes) not only reduces the amount of coverage possible but it connotes that women's sports are not serious (Jones & Murrell, 1999).

This construction of female athletes as inferior to male athletes has much to do with the quantification of sporting achievement (Bryson, 1994; Koppett, 1994; Sage, 1998). When athletic performances are weighed on strictly empirical criteria, physiological differences give men enormous advantages. The notion that women's sports are, thus, second-rate is made to seem "natural" (Kane, 1996; Messner, 1988). As Willis (1982) noted,

> The fact that no one can deny female difference becomes the fact of female sports inferiority, becomes the fact that females are innately different from men, becomes the fact that women who stray across the defining boundary are in a parlous state. An ideological view comes to be deposited in our culture as a commonsense assumption - "of course women are different and inferior." (p. 41)

The notion of "commonsense" is a primary tenet of Italian political theorist Antonio Gramsci's theory of cultural hegemony. Gramsci (1971) proposed that elite groups maintain power and protect common class interests through the use of social institutions such as education and media. These tools of the establishment make the dominant class's social agenda palatable and authentic to the masses by transmitting core ideological beliefs in the form of a hegemonic viewpoint. According to Hall (1990), the hegemonic viewpoint "defines within its terms the mental horizon, the universe, of possible meanings of a whole sector of relations in a society or culture; and, second, that it carries with it the stamp of legitimacy" (p. 516).

Of all the influences on news content, ideology, a "symbolic mechanism that serves as a cohesive and integrating force in society" (Shoemaker & Reese, 1996, p. 221), exerts the most powerful effect. Ideology embodies the pervasive and preferred core values, beliefs, and

assumptions to which most media owners, journalists, and audiences ascribe. According to several scholars (Blinde et al., 1991; Fink, 1998; Kane, 1996), patriarchal ideology is deeply entrenched in the male-dominated sports world; the founder of the modern Olympic Games, Baron Pierre de Coubertin, for example, defended the exclusion of female athletes by saying, "Women have but one task, that of the role of crowning the winner with garlands" (Fuller, 1987, p. 4-10). The use of sports media to extol patriarchal ideology is enhanced, given the symbiotic relationship between sports media and the sports industry (e.g., Fink, 1998; Kinnick, 1998; MacNeill, 1988). For the mostly advertising-supported sports media, coverage of sporting events secures a prized and loyal demographic group, the traditionally male sports audience (Creedon, 1993; Lowes, 1999). For sports organizations, routine media coverage not only builds public interest in sports contests (which are made to seem significant), but also conveys legitimacy on the industry (Bryson, 1994; Duncan & Messner, 1998; Kinkema & Harris, 1998; Theberge & Cronk, 1994).

Sports media endorse the patriarchal hegemonic viewpoint, and, therefore, help to preserve male control of sport, by conveying that women are incapable of athletic achievement and that "normal" women do not aspire to be athletes (Kane, 1996; Messner, 1988). As Kinnick (1998) noted, "The implicit message when women are absent or underrepresented is that female athletes either do not exist, or have no achievements that are newsworthy" (p. 2). Because most audience members lack direct and verifiable experience with the topics of news coverage, these assumptions are rarely challenged (Gitlin, 1980; Fiske, 1989; Hall, 1982; Simon, 1991). As shown, cultural hegemony exacts its power not through coercion, but through cultural means (Curran, 1982; Gitlin, 1980; Hall, 1982; Herman & Chomsky, 1988; Shoemaker & Reese, 1996).

In spite of the pervasiveness of patriarchal ideology in the sports industry and sports

media, women's participation in sports and fitness activities has increased in recent years, a trend that has been largely attributed to the passage of Title IX to the Educational Amendments of 1972 and greater societal interest in health and fitness (Creedon, 1994b; Leath & Lumpkin, 1992; MacNeill, 1988). Marketing attention and media exposure of women's sports have grown, as well (Donohue, 1999; Fink, 1998). The sports media environment has undergone changes including the fragmenting of the sports audience due to the rise of new sports media. Sports-related websites launched by athletes, sports leagues, franchises, event organizers, and commercial on-line services are increasingly challenging traditional sports media mainstays (Johnson, 1999; Quick, 1998). Fueled by surging audience demand, enormous e-commerce potential, and competitive necessity (Gellatly, 1998), traditional sports media have reinvented themselves. Since the mid-1990's, organizations such as ESPN, Sports Illustrated, Fox Sports, Sporting News, and CBS, have staked out their cyberspace, often in partnership with other media providers (McDaniel & Sullivan, 1998; Stoddart, 1997). The top three sports websites, ESPN.com, CBS SportsLine.com, and CNNSI (Media Metrix, 1999), are all recognizable sports commodities.

Sports websites offer an integrated array of attractive features not concurrently found in traditional sports media. These include up-to-date scores, highlights, game analysis, discussion groups, fantasy leagues, polls, player statistics, gambling, and interactive contests (Carl, 1995; McDaniel & Sullivan, 1998; Quick, 1998; Stoddart, 1997; Tedesco, 1998; The NPD Group, 1999). These features are made possible because of the Internet's unique characteristics. Scholars have identified five functional dissimilarities distinguishing the medium from traditional mass media (December, 1996; McDaniel & Sullivan, 1998; Newhagen & Rafaeli, 1996). These characteristics include (1) asynchronous message delivery and consumption (a user can consume

media at his or her leisure); (2) non-linearity (a user can access information in a sequence that he or she determines); (3) non-hierarchical organization (a sender and a receiver have comparatively equal status); (4) dynamism (form and content are always changing); and (5) interactivity (a user can affect the output of information).

Although some researchers have argued that the Internet's dissimilarities with traditional media might make it possible to rupture strategies for representing gender—Miller (1995), for example, wrote that the World Wide Web's unique qualities might make it potentially more inclusive and empowering of women—other scholars have not been as optimistic. Spender (1995) argued that the Internet's governmental and academic origins have pre-defined the medium in patriarchal terms, fostering "rules of entry" (p. 196) that limit women's access. Her argument supports Light's (1995) contention that communications innovations, in spite of their potential for fostering democracy, have historically led to the consolidation of power by dominant groups.

The notion of power maintenance, wherein control is continually contested but almost always reclaimed by its original holders (MacNeill, 1988), is a central component of cultural hegemony theory. In the face of challenges, dominant groups aggressively re-position themselves to preserve influence (Simon, 1991). Tactics include extensive re-organization, the formation of new alliances, and the enlistment of supporting institutions. These institutions "strengthen adherence" (Curran, 1982, p. 227) to elite interests and help to maintain social stability when dominant ideologies and principles are challenged (Gitlin, 1980; Shoemaker & Reese, 1996). Gerbner (1978) found that news media support the establishment by discrediting, isolating, and undercutting resisters, tactics which Shoemaker and Reese (1996) have termed "repair techniques" (p. 249). In his influential analysis of mass media coverage of Students for a

Democratic Society in the 1960's, Gitlin (1980) found that media coverage of the group initially ignored and trivialized the group, then overemphasized its violent activities in later years. Dominant groups also employ a more subtle defensive strategy to counteract resistance: co-opting, or repackaging, popular currents or social movements (Gitlin, 1980; Tuchman, 1978a). Co-opting allows dominant groups to re-frame their positions so as not to appear too extreme or out of line with public sentiment, that is, to be "plausible and consistent" (Gamson & Modigliani, 1989, p. 4).

The move toward "mainstream" content may be one indicator that the Internet is being co-opted as its influence increasingly permeates mass culture. Upon release of the 1999 Internet study by the Pew Research Center for the People and the Press, its director, Andrew Kohut, noted, "Weather, entertainment, local news (on the Internet) all sound like the 6 o'clock news. As the Internet population becomes more mainstream, it will begin to look in its preferences, its habits and its behavior like general news audiences" (Noack, 1999, para. 8). If this contention holds true, it is unlikely that online sports coverage of women's sports would depart from the gender-specific framing strategies found in traditional sports media coverage. As Gitlin (1983) noted, "Technology opens doors, and oligopoly marches in, just behind, slamming them. There can be no technological fix for what is, after all, a social problem" (p. 332).

Increased formalization in the production of content may be a factor in the replication or rupturing of gendered representational strategies. The increasing structure given to layout and page design might serve to limit the actual amount of available space for news content, even though the Internet conceivably offers a boundless newshole. With male athletes considered more newsworthy, female athletes may again be marginalized. On the other hand, codification of website journalism practices could, conceivably, serve to mitigate reporter or editor bias as a

highly-structured script might govern how news items are constructed in terms of naming conventions, attribution, etc.

This project sought to address the following research questions:

RQ1. Is there a statistically significant difference in amount of coverage (i.e., number of stories and accompanying images) in leading news items by athlete gender?

RQ2. Is there a statistically significant difference in use of ambivalent news frames in leading news items by athlete gender?

Methodology

The study used quantitative content analysis, a research technique that was designed to provide an "objective, systematic, and quantitative description of the manifest content of communication" (Berelson, 1952, p. 18). Unlike more traditional content analyses, this study used two approaches to examine gender representation of female athletes. Descriptive indicators, as well as framing analysis, were used to examine marginalization and stereotyping, respectively. (As this was an exploratory study, analysis was restricted to a limited number of dimensions; this involved excluding descriptive indicators such as story length and photo size from analysis and also limiting analysis to one type of framing. This triangulated approach to measurement was chosen because it is considered more explanatory, accurate, and valid than those from more limited study designs (Creswell, 1994). Triangulated designs not only expose different facets of the phenomena being researched (Lacy & Riffe, 1993), but each method counters the others' weaknesses and reduces error (Brewer & Hunter, 1989; Lacy & Riffe, 1993; Singleton, Jr., Straits, Straits & McAllister, 1988).

Sampling Design

The study incorporated a multistage sampling design using purposive and random

sampling, a strategy that has been recommended by Stempel (1989). The choice of units of observation involved purposively selecting content sources (sports websites). Because of the study's exploratory nature, analysis was restricted to the three most popular general-interest sports websites. These sites were selected using the Top Rankings list of Media Metrix, an established Internet audience and e-commerce measurement firm that ranks usage of 15,000 sites based on metered data from a sample of 50,000 domestic users (Media Metrix, 1999). The three highest-ranked sports websites found on the Top Rankings list were ESPN.com, CBS SportsLine.com, and CNNSI.com. At the time of selection, these websites averaged between 2 and 5.3 million unique (i.e., unduplicated) monthly visitors, dwarfing competitors such as NASCAR Online, with 1.6 million visitors, NBA.com, with 1.4 million visitors, and NFL.com, with 680,000 visitors (Media Metrix, 1999). They are widely considered the leading sports websites, especially by avid fans (Fost, 2000; Snider, 1998).

The three sites are new media ventures of established and branded media conglomerates: ESPN.com is owned by The Walt Disney Co., CBS SportsLine.com by CBS, and CNNSI.com by Time Warner. Furthermore, all three are partnered or affiliated with television networks, sports leagues, and on-line content providers that allow the sites to leverage their formidable assets (Tedesco, 1999). ESPN is part of Go.com, CBS, part of SportsLine USA, and CNNSI, part of CNN group. The sites carry an array of pages targeted to specific sports.

Following the selection of content sources, sports pages common to all three sites were also purposively selected. Again, due to the exploratory nature of the study, analysis was restricted to three pages. These were the golf, soccer, and tennis pages. These pages were chosen because both women and men participate in these sports at the professional level (thus, providing a platform for comparison) and because these sports were in season during the study's

timeframe. Two of the sports (golf and tennis) primarily involve individual competition, and one (soccer) is a team sport.

The leading news item ("Top Story") found on each sports page was chosen as the unit of analysis because it embodies the most important and newsworthy news content. Located directly under the mast on all three sports pages, the Top Story comprised approximately one-third of the horizontal layout of the page layout. It typically included the following elements: images, captions, headlines, articles or short lead-in paragraphs, embedded text links, and links to story continuations. A header such as "More" or "Related links" signified when stories were continued on secondary pages.

Unlike units of observation, units of analysis were drawn using probability sampling. The month of May 2000 was chosen as the sample time frame because the women's and men's tours for all sports being analyzed were comparable in number of playing dates and status of events (i.e., a high-profile men's event did not eclipse a women's tournament). In May, female golfers played in six tournaments and males, nine; female soccer players played on seven days and males, eight; and female and male tennis players each played in 13 tournaments.

To reflect fluctuation in sports content throughout the day, data were collected daily at three intervals (or dayparts): between 10 a.m. and 2 p.m. (Daypart 1), 2 p.m. and 6 p.m. (Daypart 2), and 6 p.m. and 12 a.m. (Daypart 3). During each daypart, the researcher archived the front page for each sports page and then selected the hypertext link embedded in the lead-in paragraph in order to access the leading news item's story continuation. (If more than one hypertext link was embedded in the lead-in paragraph, the first link deemed relevant was accessed.) A total of 737 items were collected, with roughly 27 stories downloaded per day. (Two news items on ESPN's Golf page were not collected, as they were available only to premium [i.e., paid]

subscribers.)

Once data were collected, the units of analysis were randomly selected to represent one constructed week. The use of a constructed week is considered efficient (Riffe & Freitag, 1997; Riffe et al., 1996) and effective in countering the "cyclical variation" (Riffe, Aust & Lacy, 1993, p. 134) found in much news content. Cyclical variation refers to the daily fluctuation in news content usually attributed to advertising but which also has been found to result from sports event scheduling (Craig, 1992; Riffe et al., 1993). Data were first stratified by day of week, and, then, sample units were randomly selected to represent a typical week; an approximately equal number of content units were selected from all three websites and sports pages. To gather a sample of 315 units, all content units were grouped by day of week, then by sports page, and then by content source. Units were subdivided into 63 cells, with each cell containing between 9 and 14 news items. The sample units inside each cell were then sorted by date and time collected, and five news items were randomly selected to yield the desired sample size.

Instrument

The instrument included 16 questions, of which 7 were classified as Descriptive Indicators and 6 composed the Frame Analysis Index. Data from three administrative questions, which asked for date of coding, coder initials, and content unit identification number, were not analyzed.

The first section included descriptive indicators, such as number of stories and number of images, which are commonly used in quantitative content analysis (e.g., "counting and size" [Riffe et al., 1996, p. 637] and "space-and-time" [Kassarjian, 1977, p. 12] measures). Most variables constituted nominal level data. Questions accounted for the following variables (with question number in parentheses): day (Q4), content source (Q5), sports page (Q6), news item

type (Q7), primary subject (Q8), gender of primary subject (Q9), and number of images (Q10). A few of these items were pre-tested in an earlier preliminary analysis conducted by the researcher.

Coding ended at question seven if the news item type was classified into one of four categories (Interview, Instruction, Equipment and Apparel, or Business and Tournament Issues), as it was determined that these stories were not representative of other news content and would have insufficient commentary on athletes. This procedure eliminated 31 items from further analysis, making 284 the number of valid responses for the three other questions in this section and the remainder of the instrument.

The second section consisted of a series of six binomial yes or no questions, evaluating the presence of the Ambivalence Frame identified in the preceding chapter. The six questions (and their corresponding sub-frames) are, as follows:

Q11. Does the news item imply that the athlete struggled because of inherent weakness, not just a temporary injury? (weakness sub-frame)

Q12. Does the news item mention the athlete's status as a parent, child, sibling, spouse or romantic mate (e.g. boyfriend or girlfriend)? (status sub-frame)

Q13. Does the news item refer to the athlete's appearance, looks or sexuality? (appearance and sexuality sub-frame)

Q14. Does the news item attribute the athlete's performance to luck or happenstance? (luck sub-frame)

Q15. Does the news item credit or imply that others, such as coaches, agents, family or friends, are responsible for the athlete's performance (more than the athlete himself or herself)? (dependence sub-frame)

Q16. Is the overall news item trivial in tone (i.e., not hard news)? (trivialization sub-

frame)

For each question, coders marked "yes" or "no," indicating whether the sub-frame was used in the overall news item (including article, caption, and headline). During data analysis, each item that was marked "yes" was given a score of one, and each item that was marked "no" was given a score of zero. These combined indicators were summarized into a score assessing the degree of ambivalent framing. The scale is, as follows: 0 (no ambivalence), 1-2 (some ambivalence), 3-4 (moderately heavy ambivalence), and 5-6 (heavy ambivalence).

Coding

The researcher and an advanced undergraduate student receiving course credit, both of whom are female, assumed primary coding duties. The student assistant was given extensive training on conceptual definitions, an overview of the instrument, and instruction on coding, following recommendations made by Wimmer and Dominick (2000). Both coders received a printed set of varied sample units, comprising different content sources, sport pages, and days of week. Coding was performed independently, mostly manually onto pre-coded transfer sheets containing question information that were later input into an electronic spreadsheet.

Analysis

Data was statistically analyzed using the software application, SPSS for Windows (release 10.0.7). Descriptive statistics were used to assess number of articles (by site and sport), number of images, and FAI score distributions by athlete gender. Significance tests were performed to (1) assess the statistical relationship between gender and Top Story assignment, sports page, and content source; (2) assess the statistical relationship between gender and number of images and FAI score.

Validity and Reliability

The study relied upon face validity, as no other standardized measure of media stereotyping is reported in the literature. Face validity assumes that categorizations and operationalizations that are identified and uniformly agreed upon in the topical literature are valid. Though the method has sometimes been criticized for being too subjective (Singleton, Jr. et al., 1988; Weber, 1990), it is the most often used measure of validity in descriptive content analyses and is acceptable to many content analysis experts (Berelson, 1952; Holsti, 1969).

Following Riffe and Freitag's (1997) recommendation, sample units for the pre- test reliability check were drawn by stratified random selection to ensure representativeness. The sample size for the pre-test was determined using the formula outlined by both Riffe et al. (1993) and Lacy and Riffe (1996) to factor in sampling error. Using this formula, a sample size of 66 was chosen for the pre-test. One item was systematically selected from each of the 63 data cells that were used to draw the full sample; the three remaining items were chosen at random. The two primary coders independently coded each item in this sub-sample, as advised by Kolbe and Burnett (1991), Lacy and Riffe (1996), and Weber (1990). The mean percentage of agreement for Descriptive Indicators questions was 91, with scores ranging from 81 to 100. The mean percentage of agreement for Frame Analysis Index questions was 89, with scores ranging from 75 to 98. Before the test, questions comprising the Frame Analysis Index were re-worded to improve clarity.

For the assessment of post-test intercoder reliability, 11% (n = 34) of the news items in the full sample were selected for analysis using a random start and skip interval. As Wimmer and Dominick (2000) advised, fresh coders were used in judging. Fifteen undergraduate students (12 male and 3 female), who were enrolled in an advanced media research methods course, were

given an in-class coaching session of approximately 20 minutes. Afterwards, each coded approximately two news items (n = 25), as a class elective. (They completed 31 news items, but 6 were excluded because they were not completed according to instructions.) In addition, a male graduate student studying telecommunications independently coded nine items. All coders worked independently using their own judgment. Afterwards, their coding decisions were compared to those of the two primary coders. The mean percentage of agreement for Descriptive Indicators questions was 94, with scores ranging from 82 to 100. The mean percentage of agreement for Frame Analysis Index questions was 88, with scores ranging from 74 to 100.

Results

The first research question asked, Is there a statistically significant difference in amount of coverage (i.e., number of stories and accompanying images) in leading news items by athlete gender? Regarding number of stories, the study found that stories focused on males across all pages, item types, and content sources. As shown in Table 1, female athletes were the primary subjects of far fewer Top Stories overall than were male athletes. They accounted for only 52 (18%) of the 284 articles analyzed. Assignment of primary subject to Top Story was statistically significantly different by gender, X^2 (1, N = 284) = 114.09, p < .001, as illustrated in Table 2.

[INSERT TABLES 1 AND 2 HERE]

Female athletes were the subjects of fewer Top Stories by sports page, as shown in Table 3. Female athletes accounted for only 9 (9%) of the 97 golf stories and only 7 (8%) of the 87 soccer stories. They accounted for slightly more tennis stories at 36 [36%] of the 100 stories. Assignment of primary subject to sports page was statistically significantly different by gender, X^2 (2, N = 284) = 32.34, p < .001, as shown in Table 4.

[INSERT TABLES 3 AND 4 HERE]

Female athletes were the subjects of fewer Top Stories by content source, as shown in Table 5. They comprised only 16 (16%) of CBS SportsLine.com, 16 (16%) of CNNSI.com, and 20 (24%) of ESPN.com leading news items. Assignment to content source was not statistically significantly different by gender, X^2 (2, N = 284) = 2.426, p = .297, as shown in Table 6.

[INSERT TABLES 5 AND 6 HERE]

Regarding photos, the study also found that male athletes dominated coverage across all pages, item types, and content sources. As shown in Table 7, stories with female athletes as primary subjects featured fewer photographic images than those with male athletes. The majority of the 52 female news items, 31 (60%), contained no image, whereas most of the 232 male news items, 114 (50%), contained one image. Only one news item with a female primary subject included two images, whereas 13 (6%) of those with a male primary subject had this number. As shown in Table 8, the mean number of images for female athletes was .42 (SD = .54), whereas the figure for men was .60 (SD = .59). This was statistically significant different by gender (t = -2.0127, df = 282, p = .0451).

[INSERT TABLES 7 AND 8 HERE]

The second research question asked, Is there a statistically significant difference in use of ambivalent news frames by athlete gender? Stories with female athletes as primary subjects were not found to be any more ambivalent than stories concerning male athletes. As shown in Table 9, 11 (62%) of female news items and 159 (69%) of male news items were coded as having no ambivalence (i.e., their index score was zero). Overall, most of the 284 valid items, 191 (67%), contained no ambivalence. Only 7 (35%) of female news items and 72 (31%) of male news items received a score between one and two, indicating some ambivalence. Furthermore, only two news items overall, one for each gender, were marked as having moderately heavy ambivalence.

None were marked as having heavy ambivalence. As shown in Table 10, the mean FAI score (with SD in parentheses) for female and male athletes was .50 (.73) and .38 (.60), respectively. Scores were not statistically significantly different by gender ($t = 1.153$, $df = 67.636$, $p = .253$).

[INSERT TABLES 9 AND 10 HERE]

Limitations

Due to the study's sample time frame, findings are necessarily delimited to the month of May 2000. They are further limited in scope because of the multistage sampling design. Although the units of analysis were chosen in a stratified random method (i.e. units were drawn to represent a constructed week from the whole month), the units of observation and sample time period were selected purposively.

Discussion

Although results are not generalizable, this pilot study suggests that some traditional sports media newswork practices, in particular selection of news items, may be in the process of being reconstituted in the on-line environment. It lends some preliminary support for the hypothesis that female athletes may not be considered as newsworthy as male athletes on sports websites. This finding is consistent with much traditional sports media scholarship indicating that female athletes receive fewer stories, segments, images, graphics, column inches, and on-air time than their male counterparts (e.g., Duncan & Messner, 1998; Kinnick, 1998; Tuggle, 1997). It suggests the possibility that web sports journalism may be shaped by the influences affecting traditional sports journalism. These influences include news values, professional practices (including reliance on sources), organizational structure, corporate interests, and unrelenting deadline pressure (Theberge & Cronk, 1994). Two of the factors identified by Shoemaker and Reese (1996) in their hierarchy of influences model, media routines and organizational pressures,

might be especially applicable. It is foreseeable that the routines and practices that make the daily production of traditional sports news feasible off-line might carry over onto on-line news production. It is also foreseeable that the highly interconnected relationship between the sports industry and sports media (Fink, 1998; Kinnick, 1998; MacNeill, 1988) would suggest continuing organizational pressure to defer to men's sports in on-line news content.

Given these findings, it is surprising that evidence of gender stereotyping in the form of ambivalent framing was not found in response to the second research question, as it would seem that strategies for representing gender have become deeply-rooted in news practice (Gamson & Modigliani, 1989; Pan & Kosicki, 1993). If sports media do not consider female athletes newsworthy, departure from standard practice in reporting on them seems inconsistent. Methodological issues associated with the Frame Analysis Index may have contributed to findings. Items on the Frame Analysis Index had lower reliability coefficients than those in the Descriptive Indicators section on both the pre- and post-test. Research indicates that coding of latent content is less reliable than that of manifest content because of the interpretation involved (Kolbe & Burnett, 1991; Wimmer & Dominick, 2000). Furthermore, factors such as category definition, coder instruction, and simple coding errors have also been found to affect reliability (Stempel, 1989; Weber, 1990). Sentence-level analysis, as recommended by Weber (1980), would have been a more appropriate unit of analysis, given that news items often contained multiple primary subjects. Coder training and motivation for the post-test interreliability assessment, especially, also might have hampered findings. Coding was performed in the absence of the class instructor, and time constraints, unfortunately, limited coding instruction to 20 minutes.

In her survey of published new media content analyses, McMillan (2000) noted that consensus is lacking on many procedural issues regarding the application of the method to Internet content. This study's findings are indicative of the difficulties of engaging in exploratory new media research (e.g., McDaniel & Sullivan, 1998; Morris & Ogan, 1996; Newhagen & Rafaeli, 1996). In future work, extensive focus should be given to instrument construction, and in-depth piloting and pre-testing should be performed. A more enhanced coding protocol, complemented by computer-aided content analysis, would, hopefully, lead to more efficient and reliable coding (Weber, 1990). As with much exploratory research, a triangulation of measures and methods, as advised by Lacy and Riffe (1993), might also prove beneficial not only in understanding the emerging production, textual, and reception processes which surround new sports media but in reducing error. A longer sample frame and the use of a broadened scope of analysis, encompassing content sources, sports pages, page content, and other variables, for example, would allow for a much more detailed and generalizable study.

Because of the fiercely competitive business pressures affecting new sports media (Fost, 2000; Gellatly, 1998; Johnson, 1999; Tedesco, 1999), textual, production, and reception practices will continue to evolve, presenting the opportunity for continual study. Messner's (1988) prediction that overtly biased media framing strategies would soon cease to be a "tenable strategy" (p. 74) in the coverage of female athletes remains to be tested in this new environment. This study, it is hoped, provides a framework for continuing the sociological investigation of the representation of female athletes on sports websites. Such work, as Duncan and Messner (1998) and Kinkema and Harris (1998) have both argued, needs to be undertaken.

References

American Association of University Women. (2001, January). Equity in school athletics [On-line position paper]. Available: http://www.aauw.org/1000/pospapers/

Berelson, B. (1952). Content analysis in communication research. Glencoe, IL: The Free Press.

Blinde, E. M., Greendorfer, S. L. & Sankner, R. J. (1991). Differential media coverage of men's and women's intercollegiate basketball: A reflection of gender ideology. Journal of Sport and Social Issues, 15(2), 98-114.

Brewer, J. & Hunter, A. (1989). Multimethod research: A synthesis of styles. Newbury Park, CA: Sage Publications, Inc.

Bruce, T. (1998, November). Audience frustration and pleasure: Women viewers confront televised women's basketball. Journal of Sports and Social Issues, 22(4), 373-397.

Bryson, L. (1994). Sport and the maintenance of masculine hegemony. In S. Birrell & C. L. Cole (Eds.), Women, sport, and culture (pp. 47-64). Champaign, IL: Human Kinetics.

Carl, J. (1995). How big is this league?: Sports sites are sprouting up everywhere, stirring concerns that a shakeout may be looming. Internet World [On-line serial]. Available: http://www.internetworld.com/print/1995/09/01/comm/1-5sports.html

Chalip, P. & Chalip, L. (1987). Olympic athletes as American heroes. In International Olympic Committee (1989), The Olympic movement and the mass media: Past, present, and future issues (pp. 11-3-11-26). Calgary, Canada: Harford Enterprises, Ltd.

Craig, R. S. (1992). The effectiveness of television day part on gender portrayals in television commercials: A content analysis. Sex Roles, 26(5/6), 197-211.

Creedon, P. J. (Ed.). (1993). The challenge of re-visioning gender values. In Women in mass communication (2nd ed., pp. 3-23). Newbury Park, CA: Sage Publications, Inc.

Creedon, P. J. (Ed.). (1994a). From the feminine mystique to the female physique: Uncovering the archetype of Artemis in sport. In Women, media and sport: Challenging gender values (pp. 275-299). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications, Inc.

Creedon, P. J. (Ed.). (1994b). From whalebone to spandex: Women and sports journalism in American magazines, photography and broadcasting. In Women, media and sport: Challenging gender values (pp. 108-158). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications, Inc.

Creswell, J. W. (1994). Qualitative & quantitative approaches. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications, Inc.

Curran, J. (1982). Communications, power and social order. In M. Gurevitch, T. Bennet, J. Curran, & J. Woollacott (Eds.) (1982/1995), Culture, society and the media (pp. 202-235). New York: Routledge.

December, J. (1996). Units of analysis for Internet communication. Journal of Communication, 46(1), 14-38.

Donohue, S. (1999, March 22). Women's tennis at the top of its game. Electronic Media, 18(2), 41-42.

Duncan, M. C. & Messner, M. A. (1998). The media image of sport and gender. In L. A. Wenner (Ed.), Mediasport (pp. 170-185). New York: Routledge.

Duncan, M. C., Messner, M. A., Williams, L., & Jensen, K. (1990). Gender stereotyping in televised sports. In S. Birrell & C. L. Cole (Eds.) (1994), Sport and culture (pp. 249-272). Champaign, IL: Human Kinetics.

Entman, R. M. (1993). Framing: Toward clarification of a fractured paradigm [Special Issue]. Journal of Communication, 43(4), 51-58.

ESPN CHILTON Sports Poll (1999). Almost 20% of U.S. population use PC to access sports news [On-line]. Available: http://www.sportspoll.com/20000211.doc.htm

Fink, J. S. (1998). Female athletes and the media. Journal of Physical Education, Recreation, and Dance, 69(6), 37-41.

Fish, M. (1998, September 24). Women in sports: Growing pains. WNBA puts its focus on feminine athletes. The Atlanta Constitution, p. G7.

Fiske, J. (1989). Reading the popular. New York: Routledge.

Fost, D. (2000, February 17). Competition heats up in fierce race for online sports supremacy. Bold Fox plan, new Sporting News owner join tussle for fans. San Francisco Chronicle (Final ed.), p. C1.

Fuller, L. K. (1987). Olympic access for women athletes, organizers and sports journalists. In International Olympic Committee (1989), The Olympic movement and the mass media: Past, present, and future issues (pp. 4-9-4-15). Calgary, Canada: Harford Enterprises, Ltd.

Gamson, W. A. (1989). News as framing: Comments on Graber. American Behavioral Scientist, 33(2), 157-161.

Gamson, W. A. & Modigliani, A. (1989). Media discourse and public opinion on nuclear power: A constructionist approach. American Journal of Sociology, 95(1), 1-37.

Gellatly, A. (1998, June 10). Online crowd-pullers: Internet selling over the web. Sports

web sites promise to be one of the most successful areas of Internet development. Financial Times (London ed.), p. 12.

Gerbner, G. (1978). The dynamics of cultural resistance. In G. Tuchman, A. K. Daniels, & J. Bent (Eds.), Hearth and home: Images of women in the mass media (pp. 46-50). New York: Oxford University Press.

Gitlin, T. (1980). The whole world is watching: Mass media in the making and unmaking of the new left. Los Angeles, CA: University of California Press.

Gitlin, T. (1983). Inside prime time. New York: Pantheon Books.

Goffman, E. (1974). Frame analysis: An essay on the organization of experience. New York: Harper Colophon Books.

Gramsci, A. (1971). Selections from the prison notebooks (Q. Hoare & G. N. Smith, Eds. and Trans.). New York: International Publishers.

Hall, S. (1982). The rediscovery of 'ideology': Return of the repressed in media studies. In M. Gurevitch, T. Bennet, J. Curran, & J. Woollacott (Eds.) (1982/1995) Culture, society and the media (pp. 56-90). New York: Routledge.

Hall, S. (1990). Encoding, decoding. In S. During (Ed.) (1999), The cultural studies reader (2nd ed., pp. 507-517). New York: Routledge.

Herman, E. S. & Chomsky, N. (1988). Manufacturing consent: The political economy of the mass media. New York: Pantheon Books.

Holsti, O. R. (1969). Content analysis for the social sciences and humanities. Reading, MA: Addison-Wesley Publishing Co.

Johnson, G. (1999, May 6). On the online playing field, competition for fans heats up; Sports media: Web sites scramble for their time and money as some say general interest in athletics is cooling. The Los Angeles Times (Record ed.), p. 8.

Jones, R. & Murrell, A. J. (1999). Pretty versus powerful in the sports pages. Journal of Sport and Social Issues, 23(2), 183-192.

Kane, M. J. (1996). Media coverage of the post Title IX female athlete: A feminist analysis of sport, gender and power. Duke Journal of Gender Law & Policy, 3(1), 95-127.

Kane, M. J. & Lenskyj, H. J. (1998). Media treatment of female athletes: Issues of gender and sexualities. In L. A. Wenner (Ed.), Mediasport (pp. 186-201). New York: Routledge.

Kassarjian, H. H. (1977). Content analysis in consumer research. Journal of Consumer Research, 4, 8-18.

Kinkema, K. M. & Harris, J. C. (1998). MediaSport studies: Key research and emerging issues. In L. A. Wenner (Ed.), Mediasport (pp. 27-53). New York: Routledge.

Kinnick, K. N. (1998). Gender bias in newspaper profiles of 1996 Olympic athletes: A content analysis of five major dailies. Women's Studies in Communication, 21(2), 212-237.

Kolbe, R. H. & Burnett, M. S. (1991). Content analysis research: An examination of applications with directives for improving research reliability and objectivity. Journal of Consumer Research, 18, 243-250.

Koppett, L. (1994). Sports illusion, sports reality: A reporter's view of sports, journalism, and society (2nd ed.). Urbana, IL: University of Illinois Press.

Krippendorff, K. (1980). Content analysis: An introduction to its methodology. Beverly Hills, CA: Sage Publications.

Lacy, S. & Riffe, D. (1996). Sampling error and selecting intercoder reliability samples for nominal content categories. Journalism & Mass Communication Quarterly, 73(4), 963-973.

Lacy, S. R. & Riffe, D. (1993). Sins of omission and commission in mass communication quantitative research. Journalism Quarterly, 70(1), 126-132.

Leath, V. M. & Lumpkin, A. (1992). An analysis of sportswomen on the covers and in the feature articles of Womens Sport & Fitness Magazine, 1975-1989. Journal of Sport and Social Issues, 16(2), 121-126.

Lenskyj, H. (1991). Women, sport and physical activity: Research and bibliography (2nd ed.). Ottawa, Canada: Canadian Communication Group Publishing.

Lieber, J. (1999, June 21). Changing face of sports: World Cup women hear high-pitched sound of 'girl power.' USA Today (Final ed.), p. 01A.

Light, J. S. (1995). The digital landscape: New space for women? Gender, place and culture: A journal of feminist geography, 2(2), 133-146.

Lowes, M. D. (1999). Inside the sports pages: Work routines, professional ideologies, and the manufacture of sports news. Toronto, Canada: University of Toronto Press.

MacNeill, M. (1988). Active women, media representations, and ideology. In S. Birrell & C. L. Cole (Eds.) (1994), Sport and culture (pp. 273-287). Champaign, IL: Human Kinetics.

McCarthy, M. (2000, December 12). Girl power: Advertisers shift focus to female athletes Tennis' Williams sisters lead endorsement charge. USA Today, p. B1.

McDaniel, S. R. & Sullivan, C. R. (1998). Extending the sports experience: Mediations in

cyberspace. In L. A. Wenner (Ed.), Mediasport (pp. 266-281). New York: Routledge.

McMillan, S. J. (2000). The microscope and the moving target: The challenge of applying content analysis to the World Wide Web. Journalism & Mass Communication Quarterly, 77(1), 80-98.

Media Metrix. (1999, December 21). Media Metrix releases the top 50 at home and at work digital media and web audience ratings in the U.S. for November 1999 [On-line]. Available: http://www.mediametrix.com/press/releases/199901221b.jsp

Messner, M. A. (1988). Sports and male domination: The female athlete as contested ideological terrain. In S. Birrell & C. L. Cole (Eds.) (1994), Women, sport, and culture (pp. 65-80). Champaign, IL: Human Kinetics.

Miller, L. (1995). Women and children first: Gender and the settling of the electronic frontier. In J. Brook & I. A. Boal (Eds.) (1995), Resisting the virtual life: The culture and politics of information. San Francisco, CA: City of Lights.

Morris, M. & Ogan, C. (1996). The Internet as mass medium. Journal of Communication, 46(1), 39-50.

Navarro, M. (2001, February 13). Women in sports cultivating new playing fields. New York Times (Special Report), p. A1.

Newhagen, J. E. & Rafaeli, S. (1996). Why communication researchers should study the Internet: A dialogue. Journal of Communication, 46(1), 4-13.

Noack, D. (1999, January 5). Online news audience becomes more mainstream: Major newspaper sites lose audience share. E & P Interactive [On-line]. Available: www.mediainfo.com/ephome/news/newshtm/stories/011599n2.htm

O'Connor, B. & Boyle, R. (1993). Dallas with balls: Televized sport, soap opera and male and female pleasures. Leisure Studies, 12, 107-119.

Olympics end with highs for women, lows for TV Games showcased best, worst of athletes. (2000, October 2). USA Today (Final Ed.), p. A17

Pan, Z. & Kosicki, G. M. (1993). Framing analysis: An approach to news discourse. Political Communication, 10(1), 55-75.

Pfister, G. (1987). Women in the Olympics (1952-1980): An analysis of German newspapers (beauty awards vs. gold medals). In International Olympic Committee (1989), The Olympic movement and the mass media: Past, present, and future issues (pp. 11-27-11-33). Calgary, Canada: Harford Enterprises, Ltd.

Quick, R. (1998, September 3). For sports fans, the Internet is a whole new ball game—They get stats, chat, gambling and play-by-play. Wall Street Journal (Eastern ed.), p. B-9.

Riffe, D. & Freitag, A. (1997). A content analysis of content analyses: Twenty-five years of Journalism Quarterly. Journalism & Mass Communication Quarterly, 74(4), 873-882.

Riffe, D., Aust, C. F. & Lacy, S. R. (1993). The effectiveness of random, consecutive day and constructed week sampling in newspaper content analysis. Journalism Quarterly, 70(1), 133-139.

Sabo, D. & Jansen, S. C. (1998). Prometheus unbound: Constructions of masculinity in the sports media. In L. A. Wenner (Ed.), Mediasport (pp. 202-217). New York: Routledge.

Sage, G. H. (1998). Power and ideology in American sport: A critical perspective (2nd ed.). Champaign, IL: Human Kinetics.

Shoemaker, P. J. & Reese, S. D. (1996). Mediating the message: Theories of influences on mass media content (2nd ed.). White Plains, NY: Longman Publishers, USA.

Simon, R. (1991). Gramsci's political thought: An introduction. London, England: Lawrence & Wishart.

Singleton, Jr., R., Straits, B. C., Straits, M. M., & McAllister, R. J. (1988). Approaches to social research. New York: Oxford University Press.

Snider, M. (1998, March 25). A dead heat in Internet sports. USA Today (Final ed.), p. D7.

Spender, D. (1995). Nattering on the net: Women, power and cyberspace. North Melbourne, Australia: Spinifex Press.

Stempel III, G. H. (1989). Content analysis. In G. H. Stempel III & B. H. Westley (Eds.), Research methods in mass communication (2nd ed., pp. 124-136). Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall, Inc.

Stoddart, B. (1997, February). Convergence: Sport on the information superhigway. Journal of Sport and Social Issues, 21(1), 93-102.

Tedesco, R. (1998, July 13). World Cup brings hits by the million. Broadcasting and Cable, 128(29), 50.

Tedesco, R. (1999, September 6). Staying ahead of the game. Broadcasting & Cable, 129(37), 54.

The NPD Group, Inc. (1999, April 19). Sports news web sites are not just for the boys, reports NPD Online Research [On-line]. Available: www.npd.com/press/press990419.htm

Theberge, N. & Cronk, A. (1994). Newspaper sports departments and the coverage of women's sports. In S. Birrell & C. L. Cole (Eds.), Women, sport and culture (pp. 289-298). Champaign, IL: Human Kinetics.

Tuchman, G. (1978a). Making news: A study in the construction of reality. New York: Free Press.

Tuchman, G. (1978b). The newspaper as a social movement's resource. In G. Tuchman, A. K. Daniels & J. Bent (Eds.), Hearth and home: Images of women in the mass media (pp. 186-215). New York: Oxford University Press.

Tuggle, C. A. (1997). Differences in television sports reporting of men's and women's athletics: ESPN Sports Center and CNN Sports Tonight. Journal of Broadcasting and Electronic Management, 41, 14-24.

Tuggle, C. A. & Owen, A. (1999). A descriptive analysis of NBC's coverage of the centennial Olympics. Journal of Sport and Social Issues, 23(2), 171-182.

Weber, R. P. (1990). Basic content analysis (2nd ed.). Newbury Park, CA: Sage Publications, Inc.

Wenner, L. A. & Gantz, W. (1998). Watching sports on television: Audience experience, gender, fanship, and marriage. In L. A. Wenner (Ed.), Mediasport (pp. 233-251). New York: Routledge.

Whitson, D. (1994). The embodiment of gender: Discipline, domination, and empowerment. In S. Birrell, & C. L. Cole (Eds.), Women, sport, and culture (pp. 353-371). Champaign, IL: Human Kinetics.

Willis, P. (1982). Women in sport in ideology. In S. Birrell & C. L. Cole (Eds.) (1994), Women, sport, and culture. Champaign, IL: Human Kinetics.

Wimmer, R. D. & Dominick, J. R. (2000). Mass media research: An introduction. New York: Wadsworth Publishing Company.

WUSA unveils nicknames, logos and venues. (2000, November 2). CBS SportsLine. [On-line]. Available: http://cbs.sportsline.com/u/wire/stories/0,1169,2972155_5,00.html

Appendices

Table 1

Assignment of Primary Subject to Top Story Item Type by Gender

	Primary Subject Gender					
	Female		Male		Total	
Item Type	N	%	N	%	N	%
Feature Profile	5	2	17	6	22	8
Game Analysis/Update	43	15	149	52	192	68
Commentary	2	1	14	5	16	6
Other	2	1	52	18	54	19
Total	52	18	232	82	284	100

Note. Primary subject gender was not coded for Top Stories classified into one of the following item types (Interview, Instruction, Equipment/Apparel, and Business/Tournament Issues).

Table 2

Chi-square for Assignment of Primary Subject to Top Story by Gender

	Primary Subject Gender				
	Female		Male		Total
Top Story	Obs	(Exp)	Obs	(Exp)	Obs
Yes	52	(142)	232	(142)	282

Note. Obs indicates observed value; exp indicates expected value.

X^2 (1, N = 284) = 114.09, p < .001.

Table 3

Assignment of Primary Subject to Sports Page by Gender

	Primary Subject Gender					
	Female		Male		Total	
Sports Page	N	%	N	%	N	%
Golf	9	3	88	31	97	34
Soccer	7	2	80	28	87	31
Tennis	36	13	64	23	100	35
Total	52	18	232	82	284	100

Table 4

Chi-square for Assignment of Primary Subject to Sports Page by Gender

	Primary Subject Gender				
	Female		Male		Total
Sports Page	Obs	(Exp)	Obs	(Exp)	Obs
Golf	9	(17.76)	88	(79.24)	97
Soccer	7	(15.93)	80	(71.07)	87
Tennis	36	(18.31)	64	(81.69)	100
Total	52		232		284

Note. Obs indicates observed value; exp indicates expected value.

X^2 (2, n = 284) = 32.34, p < .001; Cramer's V = .337.

Table 5

Assignment of Primary Subject to Content Source by Gender

	Primary Subject Gender					
	Female		Male		Total	
Content Source	N	%	N	%	N	%
CBS SportsLine.com	16	6	82	29	98	35
CNNSI.com	16	6	86	30	102	36
ESPN.com	20	7	64	23	84	30
Total	52	18	232	82	284	100

Table 6

Chi-square for Assignment of Primary Subject to Content Source by Gender

	Primary Subject Gender				
	Female		Male		Total
Content Source	Obs	(Exp)	Obs	(Exp)	Obs
CBS SportsLine.com	16	(17.94)	82	(80.01)	98
CNNSI.com	16	(18.68)	86	(83.32)	102
ESPN.com	20	(15.38)	64	(68.62)	84
Total	52		232		284

Note. Obs indicates observed value; exp indicates expected value.

* X^2 (2, N = 284) = 2.426, p = .297; Cramer's V = .092.

Table 7

Number of Images in Top Story by Primary Subject Gender

	Primary Subject Gender					
	Female		Male		Total	
Number of Images	N	%	N	%	N	%
0	31	11	105	37	136	48
1	20	7	114	40	134	47
2	1	0	13	5	14	5
Total	52	18	232	82	284	100

Note. No item contained more than two images.

Table 8

T-test for Number of Images in Top Story by Primary Subject Gender

	Primary Subject Gender	
Number of Images	Female	Male
N	7.00	45.00
M	0.42	0.60
SD	0.54	0.59

$t = -2.0127$, $df = 282$, $p = .0451$

Table 9

Distribution of FAI Scores by Primary Subject Gender

	Primary Subject Gender					
	Female		Male		Total	
Score	N	%	N	%	N	%
0	32	11	159	56	191	67
1-2	19	7	72	25	91	32
3-4	1	0	1	0	2	1
5-6	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total	52	18	232	82	284	100

Note. Scores corresponded to 6-point scale: 0 (no ambivalence), 1-2 (some ambivalence), 3-4 (moderately heavy ambivalence), and 5-6 (heavy ambivalence). FAI = Frame Analysis Index.

Table 10

T-test for FAI Score by Primary Subject Gender

	Primary Subject Gender	
FAI Score	Female	Male
N	52.00	232.00
M	0.50	0.38
SD	0.73	0.60

Note. FAI = Frame Analysis Index.

$t = 1.153$, $df = 67.636$, $p = .253$.

Resuscitating Feminist Audience Studies: Revisiting the Politics of Representation and Resistance

Radhika E. Parameswaran
Assistant Professor
School of Journalism
Ernie Pyle Hall
Indiana University
Bloomington, IN 47408
(O) (812) 855-8569 (H) (765) 352-0023
e-mail: rparames@indiana.edu

Top Faculty Paper Award
Paper presented at Commission on the Status of Women Division
AEJMC 2001, Washington DC

Resuscitating Feminist Audience Studies: Revisiting the Politics of Representation and Resistance

Questions of what constitutes the most appropriate object of study and related debates over the academy's potential to challenge structures of domination have come to occupy a central position in recent speculations on the future of cultural studies. One crucial strand linking these critiques of cultural studies in the United States is a growing dissatisfaction with the celebratory tenor of media reception studies, which have claimed that readers'/viewers' interpretive creativity offers evidence of subversive political resistance in audiences' everyday lives. In arguing for a reinvigorated approach to media audiences, one that insists on recentering issues of ideology and power, this paper builds on and responds to those critiques of populist audience ethnographies that have attempted to recuperate cultural studies' originary allegiances to a progressive politics of race, class, and gender. I articulate my engagement with the politics of knowledge production and audience representation in cultural studies through the lens of my specific location within a newly emerging body of work in postcolonial feminist media studies.

This paper's discussion comprises four parts. The first section contends that in battling tendencies toward audience populism and media polysemy, First World cultural studies critics, who urge the abandonment of audience ethnography and a nostalgic return to media texts and political economy, fail to recognize the racial privilege and ethnocentrism that lurks beneath the surface of their prescriptive arguments. I suggest that instead of ignoring the audience (women or men), what we need at this specific juncture, when corporate globalization is eager to conquer new territories and religious fundamentalism endeavors to capture the imagination of local and transnational diasporic communities, is a renewed commitment to discovering global media's role in constraining and enabling progressive social-democratic practices. In the second and third parts, I address critiques of the problematic ways in which some strains of ethnographic audience research have theorized the import and implications of audiences' interpretive skills. In these two sections where I draw on my research among young middle- and upper-class women in India, I show that historically inflected and locally contextualized feminist

audience studies can avoid the pitfalls of resurrecting the autonomous, rational, identifiable, and predictable subject of Enlightenment and capitalist discourses.

The Limits of Multiculturalism/Internationalism in Cultural Studies: Challenging Western Ethnocentrism

Following the boom in media reception studies during the eighties, a slowly brewing backlash against empirical audience research has been steadily gaining momentum. Within the field of feminist cultural studies, for instance, Janice Radway's ethnographic research on romance reading in the United States was first hailed as a pioneering effort to rectify the self-indulgent tendencies of textual analyses and the elitist economic determinism of the Frankfurt School and political economy (Allor, 1988; Markert, 1985; Newman, 1988; Schudson, 1987; Schwictenberg, 1989). Gradually, however, Radway's research on romance readers was criticized for its exclusive focus on middle-class readers and for her failure to theorize the impact of readers' class positions on their interpretations of popular literature (Press, 1986). Another critical response to Radway's work has suggested that in her over-reliance on individual readers' statements, Radway did not adequately account for the larger social/material context of women's lives, and for the possibility that interviewees, in their extreme anxiousness to please the feminist ethnographer, could have been less than forthcoming about the realities of their lives (McRobbie, 1990). Echoing these concerns about the importance of studying the social and economic contexts that surround media reception, recent critics of populist audience studies have also argued that ethnographies, which celebrate audiences' consumption practices as effective forms of resistance, ultimately disavow the unequal distribution of economic resources and cultural capital in society (Angus et al, 1989; Budd, Entman, & Steinman, 1990; Carragee, 1990; Clarke, 1990).

While the above critiques directed against Radway's work were articulated in the spirit of advancing and improving the feminist project of audience ethnography, textual critic Tania Modelski went one step further when she attacked Radway (and feminist ethnographers in general) for embracing the ideology of mass culture. Modleski (1986) argued that the danger of ethnography lies in the fact that "critics immersed in their [the audience's] culture, half in love with their subject are incapable of achieving a critical distance from it" (p. xii). Targeting feminist ethnographic research on women

audiences in particular, Modleski charged that in mindlessly celebrating the "micro-resistant" viewing/reading practices of female soap opera fans and romance novel readers, feminist scholars have naively colluded with capitalist entities; when confronted with charges of cultural colonization and manipulation, corporations' rhetoric of defense is to argue that discerning consumers have the power to choose, accept, and reject commercial culture in a "free marketplace." Similarly, other critics advocating political economy approaches to media studies have alleged that audience ethnographies (painting them with a broad stroke) have led cultural studies away from its original intent of intervening into and challenging the power of dominant social and economic institutions (Garnham, 1995; Kellner, 1995; Murdock, 1989).

In some cases, despair over ethnographic audience studies' repeated production of the resistive consumer, a subject who is excised from her ideologically infused economic context, has led critics to renounce any progressive possibilities for empirical audience research. In a leading undergraduate cultural studies text on race, gender, and class in the media, the introductory chapter outlined and reviewed production, textual, and audience approaches to cultural studies (Dines & Humez, 1995). In the section on audience studies, after citing numerous problems with populist ethnographies of media reception (avoidance of class, lack of attention to media ownership and marketing), the author concluded that one solution to ending the celebration of the active audience at the expense of mapping out the social structures of late capitalism was to avoid the human audience altogether: "A new way, in fact, to study media effects is to use computer databases that collect references to media texts (such as Dialog or Nexis/Lexis) and to trace the effects of media artifacts through analysis of references to them in the news media" (Kellner, 1995, p. 14). Although it is crucial to examine the ways in which audiences (as consumers or as citizens) enter and circulate in a variety of media zones in the public sphere, analysis of the imagined audience alone cannot speak for the complexities of everyday social experience.

A vital, ongoing critique of research is essential for promoting self-reflexivity in cultural studies, which strives to be continuously vigilant of its own modes and practices of knowledge production, however, at recent conferences and other academic settings, it has become trendy to arbitrarily question

the value of empirical audience research. One mode of demonstrating a sympathetic alignment with grass-roots activism, socialist political practice, and ideological critique is to distance oneself from the field of audience studies and the research practice of ethnography. Assumptions guiding critiques that frame the return to textual analyses/political economy as an antidote to problems with audience research include the notion that audience studies cannot release itself from the trap of regurgitating John Fiske's early emphasis on subversion/polysemy and the belief that the field has produced "all that we need to know" about audience activity.

As feminist scholars and activists working within the academy, it is critical that we interrogate trends in academic research before we participate in or endorse research agendas that gain currency as the latest "fashion." In fact, many of the problems with ethnographic audience research in the United States including the facile insistence on polysemy and preoccupation with viewers/readers' individualized voices and interpretations, can themselves be traced to the appetite for "cutting edge" theories and the impulse to promote a culture of academic stardom and celebrity (Moran, 1998). The temptation to earn cultural capital by blindly emulating academic celebrities' theories or research can lead to the unreflexive recycling of reified terms, concepts, and categories. Postcolonial feminist Keya Ganguly (1992, p. 69) questions the politics of feminist audience researchers who "take up the latest critical practice as they do clothing fashions," but she also argues against the disciplinary divisions created by those who posit the only analytical possibility for audience studies research as located in the banal reaffirmation of the active and engaged consumer. Joining Ganguly's project to recuperate a politics of accountability for audience studies, I argue that in deliberately turning away from the audience as an object of study, we are throwing the "baby out with the bathwater." Rather than leaving the audience behind, cultural studies can begin to seek out refinements in interpretive theories and new modes of analyses that will enable us to productively explore the relationship between structures of power and audiences' everyday media consumption practices.

Moreover, arguments for burying the field of audience ethnography and moving on to new pastures fail to acknowledge the implications of such critiques for a progressive politics of representation that does not overlook the historical marginalization of race and ethnicity in the academy.

It is dangerous to pretend that the body of work on white metropolitan audiences in mass media research and cultural studies can masquerade with its "unnamed, universalizing normativity as knowledge of audiences everywhere" (Juluri, 1998, p. 85). Examining the corpus of writings in feminist cultural studies, for instance, it becomes apparent that until very recently, ethnographic research on audience activity was mostly confined to the experiences of White women audiences in the First World. Numerous studies produced in the eighties and early nineties have analyzed White women's interactions with popular culture (Ang, 1985; Brown, 1994; Brundson, 1981; McRobbie, 1990; Moffitt, 1990; Press, 1991; Radway, 1984; Thurston, 1988), but the publication of audience research on women of color and non-Western/immigrant women is still a fairly recent phenomenon (Bobo, 1995; Gillespie, 1995; Durham, 1999; Duke, 2000; Parameswaran, 1999). Reviewing feminist research on popular fiction, Lana Rakow (1989) observed that although ethnographies of romance reading have accounted for White women's gendered experiences in a patriarchal culture, these studies cannot address the ways in which race, class, and ethnicity shape Black or Hispanic women's reading practices. Commenting on the lack of research on romance reading in non-Western contexts, Margaret Jensen (1984) pointed to the increasing global reach of popular fiction written and produced in the West, "The home market (United States) is nearly saturated, but Harlequin's sales abroad have steadily increased (This international cultural penetration is another phenomenon worthy of study). What messages do readers in developing countries receive from North American romances? What impact do romances have on diverse national, racial, and ethnic cultures" (p. 161).

To date, despite the popular and widely-cited text *Cultural Studies Reader*'s (Grossberg, Nelson, & Treichler, 1992) claim that the field was witnessing an international boom (the text included few studies outside the U.S., U.K. and Australia), we have only initiated the process of describing and analyzing media structures, texts, and audience reception Latin America, Asia and Africa. Commenting on the powerful discourses of nostalgia and closure in the First World, which promote audience research as an enterprise of the past that has outlived its potential, postcolonial media scholar Vamsee Juluri (1998) writes, "As someone entering the field in the mid-1990s, I wonder what it means that the high moment of audience studies seems to have passed, perhaps to travel, like old American sitcoms, to

the rest of the world" (p. 86). Deconstructing the politics of race, class, and location that invisibly structures the games of publication, canonization, and contestation in cultural studies, Juluri urges critics in metropolitan Western academies to be aware of discourses and practices that render research on the Third World as a cross-culturalist footnote or appendix because it is "here, in the West, that the world in written into knowledge" (p. 85).

For postcolonial feminist ethnographers in the field of communication, it seems ironic that just as they have launched efforts to record and analyze non-Western women audiences' experiences with popular culture, cultural studies is eager to "pack up" and herald the demise of the audience as an object of study. The politics of temporality and canonicity in cultural studies, which produces the dilemma of "catching up" (Juluri, 1998, p. 87) for postcolonial audience researchers is in one sense similar to the discomfort that women's studies scholars and critical race theorists expressed when radical postmodernism began heralding the death of space, subjectivity, history, and resistance. While evaluating the strengths of postmodernism, feminist anthropologist Nita Kumar (1994) adopts a cautious approach to arguments that advocate a return to pure discourse and genealogy because she finds it important to "retain the subject for, let us say, political reasons, being unable to live up to the epistemological task of giving up subjectivity on having been denied it for so long and just discovering it" (p. 8). Yet another feminist, Rosi Braidotti (1987), skeptically notes the coterminous rise of postmodernism and the increasing numbers of immigrants and women of color within the humanities and social sciences, ". . . in order to announce the death of the subject, one must have first gained the right to speak as one" (p. 80). For postcolonial media ethnographers, empirical audience research offers an opportunity to generate alternative knowledges of the non-West, knowledges that revise, revisit, and complicate the narratives that have been fashioned by European/colonial anthropologists and administrators. Advising cultural studies scholars to embrace a sense of representation as deeply linked to intellectual practice, Juluri (1998) argues, "I am particularly invoking those of us who share the burden and privilege of certain kinds of colonialized and racialized subjectivities that allow us to speak as both insiders and outsiders, as transnational intellectuals and as representatives of specific national and or/local constituencies. I am concerned with the possibilities that are enabled in audience research

for a politics of representation involving third world/diasporic scholars of media as well as third world audiences" (86).

Ensuring that cultural studies pays attention to audiences in the rest of the world need not imply a vacuous, corporate vision of multiculturalism or a frenzied additive empiricism--our investment in progressive racial politics and goals of achieving inclusive forms of knowledge production need not lead to the mere addition of African, Indian, Chinese, or Malaysian women to the smorgasbord of existing audiences in the canon. Rather than being an additive afterthought, ethnographic audience studies in Asia and Africa can engage with questions that are germane to envisioning a new politics of audience research that interrogates the modes and practices of global capitalism and avoids essentialized conceptions of the viewer/reader. Instead of divorcing feminist analysis of audience activity from the macro-structures that govern everyday experiences, we can re-center issues of ideology, control, and power that constrain and shape the ephemeral process of meaning making. How can research on non-Western womens' encounters with discourses of tradition and modernity challenge us to rethink the ways in which we have approached agency, resistance, or compliance? What new light can colonial histories of the Third World shed on our understanding of global women audiences' consumption of Western media? How does global culture get appropriated in different geographic and cultural spaces to reinforce local meanings of power? In what ways can feminist audience studies in the non-Western world contribute to interdisciplinary critiques of colonialism and nationalism in postcolonial studies?

Gender, Resistance, and Colonial History

In my project on young urban middle- and upper-class Indian women's leisure reading practices, I analyze the cultural space occupied by the practice of popular romance fiction reading in women's everyday lives. I conducted ethnographic research for five months in Hyderabad, a city in South India and the capital of the state of Andhra Pradesh, among women between the ages of 17 and 21 years old. As part of my fieldwork, I moderated discussions about romance novels among seven groups of women; women in each group were friends before my arrival, and some women had known each other since their childhood. I conducted two- to three-hour-long interviews with 30 regular romance readers and read over a hundred novels they recommended. To gain insight into the discourses

about romance reading that young women encountered, I interviewed parents, teachers, library owners, publishers, and used-book vendors. My involvement in readers' everyday routines included "hanging out" with them at their colleges; joining their visits to lending libraries, restaurants, and movie theaters; accompanying them on shopping trips and picnics; and eating meals with women in their homes.

Typically, women from urban English-speaking middle- and upper-class communities read imported Western romance novels in India. Historically, middle-class urban Indian communities gained power and status through their access to economic and cultural capital—private school instruction, university education, and professional employment—during the colonial period. As members of the expanding Indian middle- and upper-classes, the women readers who shared their time with me belonged to a socioeconomic bloc whose purchasing power and desire to consume fueled the processes of economic liberalization and globalization (Varma, 1998, pp. 170-171). In the media's hegemonic visions of upward mobility for Indian citizens, the fantasy lifestyle of the urban Indian middle-classes is widely promoted as a symbol of postcolonial modernity. Hyper-visible images of middle- and upper-class urban Indian women circulate in the imaginary economies of consumerism and state discourse; these "modern" women represent the ideal subjects of success in models of national development and shape the aspirations of poor, working-class, and rural women.

Cultural studies scholars sympathetic to the project of refining ethnographic audience studies have argued for radically historicized and socially contextualized analyses of the processes that shape readers' identities (Ang, 1996). Commenting that audiences, not just media products created for consumption, are socially constructed and influenced by economic and social changes, Michael Schudson (1987) urges researchers to unravel the historical constitution of audiences because "audiences are not born but made" (p. 63). In his thoughtful essay on ethnography and media reception research, Timothy Gibson (2000) proposes a model of audience studies that would allow researchers to avoid the trap of becoming ensnared in the semiotic worlds of popular culture's fans and devotees (p. 253). Arguing for deep contextualization of audience activity while drawing from the writings of Morley (1986) and Hall (1980), Gibson proposes a three-pronged approach to

understanding how readers' interpretations are located within and against shifting fields of alliances, articulations, and historically-produced structures:

> ...three important sites of analysis that must be explored if the context of audience meaning-making is to be reconstructed. These three sites include (1) the media text and its discursive structures, (2) the overdetermined social positions occupied by readers of texts, and (3) the social context of use and interpretation. (p. 261)

As Gibson notes, when considered together these three sites underscore the profound importance of context because "the context of a practice or discourse is not the background necessary for analysis, it is the product or goal of analysis . . . analyses of the audience, then should rebuild the historical and social context--in essence the context of prior articulations--which structures a particular text/audience relationship" (p. 261). While Gibson's model subtly over-emphasizes the need to analyze the ways in which historically determined structures constrain the production of meaning, that is, induce audience passivity, what would an ethnography that historicized resistance against domination reveal? How can our knowledge of the historical formation of reading publics code particular leisure practices as "resistance" far before feminist ethnographers arrive in the field eager to discover women's everyday acts of resistance? In the case of romance reading in India, my project's ethnographic exploration of Indian women's interpretive agency was enriched by accounting for the impact of colonial reading histories on postcolonial leisure practices.

Although, on the surface, the circulation of romance novels in India offers evidence of global/Western media's economic power to become present in non-Western settings, in a historical sense, women's consumption of "trashy romances" in postcolonial India can be traced to the resistance the Indian reading public expressed against nineteenth century British colonial elites' project of civilization for the colonies. The sheer volume of print culture's material artifacts in urban spaces--hardcover fiction displayed in the windows of plush chain bookstores, magazines hung outside small bookstores in busy strip shopping areas, brightly-colored comics laid out on vendors' carts at train stations, and faded, damaged paperbacks spread out on pavements by used-book sellers--offers a glimpse of the vibrancy and range of leisure reading practices in postcolonial India. Urban Indian

women's contemporary English-language romance reading, co-existing alongside other reading practices, is historically linked to the arrival of print technology, the establishment of colonial educational institutions, the introduction and dissemination of the English language, and the importing of British novels into eighteenth and nineteenth century colonial India. Together, these political and economic events marked the ushering in of colonial modernity, the triggering of new forms of national consciousness, and the creation of reading publics in British India (Joshi, 1998; Dharwadker, 1997; Paddikal, 1993; Viswanathan, 1989).

Historicizing questions of Western domination that have preoccupied media scholars' writings on cultural imperialism in the post World War II era, Priya Joshi (1998) excavates data on urban Indians' reading preferences in the mid-to- late nineteenth century to "uncover the complicated processes at work in the transmission of culture between Britain and India" (p. 198). Questioning the politics of colonial histories that yield bland narratives of "imperial zealots" and "compliant natives," Joshi argues that an excessive emphasis on British imperial policies and pronouncements has concealed a more complex portrait of cross-cultural exchange that was taking place on the ground in colonial India. Combining the methodological insights of the history of the book and the sociology of reading, she attempts to document urban Indians' selective appropriation and consumption of British literature during colonialism, a process that challenges uni-dimensional propositions about Western cultural conquest in nineteenth century India.

Following the establishment of the English Education Act of 1835 by Baron Macaulay, who proposed that English language and literature would be instrumental in creating a "class of persons Indian in blood and colour, but English in taste, in opinions, in morals, and in intellect," British book imports to India gradually increased, and between 1850 and 1900, printed matter from Britain constituted almost 95% of all book imports into India (Joshi, 1998, p. 207). Initially, the colonial government encouraged publishers and booksellers in Britain to produce and export paperback editions to India by offering financial incentives. Gradually, as English-language literacy spread throughout urban Indian centers of commerce and politics, the growing numbers of readers in India became a highly lucrative market for British publishers. Colonial policies that constituted the English-language

reading public and the subsequent steady flow of printed material from Britain into India points to the potentially powerful effects of cultural and economic imperialism. However, Joshi argues that archival records of import statistics maintained during colonialism document the conditions of the colonial market, not the precise content of this market or the "archaeology of consumption" that emerged due to the creative agency expressed by Indian readers.

Turning to reading data contained within book advertisements and book reviews published in Indian newspapers between 1861 and 1881, Joshi demonstrates that contrary to the elitist/ethnocentric model of citizenship propagated in colonial education policies, urban Indians did not seek out those novels the colonial administration listed as ideal instruments to inculcate the best "English" values among the natives:

> For one, the "good" English novels that were part of the colonial curriculum and were entrusted with creating an Indian who was English in "taste, in opinions, in morals, and in intellect" were in practice not the novels sought out by Indian readers for leisure reading. The canon of popular literature and the books most avidly and spontaneously consumed by Indian readers were increasingly disjunct from those prescribed by the Department of Public Instruction. (p. 204)

Throughout the colonial period, Indian readers avidly sought out sensational, gothic, melodramatic, and sensational serial novels--middle-brow and pulp fiction--rather than novels of authored by Dickens, Austen, Eliot, Thackeray, Meredith, and the Brontes, which the colonial elites held in high esteem. Rejecting the confining codes of high realism in "good" English novels, Indian readers enthusiastically consumed anti-realist literary forms because these fictional genres shared a symbolic and structural affinity with older Indian literary forms, and as such "paradoxically bridged the gulf between the premodern world and modernity" (p.213). These anti-realist tales that were reminiscent of pre-modern Indian tales, myths, and epics permitted Indian readers entry into their fantasy worlds with few cross-cultural restrictions. Furthermore, numerous books of such minor authors as G.W.M. Reynolds, Marion Crawford, Marie Corelli, and G.P.R. James were translated into Marathi, Hindi, Urdu, Bengali, Tamil, Kannada, and Telugu, thus reaching a much wider audience of Indian readers

than the populace that could read in English. Joshi argues that ultimately, on probing the interstices between colonial policies and native readers' responses, scholars will have to acknowledge that the success of the novel and the constitution of the leisure reading public in India are rooted in the "failure of British high culture to penetrate fully the Indian marketplace of ideas" (p. 216). In Joshi's historical analysis of colonial interventions into India's reading culture, Indian readers' subtle yet significant practices of counterproduction became evident in their selective appropriation of specific forms of colonial modernity that could be easily assimilated into pre-existing indigenous imaginary landscapes.

What if my project's analysis of leisure reading moved from one historical site, which precipitated cross-cultural negotiations between West and non-West, to another historical moment in India's reading culture, one that points to the contentious debates that took place over gender, class, and women's consumption of pulp fiction within Indian communities? As Priya Joshi's work demonstrates, the Indian reading public's tastes for fiction subtly subverted the priorities of colonial imperatives to a certain degree. However, as fiction reading spread rapidly in the early part of the twentieth century, urban Indian readers' voracious appetite for pulp novels did not go unnoticed by elite Indian male intellectuals, who were at the vanguard of creating a nationalist, anti-colonial culture for the Indian middle-classes. In the southern state of Tamilnadu, a flood of novels, including adaptations and translations of popular British detective, romance, and melodrama series fiction, deluged Tamil society in the mid 1910s. Analyzing editorials, essays, and advertisements pertaining to fiction reading in Tamil periodicals between 1910 and 1930, Venkatachalapathy (1997) documents the reception accorded to vernacular fiction that closely imitated the styles of Western fiction among Tamil community leaders, writers, poets, and politicians.

Venkatachalapathy notes that Indian male public intellectuals expressed alarm and deep concern for the damaging effects that fiction reading would have on the average "gullible" reader, who supposedly lacked the critical skills to distinguish between fantasy and reality. Arguing that serial fiction would destroy Indian culture, these intellectuals argued that newly available popular pulp novels would only encourage unbridled Western materialism, corrupt spirituality, promote the use of poor language, and eventually limit the range of vocabulary used in Indian prose and poetry. Anxious about

the impact of cheap novels on the future of Tamil literary production, one leading Tamil writer remarked: "Contemporary novels spread the habits, customs, and attitudes of foreign countries and send the Tamil people tumbling into the abyss of immorality. The Tamil people who know not the true novel are gobbling up this trash like fowls eating termites" (quoted in Venkatachalapathy, 1997, p. 59).

Drawing attention to the gendered discourse that characterized intellectuals' strident criticism of fiction reading, Venkatachapathy writes that the most scathing comments in Tamil periodicals were reserved for the devastating impact sensational escapist narratives would have on Indian women, and hence the very moral fabric of a newly emerging national Hindu culture. As novels were published in increasing numbers and women flocked to read them, discourse in Tamil periodicals on women's fiction reading became deeply implicated within Indian elite males' fears over the unshackling of Indian women's sexuality by colonial modernity, a contaminating force that had the potential to fracture the essence of Hindu identity. In one text on Tamil womanhood, a prominent Tamil writer went so far as to entreat women not to physically "touch" these tales of titillation: "Young women should not be permitted to hear titillating stories, pseudo-novels, and other such stuff; nor should they even touch these books. Parents should take special care in this regard ..." (quoted in Venkatachalapathy, 1997, p. 62). Furthermore, Tamil authors who reproduced the styles of Western pulp fiction in vernacular novels, defended their work by strategically deploying women's sexual subjectivity as the litmus test for claiming respectability, "Dear readers, like my other novels this one too does not contain any repulsive aspects or words that are not fit to be read by chaste women" (quoted in Venkatachalapathy, 1997, p. 64). Following the agenda outlined by community leaders, elders in families, pandits, and officials in educational institutions began to forbid young women from reading fiction, and strove to prevent women's access to novels.

On shifting from one cross-cultural historical experience, which engendered the formation of an Indian reading public under conditions of Western domination, to another "internal" historical articulation, we see that Indian women readers struggled with the ideological authority of patriarchal discourses; ideas of besieged female sexuality and endangered Hindu morality became vehicles to convey male elites' passion for preserving the authenticity of indigenous culture. Middle-class Indian

women's early leisure reading experiences thus represented a gendered form of resistance against structures of domination on two levels--against high culture Western modernity and against the Indian patriarchal power structure that sought to control "native" women. Together, these two contexts point to the intricate associational network of historical events and discourses that organize and guide the trajectories of contemporary cultural phenomena.

On returning to my project's goal--investigating Indian women's pleasure in consuming imported English-language serial romance fiction in postcolonial India--we can see from the above discussion that audience ethnographies cannot be coded as naive voyages of discovery or recovery that hinge only upon the empiricist desire to reveal "real" (and contemporary) women informants' oppositional forms of resistance. A thick ethnographic reconstruction of contemporary reading practices in India would have to acknowledge, at the outset, that fiction reading is embedded within and shaped by the historical constitution of the Western text/non-Western audience relationship in colonial India. Regardless of the kinds of empirical data I hoped to gather in the field, data that would be eventually analyzed as evidence of resistance, submission, or coping mechanisms, my discussion of the subject positions occupied by Indian women romance readers had to engage with prior historical articulations against Western imperialism and local patriarchy.

While an extended discussion of young Indian women's interpretations of Western romance fiction is not possible here, a few examples will suffice to illustrate how strategies of resistance or compliance in contemporary urban Indian leisure practices are suffused with the legacies of historical articulations. Many young women Indian women, who participated in my ethnographic study, argued that they resented their parents' and English teachers' repeated admonishments that they should read English-language high culture--Shakespeare, Wordsworth, and Jane Austen--to improve their minds. Recuperating the class ideologies embedded in the adulation of high culture to express resistance, some women insisted that authority figures in their lives were ignorant of the redemptive, didactic qualities of formula fiction. Claiming pedagogic value in romance reading, these women suggested that new and difficult words, descriptions of far away lands, and details of material life in Western romance novels prepared them for careers, marriage, and cosmopolitan life in a rapidly modernizing India. Furthermore,

in defense of their romance reading, some women claimed a seamless affinity between Western narratives of romance and the elaborate traditions of erotic love and courtship in Indian (Hindu and Islamic) poetry and mythology. Speaking to the gendered aspects of women's consumption of imported fiction, some parents, elders, and teachers viewed young women's romance reading as a transgressive practice that violated codes of middle-class Indian feminine respectability. To negotiate discourses of discipline and disapproval, a few young women revealed that they covered romance fiction with newspaper, read in the privacy of their rooms at night, and ensured that they never left novels casually exposed in living and dining room areas.

Othering the West: Sexuality, Gender, and Agency

How can ethnographic audience studies in non-Western locations renew and elaborate cultural studies' vision of robust interdisciplinarity? How can feminist audience research on non-Western women's consumption of Western popular culture enrich and modify existing paradigms of First World-Third World relations? How can women audiences express resistance/struggles against oppression through historically inflected modes of Othering that can reinstate patriarchal forms of control over women's sexuality? By accounting for questions of cross-cultural reception to Western media images and ideologies, feminist audience studies has much to contribute to ongoing interdisciplinary concerns with Orientalism, Occidentalism, and hence to global understandings of East and West. Although Western media genres have been accessible to non-Western audiences for a long time, we have yet to unravel the contours of Occidentalism, that is, the East's modalities of Othering the West. The juxtaposition of Occidentalism with uni-dimensional theories of cultural imperialism offers the potential to generate anti-essentialist analyses of audience resistance as fluid, situated, and contingent. As the ensuing discussion of my research illustrates, non-Western audiences' resistance against the West can simultaneously announce allegiance to another power structure--the troubling resurgence of patriarchal nationalisms that are based in religious fundamentalism.

Edward Said's controversial book Orientalism, a pioneering literary contribution to postcolonial theory, sought to map out Europe's discursive construction of the Middle East (and the non-West) during Western colonial expansion and imperialism. Deeply influenced by Foucault's arguments about

the inextricable links between representation, ideology, and cultural/economic practices, Said explicitly approached his work as a political intervention into the relations of domination and hierarchy between East and West. Describing Orientalism as a discursive body of knowledge that facilitated, justified, and paved the way for Europe's colonization of Asia, Africa, and the Middle East, Said (1978) wrote:

> Orientalism—a way of coming to terms with the Orient that is based on the Orient's special place in European Western experience. The Orient is not only adjacent to Europe; it is also the place of Europe's greatest and richest and oldest colonies, the source of its civilization and its languages, its cultural contestant, and one of its deepest and most recurring images of the other. In addition, the Orient has helped to define Europe for the West as its contrasting image, idea, personality, and experience. (p. 7)

Said describes Orientalism, a regime of hierarchical representations that originated during colonial expansion, as a "Western style for dominating, restructuring, and having authority over the Orient." Since the publication of Orientalism in the late seventies, numerous scholars in anthropology, history, English, comparative literature, film studies, and Women's Studies have been inspired by Said's theoretical insights to deconstruct Othered/Orientalist representations of the non-West in a wide range of Western cultural texts.

Gradually, some postcolonial critics also began to modify, challenge, and revamp Said's paradigm of discursive domination because it subtly reproduced the epistemology of colonial discourse. As these critics argued, Orientalism was a binary, bifurcated mapping of the world into the stable oppositional categories of East-West, representer-represented, and powerful-powerless. Literary critic Dennis Porter (1994) writes that in his eagerness to confront Western hegemonic discourses, Said asserted the unified character of diverse European texts and experiences at the expense of counterhegemonic European voices that lingered at the periphery of the colonial empire. Porter suggests that Said's diagnosis of Orientalism was predicated on the very same problematic representational techniques he identified in Western images of the Middle East; over-generalization of diverse experiences, lack of attention to contradictions within European texts, and homogenization of texts across time and space. Revisiting two Western writers' early twentieth century travel narratives

that are typically identified as Orientalist texts, Porter discovers self doubt, emotional distance from the colonial metropole, and resistance to the hierarchical discursive practices that constituted the non-West as marginal. Yet others have argued that the warm reception accorded to Orientalism and related postcolonial scholarship in the Euroamerican academy has more to do with the petty politics of celebrity stardom within the academy rather than a radical politics that is genuinely interested in dismantling the West's cultural and economic domination of the world. Marxist critic Aijaz Ahmad (1994) proposes that Third World intellectuals seeking to position themselves within currently "hip" academic discourses and practices of marginality--the race/gender matrix--promote Orientalism/colonialism as their legitimate badges of oppression.

Notwithstanding such cynical musings about the institutionalization of postcolonial studies in the Western academy, critics in the social sciences have pointed out that Said's textual analysis of Orientalism in literature and art elides crucial questions of the colonized subject's agency. Examining discourses and practices of Othering within metropolitan China that were targeted at the Miao, a rural ethnic minority community living in the periphery of China's economy, feminist anthropologist Louisa Schein (2000) argues, "Pitting East and West as opposites in a dyadic, but unequal relation stopped short at the conclusion that the East is muted and therefore, by extension, rendered incapable of othering" (p. 103). Schein suggests that in accepting Said's formulation of Orientalism, scholars may unwittingly reproduce the East as a mute, passive participant in history, one that is incapable of producing or negotiating its own discourses of power and hierarchy. In her analysis of Japanese imperialism, Jennifer Robertson (1995) points out that such critiques as Orientalism "privilege Euro-American intellectual and theoretical trends as universal and obfuscate and neutralize the histories and legacies of non-Western imperialisms and associated 'othering' practices" (p. 973). Furthermore, as feminist social scientists, Louisa Schein (2000) and Laura Nader (1989) argue, Edward Said's analysis of Orientalism fails to explore how gender--the trope of the feminine--becomes a compelling cultural hinge of Otherness in Western views of the Eastern world and vice versa.

Curiously, despite its historical relevance for media and audience studies, Said's work has been rarely if ever discussed in media reception research on non-Western audiences or in the theoretical

debates that consider the impact of Western media imperialism on the Third World. In the much-cited book on cultural imperialism by John Tomlinson (1992) where he launched an impressive critique of the flawed thinking underlying previous "hypodermic needle" models of cross-cultural reading and viewing practices, Said's analysis of colonialism as a discursive regime of representations, which predated the global ubiquity of contemporary Western consumer culture, is missing. Although Tomlinson devotes an entire chapter to nationalism in the Third World, he does not raise the possibility that cultural imperialism can be cross-cut and mediated by Occidentalism, an obvious by-product of the non-Western world's steady exposure to Western media.

Defining Occidentalism as ideologically related to Orientalism, Xiaomei Chen (1995) writes, "Orientalism has been accompanied by instances of what might be termed Occidentalism, a discursive practice that, by constructing its Western Other, has allowed the Orient to participate actively and with indigenous creativity in the process of self appropriation, even after being appropriated and constructed by Western Others" (pp. 4-5). Chen notes that the seemingly unified discursive practice of Occidentalism, exists in a paradoxical relationship to the discursive practices of Orientalism, and in fact, shares with it many ideological techniques and strategies. Urging scholars to examine the mobile meanings and strategic uses of Occidentalism in specific locations, Chen argues that non-Western discourses on the Western world can become a means to enable liberation or oppression depending on the context within which it is articulated. Distancing himself from postcolonial paradigms that promote Orientalism and cultural imperialism as unified discourses of uninterrupted and homogenous power, Chen writes that Occidentalism, in some cases, can even become a metaphor for liberation from indigenous forms of oppression.

Pointing to the little knowledge we have of how the East constructs the West, Nader (1989) comments that the West has been accessible to non-Western peoples through a wide variety of global media forms, but the contours of Occidentalist discourse still remain a mystery. Reflecting on the little attention given to ethno-Occidentalism, that is, essentialist renderings of the West by members of the "primitive" non-Western societies that anthropologists have studied, James Carrier (1992) argues that although fieldworkers have informally recorded constructions of the West among "natives," such data

has rarely entered the world of published scholarly work. Carrier writes that non-Western informants' impressions of Western culture have remained scribbles in researchers' fieldnotes because this data was deemed to be marginal to the larger enterprise of producing knowledge on Western modernity's impact on Third World societies. Building on recent interdisciplinary responses to Said's arguments, feminist media ethnographies in the non-Western world, which explore the ways in which local audiences read and (mis)read representations of the West, can offer significant contributions to questions of cultural imperialism, gender, and audiences' agency.

My reception research suggests that the mechanisms underlying the production of Orientalist discourse--homogenizing, distancing, and exoticizing the racial object of desire--were also deeply implicated within non-Western women's descriptions of Western culture. Young women readers' interpretations of Western romances certainly showed some evidence of Western media's hegemonic authority; however, Indian women's Occidentalist descriptions of Western culture also drew on Hindu nationalist ideologies to construct the West as immoral, inferior, and homogenous. My discussion of Indian women's views of the West and White women, intertextual interpretations that oscillated between the "fantasy" of romance fiction and the "reality" of the Western world, does not intend to resurrect dyadic, binary ideas of East versus West. Rather, I want to demonstrate the self-conscious, historically specific and contingent ways in which Indian women readers deployed a specific form of Occidentalism--a pre-colonial legacy of Othering the West in India--to explain their tremendously productive responses to Western popular culture.

Middle-class urban Indian women's fascination for modernity disguised as Western material culture became apparent in their strong dislike for and rejection of mythological/historical romance novels. Most readers expressed their categorical preferences for romance fiction that described contemporary culture in the United States, United Kingdom, and other metropolitan tourist locations. As one reader Mallika explained, she found the contextual details in historical romance novels "boring, bland, and distracting" and besides, as other readers claimed, in their rapidly modernizing urban milieu in India, they were better off learning about the codes, practices, and symbols of Western cosmopolitan life. In a style reminiscent of consumer advertising (beauty products, food, and tourism), the "favorite"

novels that many readers recommended to me were filled with details of gourmet food, designer clothing, bathing rituals, cruises and vacations, landscaped gardens, and expensive homes. Young women strongly identified with the consumerist middle-class White heroine whose material and romantic fantasies were realized as she is gradually incorporated into the upper-class world of the affluent hero. Speaking in sharply gender-inflected narratives, some women informants argued that Western style consumerism mapped onto the bodies of White heroines in romance fiction allowed them to pursue individualistic "selfish" pleasure and thus gain temporary respite from the selflessness their families and communities expected from them as dutiful, honorable daughters.

Although Indian women expressed unqualified admiration for Western consumerism, their interpretations of the West shifted when they began sharing their opinions on courtship and sexuality in Western romance fiction. Explaining their reasons for turning to these novels for relaxation and entertainment, some women insisted that these "simple" stories allowed them escape from the restrictive norms of middle-class Hindu femininity that constrained the possibilities of romance in their own lives. I soon learned that Indian women readers' identification of romance fiction as "simple" was an insider classification that had little to do with my own judgment of these books as enacting a relatively simple and standard formula. Gently pointing out my mistake, several readers patiently clarified that the stories in Western romance fiction were simple because of the marked absence of secondary characters--parents, community members, family, and clergy--who exerted pressure on the heroes and heroines to conform to traditions or social conventions. Contrasting the unbounded quality of White heroines' pursuit of romance with the complexities and tensions of accommodating religious, class, and ethnic boundaries in their own lives, some women insisted that courtship in Western culture was a matter of free choice. Individuals in Western culture, some women claimed, had no obligations to family or kin, and did not have to fear isolation, exile or loss of family support because the penalties for disregarding tradition were non-existent or minimal. Seamlessly conflating fiction with reality, Indian women readers produced Occidentalism here through their construction of romance novels as transparent representations that reflected the West as a homogenous cultural space where social differences and hierarchies were invisible and easily surmounted.

If the fiction of romance in the West as a practice that transcended socio-economic hierarchies proved to be convincing to women, interestingly, they scornfully dismissed other ingredients of fictive representations in the very same popular novels as unrealistic fantasy. Women's skeptic evaluations of Western romance fiction as perpetuating "false" and inaccurate images, which distorted the disturbing truths they knew about the West, revolved around White heroines' virginal persona and the requisite happy endings that promised to last forever. Challenging the veracity of fictional descriptions of White heroines' sexually innocence, several women were surprised to hear that romance fiction was popular among women in many Western countries--this particular piece of fiction, according to them, bore little resemblance to their knowledge of "real" White women's sexuality. Several young women argued that, contrary to the representations of virginal White heroines in romance fiction, "real" White women were immoral and sexually promiscuous. In women's ideological distilling of Occidentalist difference, White women, in their essentialized and intractable Otherness, became problematic symbols of unregulated Western modernity.

Similarly, the happy endings in romance fiction became another site of Othering where women intertextually referred to "credible" sources of reality (the news, relatives living in the West, and travelers' stories) to foreground their concerns about the lack of morality in Western culture. Some readers argued that the "objective" news information they had about AIDS, divorces, teenage pregnancies, and child abuse in many Western nations exposed the happy ending in romance fiction as pure farce, a mere figment of authors' imagination. Women's discussions about moral chaos in Western culture were frequently accompanied by contrasting statements about the superior stability of Indian culture--Indian marriages lasted forever and Indian families were close, supportive, and united. Previous research shows that such constructions of the West as culturally/morally inferior cross regional, ethnic, and class boundaries in India. In her ethnography of Indian viewers' responses to television, feminist anthropologist Purnima Mankekar (1999) recounts that working-class and lower middle-class viewers who lived in and around New Delhi in North India, passionately defended India's greatest strengths as located in the loving and enduring Indian family and the loyal Indian wife and

mother. Mankekar's informants asserted their national identity by comparing the superior quality of moral life in India to the immoral and decadent West.

My informants' Occidentalist discourse, perceptually filtered through their immersion in Western popular literature, offers a counterpoint to Said's discussion of Orientalism. As critics of Orientalism have suggested, we have to account for the possibility that the West may become the Othered object of its own Others. What are the implications of Indian romance readers' Othering of the West for debates over cultural imperialism? Demonstrating the importance of approaching cultural imperialism as multi-layered and multi-dimensional, Indian women's responses demonstrated the power of Western culture at the level of fantasies related to transnational consumerism, but on another level, in the realm of the private sphere--family, kinship, and moral character--the West became an object of contempt and scorn.

Should postcolonial feminist ethnographers celebrate non-Western women audiences' Occidentalist reception to Western culture because it revises simplistic models of cultural imperialism? How does Indian women's Occidentalist representation of the West complicate questions of gender, agency, and resistance for feminst scholars? Advocating for deep contextualization in ethnography, Carrier (1992) writes that if scholars want to avoid essentializing concepts such as Occidentalism, what we discover in fieldwork must be situated against the backdrop of local structures and processes:

> The activities that an anthropologist observes takes place in a context that extends beyond the immediate situation. This point is hardly novel, but it bears repeating. Attention to relationships will help sensitize researchers to just how a particular society is linked to the larger world. Just as important, it will help motivate researchers to recognize the incongruities in what they observe" (p. 206).

On applying Carrier's advice about deep contextualization to Indian women's statements about the West, we can begin to understand the complexities of audiences' resistance to structures of power. Given the strong discourses of disapproval and anxiety I heard from elders, parents, and teachers regarding young women's transgressive pleasures in reading romance fiction, my informants' Occidentalist rendering of Western culture can be read as a strategic form of emotional justification.

While they enjoyed reading these books, they were eager to reassure me (and other authority figures) that it would not transform them into sexually active "White women." Many women spoke about concealing romance novels in secret hiding areas, reading books when parents were away at work, and combining visits to lending libraries to borrow books with other womanly/domestic chores so they could avoid constant surveillance. Reading romance fiction thus allowed these Indian women to partially resist norms of chaste Hindu middle-class femininity, yet in order to minimize and distance their feelings of guilt they turned to Occidentalism. Transposing promiscuous sexuality onto White women's bodies becomes a strategic defense to repress feelings of guilt, experience moral superiority, and respond to charges that these sexually explicit narratives could corrupt their minds.

Going beyond the immediate social context of their gendered experiences within families and communities, women's Occidentalism is also related to the political, economic, and ideological context of middle-class Hindu nationalism, which has been steadily on the rise in India. For the past decade, religious Hindu fundamentalism has gained a remarkable foothold among the Hindu middle-classes. Tensions around religion, communalism, and culture have become highly public issues in India, especially since the early nineties with the outbreak of violence and rioting between Hindus and Muslims during the Babri Masjid incident (Appadurai & Breckenridge, 1995; Basu et al, 1993; Basu, 1996; Nandy et al, 1995; Rajagopal, 1996; Setalwad, 1996). The Babri Masjid or Ramajanmaboomi incident took place on December 6, 1992, when a mob of Hindus belonging to various political and religious groups destroyed a mosque in the city of Ayodhya, in Uttar Pradesh, claiming that the mosque had been built by Muslim invaders on a site that was the original birthplace of the Hindu god Ram (Basu et al, 1993, p. viii). Since the Babri Masjid incident, the Bharatiya Janata Party, the Hindu nationalist party, and other associated Hindu revivalist organizations have been gaining political power and popularity among Hindu communities. Promoting Occidentalist views of the West, Hindu fundamentalist politicians, clergy, and community leaders have celebrated the enduring chastity and fidelity of the loyal Indian wife and mother, whose virtue, they have argued, distinguishes India from the West.

Analyzing contemporary Hindu nationalism in India and its continuities with nineteenth and twentieth century anti-colonial struggles, feminist scholars have critiqued the patriarchal representation of Indian womanhood that male social reformers strategically constructed to counter colonialism (Kandiyoti, 1991; Katrak, 1989; Mazumdar, 1994). Eager to challenge British colonizers' Orientalist descriptions of Indian/Hindu culture as barbaric, inferior, and heathen, upper-caste Indian male reformers responded to these racist representations by fashioning a nationalist discourse that emphasized cultural traditions, gender relations, and family values. In anti-colonial nationalism's symbolic construction of ideal Indian femininity, women, who were glorified as devoted wives and mothers, became the carriers of tradition. Partha Chatterjee (1989) locates the idealization of middle-class Hindu women as pure/virtuous within the ideology of Hindu nationalism, which proposed a powerful distinction between "inner/outer worlds," and correspondingly between "home, private/material world, public."

Arguing for the resilience of Hinduism, which had survived numerous invasions and British rule, nationalists argued that Indian culture was characterized by a distinctive morality that was absent in European culture. Seen as part of home, the private world, Indian women became symbols of this unpolluted inner life, and hence the ground for establishing difference from Western society. As Chatterjee notes, the desexualization of the bourgeois Hindu woman in post-independent India was achieved by displacing active female sexuality onto European and local racially and economically marginalized Others. The purity of educated upper-caste Hindu women was contrasted with two opposing images, one being the vulgar and sexually accessible low-caste, poor Indian woman (Rege, 1995) and the other of Western women as immoral and sexually licentious (Chatterjee, 1989). The ideological celebration of Indian women's chastity and fidelity was thus a crucial element of nationalism in colonial India. Middle-class Indian women readers' Occidentalist mapping of promiscuous sexuality on White women's bodies is thus a persistent legacy of nationalist ideology, which continues to inflect and structure numerous celebratory vernacular popular culture accounts of wholesome Indian romances, families, and communities.

Indian women's reliance on Occidentalist discourses to defuse criticism of their romance reading and declare their loyal alliance to their own culture reveals the contradictory qualities of audiences' resistance. From a feminist standpoint, Indian women's contrastive strategy of Othering the West is fraught with contradictions; seeking distance from the "promiscuity" of the White woman reiterates the very forms of control over their sexuality that they seek to disturb and rupture. Occidentalism and Orientalism are discourses of power that ultimately serve as mechanisms of control over women in the West and the East; both these discourses of domination use the comparative method of describing women's inferior status in the East or West to convince "native" women that they should be content with the status quo because they are "better off" or superior to "those" women. Discussing the ways in which covert and overt nationalisms deploy cultural comparison (Orientalist and Occidentalist) to control women, Laura Nader (1989) writes, "Misleading cultural comparisons support contentions of positional superiority, which divert attention from the processes, which are controlling women in both worlds" (p. 323). To date, Occidentalism may not have the global economic power of Orientalism; however, it does have power within specific national contexts where dominant religious groups gain power by promoting a return to the glorious days of tradition, a period when the nation in the guise of the "native" woman was unpolluted by imperialism.

The Politics of Representation and Resistance

How can cultural studies critics advance the field in a manner that does not silently reiterate racial/neocolonial power and privilege? To what extent does the promotion or marginalization of specific research agendas, at the expense of paying attention to the locations and ideological positions from which we speak, legitimize the hegemony of the West? Citing acute self-reflexivity in knowledge production as one of the driving forces in a postcolonial approach to communication and rhetoric, Raka Shome (1996) urges scholars to continuously situate academic discourses within the larger political and economic practices of nations:

> What is the ideology that operates in us that makes research agenda A seem more significant than research agenda B? How are we always already "interpellated" into examining A but not

> B? What does that interpellation say about our role in reproducing and participating in the hegemonic global domination of the rest by the West? (p. 46)

Examining the challenges that globalization poses for research practices and theorization in feminist communication scholarship, Radha Hegde (1998) writes, "Research is an expression of our location in a world connected by lines of power and cultural asymmetry" (p. 285). Taken together, Shome and Hegde point to the political critique of knowledge as the foundation for creating an academic space where scholars interrogate the modes through which we establish disciplinary authority. By unpacking the assumptions that invisibly guide the trajectories of our research practices and rejecting monologic models of writing and speaking, cultural studies scholars can lay "the epistemic basis for a genuine multiculturalism" (Hegde, 1998, p. 275) that facilitates the democratization of knowledge production.

This essay is one effort towards "decentering" and foregrounding global and racial hegemony in recent efforts to shape agendas for future cultural studies research. Predicting the premature death of audience studies because we believe the field has produced "enough" knowledge of media reception or because we cannot imagine better ways of conducting empirical research only reiterates a limited and hegemonic vision of internationalism and multiculturalism. Calling for all cultural studies scholars to participate in the critical activity of "outing whiteness," Shome (2000) suggests that we deconstruct the ways in which "whiteness remains the organizing principle of the social fabric and yet remains masked because of the normativity that this principle acquires in the social imaginary" (p. 367). Shome comments that by making visible to whites (and non-Whites) the everyday functioning of the normative and privileged locus of whiteness, whites can perhaps begin to acknowledge their participation in supporting their privileges as members of a globally dominant group, even if they accrue these privileges unintentionally.

Similarly, I suggest that feminist cultural studies scholars in the First World (regardless of racial/gender affiliations) must be aware of which specific audiences' voices and experiences we have recorded before we begin to sing requiems for the audience, or recommend a shift to other "more important" objects of study. Recuperating the insights of postmodernism and postcolonialism for a more nuanced feminist analysis of women's lived experiences in the era of globalization, Radha Hegde

(1998) writes, "The commitment to globalize the theoretical scope in communication needs an engagement with the meaning of experience" (p. 287). Highlighting the widespread global media presence of Western nations, a phenomenon that we have only begun to investigate, Said (1993) comments, "Rarely before in human history has there been so massive an intervention of force and ideas from one culture to another as there is today from America to the rest of the world" (p. 319). Research in audience studies has barely scratched the surface of the exploding mediascape in numerous non-Western locations where "global audiencehood" (Juluri, 1998) is implicated simultaneously within a range of Western media and local, vernacular cultural productions.

Rather than stretching, adding, or extending the canon whereby the problematic contours of the canon itself remain unchanged, how can audience studies in non-Western locations resuscitate the practice of feminist media ethnography? Drawing from constructive critiques of ethnographic research, feminist audience studies can avoid the uncritical reproduction of well-rehearsed, banal mantras of resistance, agency, and the active audience. Going beyond the immediacy of the text-reader interaction, we can instead begin to write "radically contextualized" ethnographies that reveal the intricate, multi-layered qualities of readers' responses to different structures of dominance. Describing the implications of a commitment to radical contextualization, Ien Ang (1996) writes, "What ethnographic work entails is a form of methodological situationalism, underscoring the thoroughly situated, always context-bound ways in which people encounter, use, interpret, enjoy, think and talk about television and other media in everyday life" (p. 70).

By carefully accounting for the role of local historical discourses in constituting national/gender identities, feminist ethnographic research in postcolonial contexts can productively explore the relationship between powerful structures of colonialism/patriarchy and women's consumption of popular culture. On historicizing middle-class Indian women's romance reading, we can see that contemporary cultural practices in urban India are shaped by and articulated through the ideological contexts of British colonialism and Hindu nationalism. On the one hand, despite the obvious evidence of cultural imperialism that could be inferred from the ubiquitous material presence of global Western media, Indian women readers' consumption of imported serial romance fiction belongs to a history of

Indians' subtle resistance against the civilizing mission of colonial high culture. On the other hand, unlike Indian men, the reading of pulp fiction for Indian women, who are interpellated as symbols of purity in nationalist ideology, invoked resistance against two structures of power--against colonialism and religious patriarchy. The feminist critical enterprise in the non-Western world, as Rey Chow (1993) points out, has to contend with more than the legacies of colonialism alone, "While for the non-Western world that something is imperialism, for the feminist it is also patriarchy" (p. 59).

Moreover, a critical feminist ethnography of media reception must acknowledge that the "process of weaving in and out of gendered systems of meaning is punctuated with contestation and resistance, as well as acquiescence" (Hegde, 1998, p. 288). Along with exploring how women resist structures of power, feminist media ethnographies should also explore the constraints on women's agency, that is, our analyses must interrogate how women function not just as women alone, but also as members of equally important and sometimes dominant class/religious/national communities. Radha Hegde's multi-sited approach to the project of recovering women's experiences is a productive, anti-essentialist vision of gender for feminist scholars in audience studies (Hegde, 1998):

> It is important when portraying the material conditions of cultural others that we do not impose a false unity by essentializing a cultural core and thereby produce lives as artifacts or, for example, romanticize the woman as victim. Only a partial, nuanced, accountable, and situated understanding can count as an engaged feminist account. A feminist standpoint is not merely the recapturing of women's experience. (Hegde, 1998, p. 289)

In India, as well as in other postcolonial locations, religious nationalism, drawing from the gender ideologies of nineteenth century nationalism and masquerading as a grass-roots response against Western imperialism, has gained political, economic, and social power. In Indian women's active engagement with virginal White heroines as false reflections of real White women's promiscuous sexuality, romance reading becomes a site of mis-identification and Othering; these popular culture texts provoked readers to resurrect the binary configurations of East and West, which are embedded in Occidentalist and Orientalist ideologies. Although middle-class Indian women's efforts to read romance novels signified resistance against norms that attempted to control women's sexual pleasure and agency,

articulating their resistance through an emphasis on the immorality of "foreign/Western women" simultaneously endorsed Occidentalist Hindu nationalism.

For postcolonial feminist ethnographers, scholarship in a multicultural context thus cannot be limited to the deconstruction of Western imperialism alone if the goal of our audience research in the non-West is to engage politically with difference--across nations, but also within the hegemonic context of the nation itself. Theories of the "Big, Bad West" cannot explain why young Indian women, who had repeatedly expressed a desire for freedom and escape from the demands of family and community, should resort to nationalism's Occidentalist renderings of the West to craft their romance reading as theoretical knowledge in the service of future matrimony (not for pre-marital sex). Radical contextualization of audience ethnographies in postcolonial locations thus involves probing into the legacies and problematic ideologies of colonial regimes, neo-colonial economies, and local nationalisms. Challenging nationalism along with imperialism becomes a crucial task for postcolonial feminist media ethnographers because "native chauvinism" (Dirlik, 1990, p. 401) with its regressive models of "native" women's identities and reversed binaries of "us" versus "them" only reproduces the epistemological legacies of colonial modernity.

References

Aijaz, A. (1994). Orientalism and after. In P. Williams and L. Chrisman (Eds.), Colonial discourse and postcolonial theory (pp. 162-171). New York: Columbia University Press.

Allor, M. (1988) . Relocating the site of the audience. Critical Studies in Mass Communication, 5 (September), 217-233.

Ang, I. (1985). Watching Dallas. London: Methuen.

Ang, I. (1996). Living room wars: Rethinking media audiences for a postmodern world. London: Routledge.

Angus, I., Jhally, S., Lewis, J., & Schwictenberg, C. (1989). Commentary: On pluralist apology. Critical Studies in Mass Communcation, 6, 441-449.

Appadurai, A., & Breckenridge, C. (1995). Public modernity in India. In C. Breckenridge (Ed.). Consuming modernity: Public culture in a South Asian world (pp. 1-20). Minneapolis, MN: University of Minnesota Press.

Basu, T., Datta, P., Sarkar, S., Sarkar, T, Sen, S. (1993). Khakhi shorts, saffron flags: Tracts for the times. New Delhi: Orient Longman Ltd.

Basu, A. (1996). Caste and class: The rise of Hindu nationalism in India. Harvard International Review (Summer), 28-31.

Bobo, J. (1995). Black women as cultural readers. New York: Columbia University Press.

Braidotti, R. (1987). Envy: Or with your brain and my looks. In A. Jardine and P. Smith (Eds.), Men in feminism (pp. 231-241). New York: Methuen.

Brown, M. E. (1994). Soap opera and women's talk: The pleasure of resistance. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Brundson, C. (1981). Crossroads: Notes on soap opera.Screen, 22 (4), 32-37.

Budd, M., Entman, R., & Steinman, C. (1990). The affirmative character of American cultural studies. Critical Studies in Mass Communication, 7, 169-184.

Carragee, K. (1990). Interpretive media study and interpretive social science. Critical Studies in Mass Communication, 7, 81-96.

Carrier, J. (1992). Occidentalism: The world turned upside down. American Ethnologist, 19 (2), 195-212.

Chatterjee, P. (1989). Colonialism, nationalism, and the colonialized women: The contest in India. American Ethnologist, 16 (November), 622-633.

Chen, X. (1995). Occidentalism: A theory of counter-discourse in Post-Mao China. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Chow, R. (1993). Writing diaspora: Tactics of intervention in contemporary cultural studies. Bloomington: Indiana University Press.

Clarke, J. (1990). Pessimism versus populism. In R. Butsch (Ed.), For fun and profit: The transformation of leisure into consumption (pp. 28-42). Philadelphia, PA: Temple University Press.

Dharwadker, V. (1997). Print culture and literary markets in colonial India. In J. Masten, P. Stallybrass, & N. Wickers (Eds.), Language machines (pp. 108-33). New York: Routledge.

Dines, G. & Humez, J. (1995). (Eds.). Gender, race, and class in media. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Dirlik, A. (1990). Culturalism as hegemonic ideology and liberating practice. In A. JanMohamed & D. Lloyd (Eds.), The nature and practice of minority discourse (pp. 394-431). New York: Oxford University Press.

Duke, L. (2000). Black in a blonde world: Race and girls' interpretations of the feminine ideal in teen magazines. Journalism & Mass Communication Quarterly, 77 (2), 367-392.

Durham, M. G. (1999). Girls, media, and the negotiation of sexuality: A study of race, class, and gender in adolescent peer groups. Journalism & Mass Communication Quarterly, 76 (2), 193-216.

Ganguly, K. (1992). Accounting for others: Feminism and representation. In L. Rakow (Ed.), Women making meaning (pp. 60-82). Routledge: New York.

Garnham, N. (1995). Political economy and cultural studies: Reconciliation or divorce? Critical Studies in Mass Communication, 12, 62-71.

Gibson, T. (2000). Beyond cultural populism: Notes toward the critical ethnography of media audiences. Journal of Communication Inquiry, 24 (3), 253-273.

Gillespie, M. (1995). Television, ethnicity, and cultural change. London: Routledge.

Grewal, I. (1996). Home and harem: Nation, gender, empire, and the cultures of travel. Durham: Duke University Press.

Grossberg, L., Nelson, C., & Treichler, P. (1992). Cultural Studies. New York: Routlegde.

Hall, S. (1980). Encoding/decoding. In S. Hall, D. Hobson, A. Lowe, & P. Willis (Eds.), Culture, media, & language (pp. 128-138). London: Hutchinson.

Hegde, R. (1998). A view from elsewhere: Locating difference and the politics of representation from a transnational feminist perspective. Communication Theory, 8 (3), 271-297.

Jayawardena, K. (1986). Feminism and nationalism in the Third World. London: Zed Books.

Jensen, M. (1984). Love's sweet return: The Harlequin story. Bowling Green, OH: Bowling Green State University Press.

Joshi, P. (1998). Culture and consumption: Fiction, the reading public, and the British novel in colonial India. In E. Greenspan & J. Rose (Eds.), Book History 1 (pp. 196-220). University Park, PA: The Pennsylvania State University Press.

Juluri, V. (1998). Globalizing audience studies: The Audience and its Landscape and Living Room Wars. Critical Studies in Mass Communication, 15, 85-90.

Kandiyoti, D. (1991). Identity and its discontents: Women and the nation. Millenium: Journal of international studies, 20 (3), 429-43.

Katrak, K. (1989). Decolonizing culture: Toward a theory for postcolonial women's texts. Modern Fiction Studies, 35 (1), 157-179.

Kellner, D. (1995). Cultural studies, multiculturalism, and media culture. In G. Dines & J. Humez (Eds.), Gender, race, and class in media (pp. 5-17). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Kumar, N. (Ed). (1994). Introduction. In N. Kumar (Ed.), Women as subjects: South Asian histories. Charlotesville, VA: University of Virginia Press.

Mankekar, P. (1999). Screening culture, viewing politics: An ethnography of television, womanhood, and nation. Durham, NC: Duke University Press.

Mazumdar, S. (1994). Moving away from a secular vision? Women, nation, and the cultural construction of Hindu India. In V. Moghadam (Ed.), Identity politics and women: Cultural reassertions and feminisms in international perspective (pp. 243-272). Boulder, Colorado: Westview Press.

Markert, J. (1985). Love's labors, Contemporary sociology, 14 (November), 682-84.

McRobbie, A. (1990). Feminism and youth culture. Boston: Unwin Hyman.

Modleski, T. (1986). Studies in entertainment: Critical approaches to mass culture. Bloomington, IN: Indiana University Press.

Moffitt, M. A. (1990). Understanding middle-class adolescent leisure: A cultural studies approach to romance reading. PhD diss., University of Illinois at Urbana Champaign.

Moran, J. (1998). Cultural studies and academic stardom. International Journal of Cultural Studies, 1 (1), 67-82.

Morley, D. (1986). Family television: Cultural power and domestic leisure. London: Comedia.

Murdock, G. (1989). Cultural studies: Missing links. Critical Studies in Mass Communication, 6, 436-440.

Nader, L. (1989). Orientalism, occidentalism, and women's lives. Cultural dynamics, 11 (3), 323-355.

Nandy, A., Trivedy, S., Mayaram, S., & Yagnik, A. (1995). Creating a nationality: The Ramajanmabhumi movement and fear of the self. New Delhi: Oxford University Press.

Newman, K. (1988). On openings and closings.Critical Studies in Mass Communication , 5 (September), 243-46.

Paddikal, S. (1993). Inventing modernity: The emergence of the novel in India. In T. Niranjana, P. Sudhir, & V. Dhareshwar (Eds.), Interrogating modernity: Culture and colonialism in India (pp. 220-241). Calcutta: Seagull Books.

Parameswaran, R. (1999). Western romance fiction as English-language media in postcolonial India. Journal of Communication, 49 (2), 84-105.

Porter, D. (1994). Orientalism and its problems. In P. Williams and L. Chrisman (Eds.), Colonial discourse and postcolonial theory (pp. 150-161). New York: Columbia University Press.

Press, A. (1986). New views in the mass production of women's culture. Communication Research, 13 (1), 139-149.

Press, A. (1991). Women watching television: Gender, class, and generation in the American televisual experience. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.

Radway, J. (1984). Reading the romance: Women, patriarchy, and popular literature. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press.

Rakow, L. (1989). Feminist studies: The next stage. Critical Studies in Mass Communication, 6 (June), 209-215.

Rajagopal, A. (1996). Mediating modernity: Theorizing reception in a non-Western society. The Communication Review, 1, 441-470.

Rege, S. (1995). The hegemonic appropriation of sexuality: The case of the lavani performers of Maharashtra. Contributions to Indian Sociology, 29 (1 & 2), 23-38.

Robertson, J. (1995). Mon Japon: The revue theater as a technology of Japanese imperialism. American Ethnologist 22 (4), 970-996.

Said, E. (1978). Orientalism. New York: Vintage Books.

Said, E. (1993). Culture and imperialism. New York: Knopf.

Schein, L. (1997). Gender and internal Orientalism in China. Modern China, 23 (1), 69-99.

Schein, L. (2000). Minority Rules: The Miao and the feminine in China's cultural politics. Durham, NC: Duke University Press.

Shome, R. (1996). Postcolonial interventions in the rhetorical canon: An "other" view. Communication Theory, 6, (1), 40-59.

Shome, R. (2000). Outing whiteness. Critical Studies in Mass Communication, 17 (3), 365-371.

Schudson, M. (1987). The new validation of popular culture: Sense and sentimentality in academia. Critical Studies in Mass Communication (4), 51-68.

Schwichtenberg, C. (1989). Feminist cultural studies. Critical Studies in Mass Communication, (June), 202-207.

Setalwad, T. (1996). The politics of the Sangh Parivar: Playing the Hindutva Card. Voices: A Journal on Communication for Development, 4 (3), 23-25.

Thurston, C. (1988). The romance revolution: Erotic novels for women and the quest for a new sexual identity. Illinois: University of Illinois Press.

Tomlinson, J. (1992). Cultural imperialism. Baltimore, MD: John Hopkins University Press.

Varma, P. (1998). The great Indian middle-class. New Delhi, India: Viking Penguin India.

Venkatachalapathy, A. R. (1997). Domesticating the novel: Society and culture in inter-war Tamil Nadu. The Indian Economic and Social History Review, 34 (1), 53-67.

Viswanathan, G. (1989). Masks of conquest: Literary study and Britsh rule in India. New York: Columbia University Press.

RADHIKA PARAMESWARAN